Reg. No. 1—M.

THE FORT ST. GEORGE GAZETTE.

No. 28.] MADRAS, TUESDAY EVENING, NOVEMBER 9, 1920. [PRICE, 4 as. 9 p.

Part IV.—Proceedings of the Madras Legislature.

CONTENTS.

	PAGE
Proceedings of an Adjourned Meeting of the Council of the Governor of Fort St. George assembled for the purpose of making Laws and Regulations on Thursday, the 15th day of July 1920	1407
Proceedings of an Adjourned Meeting of the Council of the Governor of Fort St. George assembled for the purpose of making Laws and Regulations on Friday, the 16th day of July 1920	1449

Proceedings of an adjourned Meeting of the Council of the Governor of Fort St. George assembled for the purpose of making Laws and Regulations under the provisions of the Act of Parliament, 5 & 6 Geo. V, Ch. 61.

The Council reassembled at the Senate House, Chepauk, at 11 a.m. on Thursday, the 15th day of July 1920.

PRESENT:

The Hon'ble Diwan Bahadur Sir P. RAJAGOPALA ACHARIYAR Avargal, K.C.S.I., C.I.E., Vice-President—*Presiding*.
The Hon'ble Mr. L. DAVIDSON, C.S.I.
The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. TODHUNTER, C.S.I.
The Hon'ble Mr. A. Y. G. CAMPBELL, C.I.E.
The Hon'ble Mr. S. COX.
The Hon'ble Major-General G. G. GIFFARD, C.S.I., I.M.S.
The Hon'ble Mr. R. A. GRAHAM.
The Hon'ble Mr. W. J. J. HOWLEY, C.S.I.
The Hon'ble Mr. R. LITTLEHAILES.
The Hon'ble Mr. E. S. LLOYD.
The Hon'ble Diwan Bahadur L. D. SWAMIKANNU PILLAI Avargal, I.S.O.
The Hon'ble Mr. K. SRINIVASA AYYANGAR (*Advocate-General*).
The Hon'ble Diwan Bahadur Sir P. TYAGARAYA CHETTI Garu, *Kt.*
The Hon'ble the Rev. E. M. MACPHAIL, C.B.E.
The Hon'ble Mr. C. V. S. NARASIMHA RAJU.
The Hon'ble Mr. K. VENKATAPPAYYA PANTULU.
The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur T. BALAJI RAO NAYUDU Garu.
The Hon'ble Mr. P. SIVA RAO.
The Hon'ble Mr. W. VIJAYARAGHAVA MUDALIYAR.
The Hon'ble Mr. B. V. NARASIMHA AYYAR.
The Hon'ble Mr. V. MADHAVA RAJA, Elaya Nambidi of Kollengode.
The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur V. K. RAMANUJA ACHARIYAR Avargal.
The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur T. N. SIVAGNANAM PILLAI Avargal.

The Hon'ble Sri RAJA RAO VENKATA KUMARA MAHIPATI SURYA RAO Bahadur, Raja of Pithāpuram.
The Hon'ble B. RAJA RAJESWARA SETUPATI alias MUTTURAMALINGA SETUPATI Avargal, Raja of Ramnad.
The Hon'ble Mr. B. VENKATAPATI RAJU.
The Hon'ble Mr. T. R. RAMACHANDRA AYYAR.
The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur HAJI ABD-UL-LAH HAJI QASIM SAHIB Bahadur.
The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur A. T. G. M. AHMAD TAMBI MARAKKAYAR SAHIB Bahadur.
The Hon'ble Mr. J. H. THONGER.
The Hon'ble Mr. T. ARUMAINATHA PILLAI.
The Hon'ble Mr. M. C. RAJA.
The Hon'ble Diwan Bahadur T. DESIKA ACHARIYAR Avargal.
The Hon'ble Mr. M. D. DEVADOSS.
The Hon'ble Mr. H. H. G. MITCHELL, O.B.E.
The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur N. MUHAMMAD USMAN SAHIB Bahadur.
The Hon'ble Rao Sahib M. C. MUTTAYYA CHETTIYAR Avargal.
The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur T. NAMBERUMAL CHETTI Garu.
The Hon'ble Raja Sri KRISHNA CHANDRA GAJAPATI NARAYANA DEO Garu, Zamindar of Parlākimedi.
The Hon'ble Mr. T. RICHMOND.
The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur N. SUBBA RAO Avargal.

In the absence of His Excellency the President, the Hon'ble Diwan Bahadur Sir P. Rajagopala Achariyar Avargal, K.C.S.I., C.I.E., Vice-President, presided.

The Hon'ble the VICE-PRESIDENT:—" The Council will now resume consideration of the resolutions on matters of general public interest."

RESOLUTION *RE* LEVEL-CROSSING GATE SOUTH OF THE TINNEVELLY BRIDGE STATION.

The following resolution stood in the name of the Hon'ble Rai Bahadur T. N. Sivagnanam Pillai Avargal :—

" V. This Council recommends to His Excellency the Governor in Council that necessary steps be taken to have the level-crossing gate south of the Tinnevelly Bridge station closed against the road only for the passage of running trains to and from the station and that all shunting be done on the northern side of the station and none on the southern side as at present."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur T. N. SIVAGNANAM PILLAI :—" The resolution I propose to move is connected with the constant and long continued closing of the level-crossing gate at the Tinnevelly Bridge station. The town of Tinnevelly and the populous trading centre of Petta lie to the west, while to the east lie the important town of Palamcottah, the congested villages headed by Viraraghavapuram, the public offices at Kokkarakulam and the Hindu College. Connecting these two groups there is only one public road. The traffic on that road is very considerable, so much so that the police have thought it necessary to station half a dozen constables right across the centre at the most congested portion which extends to about a furlong or a furlong and a half. Across this road and across this congested portion, a level-crossing has been established. This level-crossing is about 100 feet from the first facing point and 200 feet from the southern end of the platform. In consequence of this arrangement, it may be expected that the level-crossing gate has to be closed constantly even if it happens to be an ordinary station. But Tinnevelly Bridge station happens to be a very important station. There are eight passenger trains leaving every day and eight passenger trains are arriving. In addition to the passenger trains there are a number of goods trains and all these goods trains, I may mention for the information of the Honourable Members, are formed at Tinnevelly Bridge. That necessitates a lot of shunting. In consequence of this shunting which goes on very frequently and on most occasions for continuously long periods, cars, carts and people who have to use the roads are detained on either side for a long time. I have felt the inconvenience myself on many occasions and every one who has visited Tinnevelly even casually should have felt the same inconvenience. All are agreed that this continued nuisance ought to be put a stop to. With this view I thought over the matter and proposed a scheme by which all the shunting could be done on the northern side of the railway station instead of on the south. I demonstrated to the people as well as to my railway friends that the scheme I proposed was perfectly workable. And I wrote to the agent asking for an interview. He said that he would meet me on the 4th of December at Tinnevelly, but his communication reached me only on the 4th at a place called Kulittalai where I had gone on some business. I again wrote to the agent that the letter reached me only on the 4th December and that I was not therefore able to be present and I requested him to fix another date. He promised to do so, but although it is seven months since I wrote that communication to him he has not written to me anything about it yet. It is only under such stress of circumstances that I have brought this matter before the Council. The inconvenience

being real and one which causes very great trouble to the local inhabitants, I request this Council to take necessary steps to have the level-crossing gate south of the Tinnevelly Bridge station closed against the road only for the passage of running trains to and from the station and to have all shunting done on the northern side of the station and none on the southern side as at present. It is a perfectly feasible arrangement and I do not know why it has not been put into practice. With the help of the Government the people expect their grievance to be redressed."

The Hon'ble Mr. B. V. NARASIMHA AYYAR:—"Mr. President, I second this resolution with great pleasure. The honourable mover's suggestion has been eminently practical. He has pointed out how the grievance could be redressed, I am told, in point of fact, that the railway authorities are just carrying it out and keeping most of the shunting in the northern side of the station. If steps are taken by Government, I am quite sure the inconvenience to the public would be easily avoided."

The Hon'ble Mr. M. D. DEVADOSS:—"Sir, I can certainly give my own personal experience of what the honourable mover has said. When I was in Tinnevelly I found very great difficulty at times in crossing this place. Sometimes I had to wait 10 to 15 minutes, because shunting operations were going on. And I think the two Honourable Members of this Council to your left, Sir, will bear testimony to the fact that most of the public offices are situated on either side of this level crossing. The District Court, the Collector's office and the Munsif's Courts are situated on the eastern side of this level-crossing, whereas on the western side there are the Taluk office and several other offices. There is a very heavy traffic on this road. Of course we cannot complain when the level-crossing is closed for the purpose of passing trains. But when they go on performing shunting operations for a considerable time, much inconvenience is caused to the public and we have a real grievance. The matter could be very easily adjusted. The platform might be extended to the north. The trains that come from the northern side or from Madras could certainly be drawn up on that platform and the shunting might be done on the siding without coming into the level-crossing. What is done at present is that the trains that arrive from Madras or from the north are made to come almost up to the end of the platform and sometimes some of the carriages are drawn up away from the platform and necessarily some shunting has to be done. I have myself suffered from this inconvenience and have had to wait more than 10 minutes—I should not be wrong if I say even 15 minutes, on occasions—especially when I had to argue a case before some courts. Therefore I submit that Government should certainly recommend to the railway authorities the necessity of relieving this state of affairs by making the shunting operations to be performed on the northern side of the station or by extending the platform."

The Hon'ble Mr. L. DAVIDSON:—"Sir, I fancy that the Hon'ble Mr. Narasimha Ayyar may have put his finger on the spot. He suggested that revised arrangements had recently been brought into force, possibly in consequence of the notice of this resolution. Whether that conjecture is correct or not, I am not in a position to say precisely, but a copy of the resolution was referred to the agent of the South Indian Railway for remarks and on the 3rd of July he sent a reply in the following terms:—'I have the honour to inform you that all shunting is done at the northern end of the station yard—the gates being closed only for the passage of trains—and the staff are instructed on these occasions to keep the gates closed only so long as is absolutely necessary.'

"Now I think the natural interpretation of that reply is to the effect that the arrangements advocated by the honourable mover, his seconder and the Hon'ble Mr. Devadoss were in force on the 3rd July or were at least reported to the agent to be in force on that date. In other words, the instructions are all that is desired, but whether their practical application is as satisfactory is another question. It is possible that the local railway staff do not invariably obey their orders but even now occasionally permit shunting to be done on the southern side of the station. It is more possible that the subordinate servants charged with the duty of opening and shunting the level-crossing gates suit their own convenience more than that of the general public. If so, the practical remedy, as it seems to me, is for any one who is put to inconvenience at once to bring the fact to the notice of the station-master giving precise details as to time. If he finds the station-master does not take preventive action in consequence of his representation, his obvious course would be to bring the station-master's neglect to the notice of the agent; and knowing Mr. Scott, as I do, I think I may safely say that any representation of that sort would receive due consideration at his hands. It seems to me, Sir, in these circumstances that all that it is incumbent upon the Government to do is to bring the report of the proceedings of this Council to-day to the notice of the agent. That we are fully prepared to do."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur T. N. SIVAGNANAM PILLAI:—"I have no objection to the course suggested by the Hon'ble Mr. Davidson."

The Hon'ble the VICE-PRESIDENT:—"May I take it that the honurable mover withdraws the resolution?"

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur T. N. SIVAGNANAM PILLAI:—"My point is satisfied."

The resolution was by leave withdrawn.

RESOLUTION *RE* SUPPLIES OF MEDICAL STORES TO LOCAL BODIES.

The Hon'ble Mr. V. MADHAVA RAJA :—" Sir, the resolution that I have the honour to move runs as follows :—

'VI. This Council recommends to the Governor in Council that the Government of India be moved to revise the provision in the Civil Account Code so as to enable local bodies to obtain their supplies of medical stores from the Medical Store Depots at the same rates as those charged for Government and charitable institutions.'

" This is a very simple resolution. I do not want to weary the Council with a long speech. I simply want to bring two or three points to the notice of this Council. The Government Medical Store Depots charge three different rates to the medical institutions : to the Military Department one rate, to the Government and charitable institutions another rate and a third rate to all non-Government and private bodies. Unfortunately local board and municipal institutions are classed in the third. Article 1225 of the Civil Account Code says :—

" The debits of the Military Department for Medical Stores supplied to Provincial Governments, Civil departments, and charitable dispensaries will, for European stores, be at stock-book rates, plus exchange, plus 10 per cent on the sum of the above two items. For stores locally purchased stock-book rates only plus 10 per cent will be charged. For manufactured stores stock-book rates, plus 8 per cent (for interest on outlay subject to revision from time to time when necessary), plus 10 per cent on the sum of the above two items will be charged. In all cases the cost of transit from the place of issue must be paid by the receiving department."

Article 1227 says :—

" For European Medical Stores supplied to Municipalities, Native States, and private individuals, the charge will be stock-book rates, plus exchange, plus 20 per cent on the sum of the above two items. For local stores the charge will be stock-book rates, plus 20 per cent. In both cases the cost of transit from the place of issue must be paid."

" According to the rules I find only 10 per cent increase to Government and charitable institutions and 20 per cent increase to other bodies but according to price list it is quite different. I find in the price list for No. 203 *Oleum Jumperi* Rs. 41 for the Military Department, Rs. 49 for Government and charitable institutions and Rs. 57 for non-Government, that is, local bodies and municipalities. Again for article No. 214 *opium*, Rs. 4-12-0 is charged for the Military Department, Rs. 5-12-0 for Government and charitable institutions and Rs. 31 for local board and municipal institutions. Again for medicine No. 283 *santoninum*, Rs. 120 is charged for the Military Department, Rs. 140 for Government and charitable institutions and Rs. 160 for local boards. I do not want to give a list of figures. I have specifically mentioned two or three articles to show to the Council that the rates vary in the case of different medical institutions. All these things range between 12 and 16 per cent ; that is about the price. I cannot understand why the local board and municipal institutions are classed in the third grade. They are quasi-Government institutions and also charitable institutions. All the hospitals are staffed by medical men who are Government servants and the Government give substantial grants. Appointments and transfers of the officers are done by Government only. Local boards have nothing to do with the transfer of medical officers from one district to another. So local board institutions should be classified in the list of Government institutions or as charitable institutions as they do not charge any fee for the poor persons. If this Government has no power it should recommend to the Imperial Government to modify these rules so as to classify local board institutions and municipal institutions along with Government and charitable institutions. Local boards and municipalities are all asked to buy medicines from the Medical Stores. At the same time they are charged at higher prices than their regular rates. I think it is very hard and if the Government will not change the rules, the only possible remedy is to allow local boards to buy medicines anywhere else."

The Hon'ble Mr. B. VENKATAPATI RAJU :—" I take great pleasure in seconding the resolution of the Hon'ble Mr. Madhava Raja. I do not see any principle in making any distinction between the Government and local bodies. Local bodies are limbs of the Government themselves. The property of the municipality is the property of Government handed over to them to work out on behalf of Government, and so I do not think that Government should treat this with any stepmotherly interest. When the Government suggests or recommends or insists that we should go to Medical Stores for the purchase of medicines, I think the municipalities should be placed on an equal footing with the Government. If the Local Government applies to the Imperial Government, I am sure the Imperial Government would accede to the request of the Hon'ble Mr. Madhava Raja ".

The Hon'ble the SURGEON-GENERAL :—" Mr. President, this is a matter in which I have no very great technical knowledge. I referred the matter to the Medical Storekeeper to Government who has written this to me : ' All matters of purchase of stores and issues are beyond his province and beyond the province of the Local Government, being settled by the Controller of Military Accounts under the orders of the Government of India '. So that it is really a matter which I am unable to explain to this Council because I do not know the facts. But, in a way I am able to put a few facts before the Council to throw light upon the reasons for the differentiation in prices. I think I may say at once that the contention of one Honourable Member here that ' a local body is the same as Government ' will hardly bear examination. The Government prices are quoted in the price list so that the recovery may be made easily by book

adjustment. The Government supply storekeepers, store buildings, and the manufacturing staff and as far as I know they never show their accounts. So what you are paying is not the actual price of an article as you can buy in the Chemists' shop, but it is what the Government choses to charge itself for what it supplies to these institutions. It is really a fictitious arrangement of book adjustments just in the same way as telegraphs and other activities of Government.

"The other contention is that it is not fair to make the local body pay 20 or 25 per cent more than the charitable institutions of the Government. That is a matter in which I really cannot tell you what the reasons behind these price lists may be. But I can tell you a few facts about it. The first one, I believe, is that Chemists' shops have to set aside a very large depreciation for drugs, and I know that some of the best Chemists' shops have recognized that they will have a loss of 50 per cent on the actual goods in the shop, that the drugs are so perishable and so easily become worthless, that they have to set a large sum of money for deterioration of goods. Now if you deal with Government, all that loss goes to Government. If you get unsound drugs, you send them back and you don't pay for them. If you get them from a Chemists' shop, they would certainly not take back from you the drugs which are not sound. That is one reason why Government charges a higher price. Another thing is this. They test every drug, they guarantee the purity and they put the drugs in bottles securely packed that if they get missed, they could easily be recognized in the bazaar. I do not say I am here to defend the price list. But I do say this, that if you contract out as is suggested by the mover and buy in the open market, you will certainly have to buy at a higher price and get only inferior articles, *during the war you would have got absolutely none at all.* I do not therefore know whether Government proposes to accept this resolution ; but I think that it would be very unwise to press this, because this particular province has no more grievance than the others, assuming that it is a grievance as you get very good value for your money."

The Hon'ble Mr. C. V. S. NARASIMHA RAJU :—"I am glad the Hon'ble Mr. Madhava Raja has brought forward this resolution. The principle that Government servants should not receive any remuneration for services rendered to local bodies has been well discussed by the Decentralization Commission and they have recommended that no charges should be levied on account of services rendered by Government servants to local bodies, and this principle has been accepted by the Government of India Resolution of 1915. In pursuance of that accepted principle, the levy of audit charges and others are dispensed with and local bodies are no longer required to contribute for the services rendered to them by Government servants. I believe, on the same principle, the Government of India will have no objection to consider the question favourably if this Government accepts this resolution and forwards it for the consideration of the Government of India. I do not see any reason why separate charges should be levied for medical stores supplied to Government hospitals and those supplied to dispensaries maintained by local bodies. I think the Government will see their way to accept the resolution and press it strongly for the attention of the Government of India."

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur N. SUBBA RAO :—"I have heard what the Surgeon-General has to say. I have no hesitation to say that he has not made out a good case for the Government not to accept this proposition. Generally, these resolutions are simple recommendations to Government and if the Government should find that they should order some more investigations or make some representation to the Government of India, the Government of Madras should be pleased to do so. I view this resolution also from the business point of view. We are thankful to Government for taking up this duty of supplying the local bodies with medicine and it is a very good arrangement, because we get the articles at proportionately cheap rates. But we are concerned, Sir, with the fact that we should not be treated differently from Government institutions. We do not mind paying a little extra cost to cover up any loss.

"So, I submit, Sir, that this is a very fit case in which the Government may accept this resolution, and if they are satisfied that there is something that could be pressed home to the Government of India and the whole question may be opened, I submit there can be no more fitter case than this to be taken up by this Government."

The Hon'ble Mr. P. SIVA RAO :—"I heartily support the proposal of the Hon'ble Mr. Madhava Raja. One of the difficulties mentioned by the Hon'ble the Surgeon-General was that this matter was outside the province of the Local Government. That does not appear to my mind an insuperable objection. We can make a representation to the Government of India in the matter, if it really lies entirely within their province. The other theory which was warmly refuted by the Surgeon-General is that the Local Government and the local bodies are quite identical in this respect. I do not join issue with him in this matter. All that I contend for is that the same cheap rate that prevails in favour of the Government may be extended to local bodies also. He seems to suggest that it is an open market and the accounts of the municipality are separately kept ; it is not a joint account and Government could charge as much as they liked. In other words he took the liberty on behalf of the Government to profiteer, but the Hon'ble the Surgeon-General will bear in mind that we are performing to the best of our ability the duty under the statute of dispensing medical relief free and we want as much help as possible in this direction. Honourable Members of the Council are aware of the hopelessly scanty nature of the municipal resources. Any proposal made by any Honourable Member towards effecting some relief would be most welcome. Sir, I need not dilate this matter further, and wherever you can possibly effect any economy it will be of great help to us. We are doing a public duty. The State is undertaking a portion of the the work of affording medical relief. It is providing for headquarter hospitals and we provide for dispensaries in rural

areas. The principle is the same, and the favourable conditions which hold good for the Government must also hold good in the case of local bodies as well. As for the quality of the articles, we are getting the best kinds from the Medical Stores. I am not one of those who ask for a change in this arrangement, but let us get the articles as cheap as possible, so that we can do our business better."

The Hon'ble Diwan Bahadur T. DESIKA ACHARIYAR :—" I quite follow the argument of the Hon'ble the Surgeon-General with reference to the practice that is now prevailing. But what the Hon'ble Mr. Madhava Raja and the other honourable gentlemen who have supported him wish to point out—a wish in which I also share— is that there is absolutely no necessity to make any distinction on principle between the needs of dispensaries managed by local bodies and those of institutions which are under Government control. I do not quite understand where the distinction lies. Both the local bodies and the Government are working for the same purpose ; and if local bodies and the Government are doing the same work in two compartments there is no reason why Government institutions should be treated with greater consideration than those managed by local bodies. It is true that local bodies have their own funds, but that does not at all lead to the conclusion that any effort that is made by the local bodies in doing the work, which legitimately ought to be done by the Government itself, should be treated with any differentiation in the matter of the supply of medical stores. It may be that the losses which may result in the deterioration of medical stores have to be borne by the Government In a matter like the administration of medical affairs of the whole presidency where the work, which on principle must fall upon the Government, is undertaken by local bodies, such losses need not be in the way of the same treatment being given to institutions managed by local bodies as what is accorded to institutions under Government management. What I do not understand is the principle of the differential treatment. Elementary education and medical relief must be considered as national concerns. To foster these, Government must give the local and municipal bodies as much help as possible. If that be the correct view—and I submit it is—I do not understand why dispensaries managed by local bodies should be treated differently from institutions managed by the Government itself On principle, I hope the resolution of the Hon'ble Mr. Madhava Raja will be accepted by the Government".

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur V. K. RAMANUJA ACHARIYAR :—"I associate myself with all the remarks that have fallen from my Hon'ble friend Mr. Desika Achariyar. I do not understand why any fictitious value should be placed upon purchases made by Government. What should be done is that Government should find out the value of the articles, allow for depreciation and fix rates. Those rates should be paid by the Government and by the local bodies. Nor do I understand the distinction between Government and local bodies. This is amatter in which local bodies and Government are interested, and Government are giving us large sums of money for medical relief. They have taken charge of headquarter hospitals. Because the portion of the work which ought to be done by the Government is done by local bodies, it is no reason why any differentiation should be made in the rates charged to Government and the rates charged to local bodies. I therefore give my full support to this resolution. If Government will not accept this resolution and will continue to charge differential rates, I think local bodies should be allowed to purchase wherever they can get these articles cheaper than at the Medical Stores. I am not certain that the Medical Stores Department treats local bodies with any consideration. I remember several cases in which local bodies ordered articles from the Medical Stores on hard terms and the latter compelled the local bodies to pay even for broken bottles".

The Hon'ble Mr. V. MADHAVA RAJA :—" The Hon'ble the Surgeon-General said that we are getting medicines cheaper than the local rates. I do not want that question. The only thing that I want to ask is 'are not the institutions managed by local bodies, charitable institutions and if so why should there be any difference in the treatment ?' He himself admitted that the local bodies are doing their best to afford medical relief. If such charitable institutions are treated in a different manner it is very hard really. The Surgeon-General himself said that he cannot find any difference that is why Government should accept my resolution. I request Government will consider this matter favourably and accept my resolution and ask the Government of India to amend the Act."

The Hon'ble the SURGEON-GENERAL :—" Mr. President, I only want to make one point clear. The Medical Stores Department is under the Government of India, Military. It is an Army Department run by the Army and they price drugs for themselves, I suppose, on the price they pay for them, and also make a book adjustment. They sell to Government civil institutions at a price and also make a book adjustment. When they sell to local bodies it is impossible to have a book adjustment because local bodies have a different purse. Therefore they put on in price what cannot be paid by book adjustments. Whereas in the other two cases the price is paid partly in cash and partly by book adjustment.

"The Government have now authorized me to say that a copy of this debate will be sent to the Government of India where the matter will be thrashed out. In these circumstances I do not know whether the Honourable Member would wish to press the resolution to a division or whether he will be satisfied with this assurance."

The Hon'ble Mr. B. V. NARASIMHA AYYAR :—" May I request the Government to strengthen their hands by taking votes ? "

15TH JULY 1920.] *(The Vice-President ; Mr. Madhava Raja ; Mr. Subba Rao ; Mr. Ramanuja Achariyar ; Mr. Narasimha Ayyar.)*

The Hon'ble the VICE-PRESIDENT :—" It will be for the honourable mover to say whether he would press for a division."

The Hon'ble Mr. V. MADHAVA RAJA :—" The Surgeon-General has not answered my question whether local institutions are not charitable institutions. That requires only plain answer."

The Hon'ble the VICE-PRESIDENT :—" I understand that the Hon'ble the Surgeon-General has been authorized on behalf of the Government to say that a copy of this debate will be sent up to the Government of India. Will that satisfy the honourable mover of the resolution or does he wish to take a division ? "

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur N. SUBBA RAO :—" If we have the further assurance of the Government that while addressing the Government of India, they will view this question favourably, I think the honourable mover may think of not pressing the resolution."

The Hon'ble the VICE-PRESIDENT :—" We are bound to do the best we can for our local bodies and I am sure the Surgeon-General is quite of that opinion. But the question is probably a little more complicated than one would imagine from the wording of the resolution put forward. I have no hesitation in assuring Honourable Members that we will certainly do what we can for our local bodies. Of course Honourable Members will have to see that this is just one of the resolutions which should have been moved in the Imperial Legislative Council, as it affects all provinces. So we are not in a position to say anything very definite or anything in the way of committal. But if the honourable mover wishes, I have no objection to take a division."

The Hon'ble Mr. V. MADHAVA RAJA :—" Will not the acceptance of the resolution strengthen the hands of Government ? My resolution is only a recommendation."

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur V. K. RAMANUJA ACHARIYAR :—" I am prepared to accept the suggestion of the Government. After their assurance I do not want to vote for the resolution as it stands. If I vote against it, it will mean that it has not got my approval. So I have got a real difficulty."

The Hon'ble Mr. B. V. NARASIMHA AYYAR :—" If we had known that it was the intention to send a copy of this debate to the Government of India, many of us would have spoken and at great length. But some of us reserved our criticism, thinking that we could express our opinion by votes. If no division is taken, we wish to speak."

The Hon'ble the VICE-PRESIDENT :—" There is no harm in the matter being put to vote."

A poll was taken with the following result :—

For

The Hon'ble Diwan Bahadur T. Desika Achariyar Avargal.
,, Mr. Venkatappayya Pantulu.
,, Mr. P. Siva Rao.
,, Mr. T. Arumainatha Pillai.
,, Mr. M. C. Raja.
,, Mr. M. D. Devadoss.
,, Mr. T. Richmond.
,, Mr. B. Venkatapati Raju.
,, the Rev. E. M. Macphail, C.B.E.
,, Mr. W. Vijayaraghava Mudaliyar.
,, Mr. V. Madhava Raja.
,, Rao Bahadur T. Balaji Rao Nayudu Garu.
,, the Raja of Pithāpuram.
,, the Raja of Ramnad.
,, the Zamindar of Parlakimedi.
,, Mr. C. V. S. Narasimha Raju.
,, Diwan Bahadur Sir P. Tyagaraya Chetti Garu.
,, Mr. B. V. Narasimha Ayyar.
,, Rao Bahadur N. Subba Rao Avargal.
,, Rai Bahadur T. N. Sivagnanam Pillai Avargal.
,, Khan Bahadur A. T. G. M. Ahmad Tambi Marakkayar Sahib Bahadur.
,, Khan Bahadur Haji Abd-ul-lah Haji Qasim Sahib Bahadur.

Against

The Hon'ble Mr. L. Davidson, C.S.I.
,, Mr. C. G. Todhunter, C.S.I.
,, Mr. R. A. Graham.
,, the Surgeon-General.
,, Mr. R. Littlehailes.
,, Diwan Bahadur L. D. Swamikannu Pillai Avargal, I.S.O.
,, Mr. E. S. Lloyd.
,, Mr. W. J. J. Howley, C.S.I.

The resolution was carried, twenty-two voting *for* and eight voting *against*.

RESOLUTION *RE* RELIGIOUS DISTURBANCES AT MUTTUPET.

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur A. T. G. M. AHMAD TAMBI MARAKKAYAR SAHIB Bahadur moved the following resolution :—

" VII. This Council recommends to His Excellency the Governor in Council that necessary inquiries be made regarding the recent riot and looting by some Hindus at Muttupet while a Hindu marriage procession was passing in front of a Muhammadan mosque."

In doing so, he said :—" It is indeed painful to me that I have to bring forward resolutions of this kind frequently especially, at the juncture, when the relationship between the two great communities are becoming more and more intimate day by day. But this is a matter of such vital importance and affects very much the religious susceptibilities of my community that I feel bound to bring the same before the Council for taking suitable steps so as to avoid any friction at least in the future. Instances such as these do indeed happen in some places, that in the interest of law and order and the peaceful progress of the province suitable steps are to be taken to avoid the recurrence of such unfortunate incidents. I am fully alive to the fact that Government is not unmindful of this, and the very fact that they were good enough to accept my resolution moved in November last in the amended form to appoint a committee consisting of non-official representatives of both communities to study the question thoroughly in all its aspects and recommend such suitable legislative and executive actions as they may deem just and proper to avoid any such unfortunate incidents in future is proof positive of the same. It is indeed some months since the committee was appointed, but it was only on th 12th instant that the committee sat for the first time, the delay probably due in securing all the references necessary to frame a suitable programme of work in connexion therewith. This is by the way and I hope that at least through the exertions of this committee amicable relationship would be brought about between these two great sister communities by a reciprocity of a policy of give and take by both of them. To revert to the subject proper the original resolution sent by me referred also to a most important event that had occurred during this disturbance, ' and thereby causing the death of a Muhammadan who was thrown in the mosque tank,' but the same was unfortunately deleted from the resolution under rule 4 (*c*) of the rules of the procedure of the Council. After all a poor Muhammadan soul has unfortunately been victimised, the real culprit remaining so far scot free. And the investigation made by the police is not of such a character as to restore confidence in the minds of the Muhammadans who are greatly disturbed over this incident as will be evident from the facts I shall place presently before the Council. The first news of the occurrence reached me on the 3rd May last through a telegram sent me by a Muthavalli of a mosque at Muttupet in Tanjore district which runs thus :—

' Yesterday night Hindus made quarrel and beat those attending mosque violated sanctity broken new Pallivasal. Please start to-day without fail.' Immediately on receipt of this telegram I forwarded it to the Deputy Superintendent of Police, Negapatam, having jurisdiction over the place of occurrence to take immediate action in the matter. Subsequently I got another telegram from the same source intimating ' dead body of missing man found floating Patrakulam removed corpse waiting your presence.'

" The Deputy Superintendent of Police, Negapatam, immediately on receipt of my telegram seems to have proceeded to the scene of offence and made inquiries. I also proceeded to the place and made inquiries in conjunction with the police authorities and as a result of this I learnt that the disturbance took place on account of a Hindu marriage procession passing through the mosque with music, etc. This is not the first occasion that a procession was taken in front of the mosque for the Hindus to plead any ignorance. As a matter of fact a similar incident took place in the year 1916 and the Subdivisional Magistrate, Mannargudi, has strictly issued an injunction that no procession should be taken in front of the mosque beating tom tom and playing music. The injunction seems to have had no effect on the Hindus and the fruit of it we now have in the unfortunate incident before the Council. I brought this matter also to the notice of the Superintendent of Police, Tanjore, through a letter wherein I referred to the grievous wrong done by the Hindus in not only committing vandalism and sacrilage in the mosque but also in murdering a Muhammadan and throwing the dead body in the tank. The District Superintendent of Police, it appears, forwarded the same to the Deputy Superintendent of Police for report and on receipt of his reply sent the same in original to me for perusal and return along with a covering letter stating that ' he was issuing orders that no procession should in future be taken past the mosque with the beat of tom tom and play of music between 12-30 p.m. and 10 p.m. and 4-30 a.m. and 6-30 a.m.' It is all well for the District Superintendent of Police to repeat the order originally passed by the Deputy Magistrate, Mannargudi, but the original order seems to have had no salutary effect on the Hindus, for if otherwise they would not have taken the procession at all along the mosque. The Deputy Superintendent's reply is most painful reading and shows clearly that neither the police investigation was successful nor was it impartial as it should have been. He has not only stated ' that the murder committed by the Hindus could not be traced ', but also is not willing to exonerate the Muhammadans from all blame in the matter. He says that some of them at least knew that there was a likelihood of trouble if the final procession were to pass with music and as law-abiding people they ought to have addressed the authorities when they found that the Tamilians had on 29th April 1920 violated the Subdivisional Magistrate's order regarding the beating of tom tom near the mosque. There is the specific order of the Subdivisional Magistrate that no procession ought to pass through the mosque with the beat of tom toms and as law-abiding people they

15TH JULY 1920.] (*Mr. Ahmad Tambi Marakkayar; the Raja of Ramnad; Mr. Ramanuja Achariyar; Sir Tyagaraya Chetti.*)

would naturally have only expected the other side to be law-abiding. He ascribes 'the defiling of the mosque as a direct consequence of the rowdy Muhammadans having set fire to a Hindu house.' I am sorry I am unable to accept this statement of the Deputy Superintendent of Police. I am inclined to think that incendiarism was committed by the Hindus themselves to throw the blame on the Muhammadans. I have myself inspected the house alleged to have been set on fire along with the police officials. The house is situated in the midst of the Hindu street immediately next to the storeyed house where the marriage ceremony had taken place that night in a house of a wealthy and influential Hindu gentleman. A large number of Hindus were attending a dance party there and the whole street was lit with a number of bright gas lights. It is hardly conceivable therefore that any Muhammadan would have dared to commit such offence when a large number of Hindus were present. What motive could they possibly have had for such an action? If, as alleged by the Deputy Superintendent of Police, the house was set on fire by the Muhammadans intentionally, it would have been of such a nature as to cause considerable loss. The very fact that fire was set in a corner and that the portion burnt was not of any material value is itself sufficient to show that the action was not committed by any Muhammadan at all. It only goes to strengthen my contention that the Hindus themselves had committed it to shift the responsibility on the Muhammadans. Further, the high compliments paid by the Deputy Superintendent of Police to one Mr. Chokklingham Pillai, Sub-Inspector of Muttupet, is most unwarranted and uncalled for. From my personal inquiries I was able to gather that the Sub-Inspector was at the bottom of the whole mischief, that he abetted the action of the Hindus and that he was responsible for opening fire. He would not possibly be unaware of the order issued by the Deputy Magistrate, Mannargudi, and the Hindus resolve to take the procession through in violation of it. If he had been impartial and taken the right course and advised Hindus not to do anything in violation of the injunction order, there would have been no trouble at all. However much the Deputy Superintendent of Police might have complimented the Sub-Inspector of Police, the very fact that he has been transferred from the station lends colour to the view taken by me that he had not been either wholly impartial or free from blame in the matter. There had been no subsequent trouble at all after I visited Muttupet and advised both parties.

"From the above facts it is clear that the Police authorities had not been as impartial as they are expected to be, and that they have tried their best to shift the blame on the wrong side. The poor Muhammadan had been unfortunately victimised and the sacrilege in the Mosque has wounded the religious feelings of the Muhammadan community considerably, but neither the root cause of the trouble nor the real culprits have been traced. It is therefore in the interest of law and justice highly essential that an impartial inquiry should take place, and I therefore appeal to the Governor in Council to kindly order inquiry into the whole affair.

"With these words I commend the resolution to the acceptance of the Council."

The Hon'ble the RAJA OF RAMNAD:—"I rise to second this resolution, not because I court an inquiry, for that must happen irrespective of the acceptance of this resolution, but I have certain doubts regarding the work of the committee appointed by the Government recently. In G.O. No. 987, dated 13th March 1920, the Government have ordered that the committee should examine the history of Hindu-Muhammadan troubles in a dozen or more serious cases and note how the troubles arose and what steps might be taken to prevent them. That is contained in the earlier part of the order, but in the concluding portion of the order it is observed that the Government consider that the committee's activities should be confined to a general investigation and that they should not assume the shape of a conciliation board. Difference of opinion arose among the members of this committee in one of their recent meetings and some thought that they ought to inquire into the causes of the recent ryots of a serious character, while others thought that such an inquiry was beyond the terms of reference. I sought to clear this doubt by sending an interpellation, but it was not admitted on the ground of being too late. It will be helpful to the working of the committee if the Honourable Member for the Government before he replies to the particular resolution, will enlighten us as to what the real intention was. With these few words I second this resolution."

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur Mr. V. K. RAMANUJA ACHARIYAR:—"Mr. President, I oppose this resolution, which asks this Council to recommend to His Excellency the Governor in Council that inquiries should be made. Inquiries will certainly be made by the district authorities. I do not think we should come to this Council with a resolution to make these inquiries. It is the duty of the District Magistrate and the Police Department to make inquiries. The Hon'ble Mr. Marakkayar has been freely commenting on the conduct of public officers. I strongly deprecate such a procedure. The inquiries have not been made and orders have not been passed. That he should stand up in the Council and say that the conduct of this man is unsatisfactory, and that the Sub-Inspector is at the bottom of the whole trouble is very objectionable. He makes it appear that the rioting and looting were all on the side of the Hindus. I have information to show that the Muhammadans entered the marriage pandal and burnt it. The burning of a marriage pandal is a very serious matter. I therefore deprecate the acceptance of this resolution. The inquiry should be made by the district authorities and punishments should be awarded to those to whom punishment is due. I do not think that in a matter like this a committee of experienced men can do anything. There are extremists on each side and the only way to preserve the peace is to bring condign punishment on those who break the law."

The Hon'ble Diwan Bahadur Sir P. TYAGARAYA CHETTI:—"Mr. President, it seems to me that a very difficult matter is placed before the Council to-day and on one side very serious allegations have been made. My Hon'ble friend Mr. Ramanuja Achariyar seems to be

of opinion that this is a matter that should be dropped and that this Council need not pass this resolution. It seems to me that when such serious charges have been made against officials and against a class it is but right that the Government should wake up and appoint a committee to go into the matter and find out the exact position and see that justice is rendered to any party that was badly treated. I suppose that a high-paid official was appointed the other day in the case of the Nellore riot and it would have been well if the report had been published, but however, it was not done. I think it is better in such cases if any reports from the inquiries made are published, so that the public may come to know what these things are, and I think in this matter, especially when serious charges are made against officials, it is but right that the Government should appoint a committee of both officials and non-officials to go into the matter fully and report."

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur N. SUBBA RAO :—" I endorse the remarks of Sir P. Tyagaraya Chettiyar and I have also great pleasure in supporting the resolution, because I am one of those who think that the relationship between the two great communities must be bettered and placed on an amicable and satisfactory condition, because it is such kind of things that rake up animosity between these two communities and it is the duty of the Government to see that such things do not recur as far as possible in this Presidency. No doubt the Government was good enough to accept the resolution that was recently moved and have appointed a committee to inquire generally into such matters, but I am also of opinion that in the first instance, such inquiries should be made by the district officers concerned. But this is an exceptional case from the circumstances which we have heard from the Hon'ble Mr. Marakkayar. Mr. Marakkayar is a well known personage in the south and is a gentleman who knows what he speaks and I am sure he will support his facts by evidence. So when such a highly placed representative of the people makes such allegations it is but proper that if the inquiry that has already been made by the district officers has not satisfied a certain section of the population, I think it is the duty of the Government to appoint an official and a non-official to assist him in investigating the matter. I should think this is eminently a case in which such a course should be taken by the Government."

The Hon'ble Mr. B. V. NARASIMHA AYYAR :—" May I request the President at this stage, because the facts are very much confused, to request the official spokesman to speak on the proposition."

The Hon'ble the VICE-PRESIDENT :—" It is for the official spokesman to decide when he should speak."

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur T. BALAJI RAO NAYUDU :—" I am not quite in favour of the resolution, not because I am doubtful whether the facts stated by my friend the Hon'ble Mr. Marakkayar are correct or not, but my experience is that ordinarily in cases of rioting of this nature Government are informed by district officers, without delay, what had taken place and what is being done. It need not be feared that Government are unaware of the facts relating to riots of this kind. Therefore there is no use of appointing commissions or committees of officials or non-officials at this stage, before the matter is inquired into by the district officers and the police take the necessary action. When we understand, that the local officers have managed the situation and are taking cognizance of the matter, there is no need for approaching the Government to appoint a commissioner or an extra officer to look into the matter. So, at this stage, this resolution is premature. Until we know what the district officers do and how the trial of the case terminates, there is no use of troubling the Government in the matter. This is my view."

The Hon'ble Mr. L. DAVIDSON :—" The motion before this house is that the necessary inquiries be made regarding the recent riot between Hindus and Muhammadans at Muttupet. The Honourable Member who has just sat down has, in my opinion, correctly stated the position. The Government are in possession of very fairly full information of the facts of the case. We received a preliminary report early in May from the District Magistrate, which after giving a narrative of the facts as ascertained during the first few days—a period in the history of occurrences of this kind when accurate information is most likely to be obtainable—proceeds to state that he had himself at once gone to Muttupet—the riot was on the 2nd and he arrived there on the 4th, being joined on the following day by the District Superintendent of Police. The chief magistrate and the chief police officer of the district were therefore on the spot within a little over 48 hours or even less and making personal inquiries into the facts. The District Magistrate's report concluded by saying :—' the Subdivisional Magistrate is inquiring whether the police were justified in firing; and the police are investigating the cases of arson and riot. There is a force of reserve police at the place now and no further disturbance is apprehended.'

" That was the first report which Government got. The District Magistrate, being subsequently asked what was the result of the Subdivisional Magistrate's inquiry and what was the outcome of the police investigation, reported on the 5th July that the ' police had charge-sheeted cases as a result of their investigation against such of those as were found to be aggressors in the rioting—I do not know whether they were Hindus or Muhammadans; that is a matter which it will devolve upon the trying court to investigate.' The report continues: ' The cases have hitherto been pending disposal in the Vedaranniyam Sub-Magistrate's Court, but the Additional District Magistrate has this day transferred the cases in view of their importance to the files of the Subdivisional Magistrate, Pattukkottai, for disposal and I am requesting him to dispose of them speedily. I shall report the final result in due course.'

15TH JULY 1920.] (*Mr. Davidson ; Mr. Narasimha Ayyar.*)

"The District Magistrate had also been requested to inform the Government of the result of the magisterial inquiry into the conduct of the police. He accordingly sent up two special reports by the Subdivisional Magistrate covering many pages of print and concluding with the finding that 'the action taken by the police in firing on the mob was necessary and produced a salutary effect.' As these reports show, in one respect the departmental instructions on the subject of dispersing mobs by armed force were not fully carried out. The Government have called the attention of the Inspector-General of Police to this departure from the rules but I venture to think that, however, it may be regarded by Government from the disciplinary standpoint, it is not likely to be viewed as seriously by the Members of this Council, for the actual breach of rules consisted merely in firing a preliminary warning shot in the air. Our experience —I speak on behalf of the Government—is that the humanitarian plan of firing a warning shot in the air has only too often proved disastrous and merely encouraged the mob to farther excesses with resultant greater loss of life. On this occasion fortunately that was not the case; as far as can be ascertained, the firing resulted only in a single wound on the knee of one member of the mob: it was immediately effective and the mob dispersed.

"The Hon'ble the Raja of Ramnad has asked me to elucidate the intentions of the Government on the question of the functions of the conciliation committee appointed in March last. I was in England when the debates which led to the passing of that order took place and I am not familiar with the details of the reasons which actuated Government, and I cannot say off-hand exactly what the intention was. But I do not think I shall be far wrong if I say that the desire of the Government was that the committee should be placed in possession of the actual history of recent Hindu-Muhammadan disturbances as a means of assisting it in devising preventive measures against similar disturbances in the future. Such information, particularly in the case of recent disturbances, might conceivably be of great assistance. I do not think it was the intention of Government to place that committee in a position to pass judicial findings as to the facts of actual disturbances in the past. As I understand it, that is a function which more properly devolves upon the courts. Now in this instance the facts in issue form the subject of police charge-sheets transferred for disposal to a Subdivisional Magistrate exercising first-class powers and presumably competent to arrive at a finding on the evidence produced before him. He is now actually trying the case. Whether all the evidence bearing on it will be put before him I cannot say; that is for the parties—for the prosecution and the defence—to arrange. But this I can say from the reports which the Government have received from the Subdivisional Magistrate of Mannargudi (that is to say from the local first-class magistrate who is not trying this case himself because he investigated the facts in the first instance, that it is clear that an honest endeavour was made to obtain complete evidence on the subject."

"There is, I think no doubt that the local officers did their best to arrive at the full facts of the case from the very outset. Indeed, it could hardly be otherwise, for as the Council will recollect, the District Magistrate and the District Superintendent of Police were both personally present.

"I do not propose to follow the Honourable Mover into his view of the merits of the case or the Hon'ble Mr. Ramanuja Achariyar in regard to the other aspect of it which he has presented. I shall not attempt at the moment to pronounce whether Hindus or the Muhammadans were more guilty in the matter. The aggressors are on their trial and I think it would be unfair to them to express any opinion in this Council while the judicial proceedings are still in progress. I am afraid that at the risk of wounding the feelings of the Honourable Mover, I must say that he has not behaved fairly towards the sub-inspector of police, Chokkalingam Pillai, whom he has described as at the bottom of the whole trouble. This officer was responsible for the departure from the departmental instructions in regard to the dispersal of mobs by armed force. But I am bound to say, in view of imputations made, that otherwise the result of the inquiry of the local officers was to bestow commendation and not blame upon him. As to his transfer I have no information as to the reasons which led to that but it does not need very deep research to conjecture that the transfer may have been merely in his own interests since in the exercise of his duty he had been compelled to open fire on a mob of rowdies and caused some injury to them. I for one, should not blame the Inspector-General of Police, if in the interests of this officer's personal safety, he removed him to another station.

"I do not think, Sir, that there is anything more which I can usefully add to the discussion of this resolution. I can only say that after this lapse of time the Government are not prepared to direct enquiry by any special committee into a matter which has been dealt with on the spot by the chief magistrate and the chief police officer of the district, and which, so far as further complications are concerned, is now *sub judice* in the court of a first-class magistrate."

The Hon'ble Mr. B. V. NARASIMHA AYYAR :—"I am sorry that my invitation to the official spokesman was not responded to earlier. If, as the Hon'ble Mr. Davidson tells us, the inquiries referred to here are being actually made by a court and the matter is *sub judice* I think it is wholly improper that this Council should enter into the discussion and especially if we have to pass remarks upon officers whose conduct is considered in the inquiry by the court. I think the Hon'ble Mr. Marakkayar will admit that it is not proper to proceed further with this resolution. The Honourable the seconder being one of the members of the Hindu-Moslem Conciliation Committee, proposes that the necessary inquiries could be undertaken by it. I also happen to be one of its members. It is absolutely essential that the Muttupet matter should be cleared of all doubts, but in this case, as the matter is *sub judice* I think it is certainly not one for the committee to take up. The order constituting it contemplates that in some cases it can if necessary go up to the place and make the necessary enquiries. But the Muttupet case is the last one I will suggest for inspection by that body. I think, at present the only result of

further discussion would be to create further differences. I am sorry to note the point of view taken up by the Hon'ble Mr. Marakkayar. I think the best thing would be to drop the matter at present."

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur A. T. G. M. AHAMAD TAMBI MARAKKAYAR :—" Sir, I have no objection to drop the question, as the Government says that the matter is *sub judice.* But one thing I cannot forget the way in which my Honourable friend Mr. Ramanuja Achariyar looked upon the resolution as if I am instigating fight between the Hindus and the Muhammadans. I have my own interest on behalf of my community, but still I would like to see that the two communities do not quarrel with each other and become enemies. My main object in bringing this resolution before this Council is that necessary inquiries should be made and a special report called for. At my request the Government was kind enough to pass an Order on the 30th March 1920, appointing a very strong committee of eight members of each community. As the Hon'ble the Raja of Ramnad explained, the Government have not given a free hand to that committee. If at least that committee is given some such power to deal with the question, it would be better. My friend Mr. Ramanuja Achariyar says that I am charging officials. That is highly objectionable. I am only saying from the reports by the authorities that the Deputy Superintendent of Police was not in order in acting like this and the sub-inspector is the cause of the whole trouble. Had he been capable enough to settle amicably and not opened fire there would have been no trouble at all. I am in no way prejudicial to one side or the other. I went to Muttupet and I met both sides and told them not to have any more quarrel.

"The Hon'ble Mr. Ramanuja Achariyar referred to the damage. I do not know whether his knowledge is derived from anybody or whether he himself inspected. I have personally seen. The damage will not even be As. 4. Does that mean setting fire to a house? It has been wilfully done by interested party. My only object in bringing this resolution before this Council is to make inquiries and to see that justice is done. I also want to bring to the notice of this Council as to how frequently this kind of trouble arises. Rightly speaking the Council ought to be thankful to me for having brought this matter before the Council for the information of Honourable Members so that further recurrences might be put a stop to. All of us should take interest and see that occurrences of this nature do not happen in our respective places. That is my object in bringing this resolution before this Council. I am sorry the Honourable Member in charge of the portfolio could not accept my resolution and order inquiries to be made either by officials or non-officials through the committee, in which I am a member. If some inquiry such as that is ordered, I am sure justice will be done. I am satisfied that justice has not been done in this particular case, and so I thought this was the best place for me to bring this matter and ask for justice to be done. My Honourable friend Mr. Balaji Rao Nayudu remarked that this is not the place to bring this matter. I do not know which is the proper place; I cannot bring this matter anywhere else. I have done my best to explain the matter fully for the information of the Government as well as of this Council; and I therefore leave this matter in the hands of the Government to do their best."

The Hon'ble Mr. L. DAVIDSON :—" I hope the Hon'ble Mover of the resolution will not think that I was blaming him for moving his resolution; that was far from my intention. My position was that I could not agree to accept the recommendation embodied in it because inquiries have already been made or are in progress. The only other thing that I wish to say is that I am sure the Government recognize to the full the value of the assistance which Honourable gentlemen, like Khan Bahadur Ahmad Tambi Marakkayar, can and do freely render by paying personal visits to allay disturbances of this character which arise within the limits of their constituencies. The District Magistrate reported at an early stage that there was no further apprehension of disturbances and things had quieted down; I dare say the Honourable Member's visit went some way to bring about that eminently desirable result."

The Hon'ble the VICE-PRESIDENT :—" I take it that the Honourable Member does not wish to press his resolution."

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur A. T. G. M. AHMAD TAMBI MARAKKAYAR SAHIB Bahadur :— " No."

The resolution was by leave withdrawn.

RESOLUTION *RE* ABROGATION OF RULE VI OF THE UNIVERSITY RULES REGULATING ADMISSIONS OF SECONDARY SCHOOL-LEAVING CERTIFICATE STUDENTS.

The Hon'ble Mr. K. VENKATAPPAYYA PANTULU :—" The resolution which I have the honour to place before this Council runs in these terms :—

' VIII. This Council recommends to His Excellency the Governor in Council that rule VI of the University Rules of eligibility requiring Secondary School-Leaving Certificate students undergoing supplementary course to present all the subjects once again for the public examination be abrogated.'

This resolution asks for the cancellation of one of the rules framed by the University enjoining upon the student who fails to secure the minimum number of marks in any one of his subjects

brought up for the public examination that he should undergo a supplemental course and that he should again present all the subjects both in group A and two subjects in group C for the public examination and that he should secure the minimum number of marks in every one of those subjects at one and the same examination. Sir, when the Secondary School-Leaving Certificate examination rules were framed and introduced for the first time, it was thought that the tyranny of the Matriculation examination was at an end. But we find that the rigour of the rule is all the same. The rule that has been framed by the University with reference to the eligibility of the students for the University course runs as follows: 'Any candidate for admission to a University course of study who in any year fails to qualify by reason of deficiency in any subject or subjects in which he has undergone examination will be required to undergo a supplemental course at school in all the subjects of group A and in two subjects of group C. He must again appear at the public examination at the close of the supplemental course and his eligibility for admission will be determined as if he had then appeared for the examination for the first time.' So this rule enjoins that he ought to secure the minimum number of marks at the second examination in all the subjects that he has brought up for the examination including the subject in which he failed to secure that minimum in the prior examination. That I submit is a very great hardship on the student and I fail to understand the real object of this rule. The rule abrogates the compartmental system of examination which allows students to appear for some only of the subjects, that is the subjects in which he failed to secure the minimum number of marks and to omit the other subjects in which he has already secured the minimum in the prior examination. The deficiency cannot be made up by the student if he has to bestow some attention again for all the subjects which he is asked to bring up for the examination. The fact that he fails to secure the minimum in one subject shows that he is particularly deficient in that subject, and it would be to the advantage of the student if he is allowed to concentrate his attention upon that single subject, so that he may make up his deficiency and secure the minimum number of marks in the subsequent examination. That would be I think very reasonable. The compartmental system is obtaining in the intermediate course and also in the B.A. course and I do not see why that privilege should not be extended also to the students who appear for the Secondary School-Leaving Certificate examination.

"It may be said that the knowledge of the student will not be fresh if he is allowed to bring up only one subject in which he was found deficient, after he had passed the other subjects in the prior examination and that in the course of the year. But what will be the case of the student who after obtaining the minimum number of marks for securing a pass in the Secondary School-Leaving Certificate examination stays away at home for one year or so on account of ill-health or some other cause without at once taking a college course. In the case of such a student it cannot be said he is not eligible for admission to the University. No such rule prevails and there is no prohibition in the case of the student who keeps away for one year provided he has secured a pass in all the subjects in the public examination. No matter how many years he stops away at home, he may enter the college for University course. The question of freshness of knowledge does not arise in such a case.

"There is also another point. There is anyhow specialisation in certain subjects in the University course. A student who is deficient in a particular subject, if he secures the minimum number of marks in that subject in one examination it must suffice for, it is immaterial if he is deficient in that subject, provided he has got an aptitude for some other subjects, and is fit to undergo the University course in those subjects. Suppose a student is deficient in mathematics and because of that subject he fails to secure a pass in one examination, then according to the present rules he has to take up all the subjects and secure a minimum again in all the subjects in the subsequent examination also along with mathematics in which he failed to secure a minimum. Suppose he secures a pass in mathematics, then when he enters the University course he will naturally take up history or any other subject in which he has some special interest or aptitude and not the subject of mathematics in which he is really defective. Therefore making it compulsory for a student to appear for all the subjects at a single examination seems to me unreasonable and severe and does not serve any real purpose.

"No doubt there may be students who are very bright, who are well up in all the subjects and who will make a mark in their after career but there are some other students who would like to have some knowledge in one subject or other. Therefore, there is no reason in asking every student to secure a pass in all the subjects until he is well up in all of them in one single examination, because after all he is going to specialise in the higher branches of study.

"It may be stated that we ought to insist on general knowledge on the part of students. Of course this general knowledge is secured by him if he passes in some subjects at one examination and the other subjects at another. There is no meaning in saying that he should appear for a second examination in all the subjects and secure the minimum in all of them at one and the same time. For these reasons I submit that my resolution be accepted by the Council."

The Hon'ble Mr. B. VENKATAPATI RAJU:—"I rise to support the resolution with a heavy heart because the request is like calling a doctor for a dying man. Our educational system has really missed the mark and has produced enough failures both for itself and for the country. Added to that, our educational rules have been so framed as to pluck more men and the failure is characterised in the papers as 'the slaughter of the innocents'. Only a few years ago our Government took credit to themselves for reducing the severity of the matriculation examination by introducing the Secondary School-Leaving Certificate. His Excellency Lord Hardinge, when he laid the foundation stone of the University library, congratulated the Government that the severity of the matriculation examination had been taken away because they had

wisely introduced the secondary school-leaving certificate. But in the course of a few years the examinations have become worse and worse and candidates who had appeared for the old matriculation examination thought it was far better than the present Secondary School-Leaving Certificate.

"Further it was stated that under the Secondary School-Leaving Certificate course the candidates could appear separately for different subjects and secure a pass easily. On the other hand we find now that a rule has been introduced by the Syndicate, that if a student fails in one subject he has to study all the subjects again if he fails to get 5 per cent more than the presidency average. Is this reducing the severity of the examination?

"We are told that some useful device called moderation has been introduced. But it is a bugbear and only helps in the manipulation of marks. It does not at all help the people in several schools. Only some of the persons who are in a position to manipulate the marks are helped. I do not blame anybody but the whole system is bad and therefore, I appeal to the Government and to the Director of Public Instruction. You must find some remedy to reduce the severity of the examination. No other civilized country produces such a large number of failures. It is the bounden duty of the Government as well as their adviser the Hon'ble Mr. Littlehailes who evinces so much sympathy for education to look into the matter and bring some relief."

The Hon'ble Mr. R. LITTLEHAILES :—"Mr. President, I should like to take this opportunity of inviting your attention to the wording of this resolution which says : 'this Council recommends to His Excellency the Governor in Council that rule VI of the University rules of eligibility requiring Secondary School-Leaving Certificate students undergoing supplementary course to present all the subjects once again for the public examination be abrogated'. The Honourable Member has rightly pointed out that these are the University rules and it is within the competence of the University to formulate its rules for the admission of students to the University course of study. I might invite the attention of the honourable mover and seconder to Chapter XVI—Regulation 1 of the University Regulations which reads as follows :—

'Subject to such rules and directions as the Syndicate may issue from time to time,' holders of completed Secondary School-Leaving Certificates, issued under the authority of the Government of Madras or such authority as may have been accepted by the Syndicate, may be admitted by the head of an affiliated college to a University course of study.'

"These Regulations are of the University of Madras, which are framed under the Indian Universities Act of 1904 and the Government has no power to alter them. It is possible for the Government to lend approval to any change in these regulations which may be submitted to Government by the University authorities. But the initiative in this matter will have to be taken by the University authorities and this is not a matter in which Government can suitably intervene. The honourable the seconder of this resolution spoke as he said with a very heavy heart appealing for a doctor to help a dying man. I might suggest that he has come to the wrong doctor but I can tell him the right doctor. The wrong doctor is Government and the right doctor is the University and if the honourable mover will only address the University authorities, the University will no doubt consider the matter."

The Hon'ble Mr. B. V. NARASIMHA AYYAR :—"Mr. President, the Hon'ble Mr. Littlehailes has told us that the mover has gone to the wrong doctor. I venture to differ from him in one particular. In respect of certain ailments, it may be necessary to go to more than one doctor. In my opinion this is pre-eminently a case in which a number of doctors have to be consulted. The patient is fast sinking. There is no use in sitting with folded hands when the patient is sinking and saying the Surgeon-General should come and no one else, to deal with the patient. The present motion has been brought up by reason of the fact that the existing state of things with reference to the Secondary School-Leaving Certificate is not merely a hardship from the standpoint of the students but it is also a national evil. It is trying to crush the existence of the youths. Hope is taken out of youth. There is no meaning in any responsible body of persons folding up their hands and saying that they are not the authority.

"The question is who is to take the initiative. The Hon'ble Mr. Littlehailes assumes that the only body who ought to initiate any changes in the matter is the University. I venture to differ from him. The University has certain authority under the Act. And this Council and the Government have distinct influence which can make that body which has that power to exercise it. We have also got more power beyond initiating. The Government of India have got further powers. It is not necessary to invoke the higher power which the Government of India have. At present it is quite sufficient for us to note the fact that a strong expression of opinion in this Council approved of by Government can effect the required change. I think from that standpoint it is quite necessary that we should consider whether there is really the evil which the honourable mover has been presenting to this house. There can be no possible doubt that there is—the 'benefits' of 'moderation' being illusory. There are numerous other evils which I shall not waste the time of the Council by repeating and which call for action and I hope that the purely technical position taken by the Hon'ble Mr. Littlehailes will not be accepted by this Council. There is no good saying that there is the University and let them do their duty, when we find the youth of the country so grievously suffering."

The Hon'ble Diwan Bahadur Sir P. TYAGARAYA CHETTI :—"Mr. President, I quite sympathise with the resolution that is moved by the Hon'ble Mr. Venkatappayya Pantulu. It seems to me a pity that the youngsters are being put to unnecessary trouble in passing exami-

nations over and over again in which they have passed and thus waste so much of human energy. It seems also that it must be the desire of every Honourable Member present to see that these boys are not pestered by going up for examinations and failing. Perhaps 75 or 80 per cent fail in their examinations and this is ruining their life blood. If a boy goes up and passes examination, say in one subject in one year, another subject in another year and rather goes again in all the subjects in another year, it means that he is wasting so much of energy on all the subjects that he has passed. So it is better that this Council should ask the Government to interfere in this matter and move the University to set matters right. It is not right as the Hon'ble Mr. Littlehailes says, to say that it is the duty of the University to look into it. If the University does not look into it, it is the duty of somebody else to look into it or rather make them look into it and rectify the matters. My idea is this. Do not worry the boys to such an extent to make them waste their energy. Make them work as much as possible for them to pass the examinations. I say their health is ruined, their physique is gone. I want to see boys with good physique and with good health so that they may be useful members of society. To get that thing I think it is right that this Council should move the Government to interfere in this matter and see that it is put right."

The Hon'ble Mr. P. SIVA RAO :—" Mr. President, I wish to put in a strong word in favour of the resolution that has been moved by the Hon'ble Mr. Venkatappayya Pantulu. We are familiar with the recent disastrous results in the intermediate and the B.A. degree examinations. For some reason or other the examinations have come up to a good deal of notice at the hands of the public. There have been complaints put forward of the recent calamitous results of these examinations. Anything that is proposed to relieve the present unfortunate condition of the students, I would simply welcome. I would first dwell on the merits of the question, before I tackle the technical objection mentioned by the Director of Public Instruction. He has not said so far anything as regards the merits of this proposition and whether it deserves favourable consideration at the hands of the University or at the hands of the Hon'ble the Director of Public Instruction. The honourable mover is seeking to remove one of the standing evils of the present examinations. He wants to put an end to, what shall I say, a baseless fiction that a person who fails in one subject is deemed to have failed in all. Unless the student comes up fully equipped with all the subjects simultaneously, he is not considered to be proficient at all. Honourable Members of the Council will remember the agitation that was raised in former days against the rigour of the old Matriculation examination and how we hailed this Secondary School-Leaving Certificate scheme with wholesale approval and satisfaction, because it was intended to soften the rigours of the old examination. Now we find that substantially the old Matriculation is revived in the form of the Secondary School-Leaving Certificate. The Honourable Members of Council will perhaps remember that the Secondary School-Leaving Certificate qualifies a man for two lines. It is a passport for two walks of life. First it makes a man eligible for the University career and secondly it makes a man eligible for public service. So far as public service is concerned a student who has passed in one subject need not undergo training in all the subjects again. The rule in question prevails so far as eligibility to collegiate course is concerned. The honourable mover is seeking to introduce what is known as the compartmental system which is now prevalent in the intermediate and the B.A. courses. It is a very simple reform and a very salutary reform, and then what is the objection. After all the only objection seems to be that the student is not fresh in his proficiency, if he is allowed to pass different subjects at different times. I do not think this consideration should be given any weight whatever. And then there is one other consideration, that is, probably, the difficulty and inconvenience of holding examinations frequently in a year. That inconvenience is nothing when compared to the manifold advantages and the considerable relief we are going to give to the students in general. As was well pointed out by the Hon'ble Sir P. Tyagaraya Chettiyar, the system of examination is becoming too galling and pressing too heavily upon the students. It is a regular nightmare and I think we must make every endeavour to soften its effects. And what is the objection after all, which the Director of Public Instruction has mentioned. It is this. We are not interested in the matter. The University has passed some regulations. It is left to the University and to it alone to say who shall be eligible for the University career and who shall be entitled to enter its portals. The University, the Senate or the Syndicate, must move in the matter and not the Government. I submit, Mr. President, that the Government also are interested in the matter. It is their examination and they are interested in saying that their examination should be conducted in a particular manner and it should have certain results. If it is open to the Government to say that the Secondary School-Leaving Certificate examination entitles a person to hold certain salaried posts, it also entitles them to say that that examination shall be a passport to the University career. After all, this difficulty can be solved as it has been solved in so many other instances. Some railway question cropped up this morning and it was suggested that a copy of the proceedings should be sent to the Railway administration. Similarly, we may send up a copy of our debate with our recommendations to the University which may consider the unanimous request of this Council that they should modify their regulations. Whether they take the initiative or the Director of Public Instruction moves a resolution in the Syndicate, it does not matter very much. It is easy to shelve these most necessary matters which affect the welfare of the students by placing these obstacles. Is there anything to prevent the Director of Public Instruction to move some such resolution in the Senate and to

get the necessary things done for the benefit of the student classes in general ? As I submitted, Mr. President, we shall pass the resolution and submit it for the consideration of the University. Let them reject or abide by our advice. We need not feel shy of making any representation."

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur N. SUBBA RAO :—" Sir, I have great pleasure in supporting the resolution. I view the question from the standpoint that this Council has got definite powers. If I have correctly read the University Act and the regulations, it would appear that if the University or the Senate has to set up a different set of regulations or substitute the Matriculation for the Secondary School-Leaving Certificate or some changes have to be made in the University, it requires the sanction of the Government. So the Government as a whole has got that power and is the controlling authority over the University. Under those circumstances I submit that we are here to represent the views of our constituents and place before the Government our grievances in the shape of certain resolutions. If they are accepted, well and good. We know the policy of Government in the matter of certain resolutions. This morning we have observed the Government saying that they would send the proceedings of the meeting in the matter of the resolution moved by the Hon'ble Mr. Madhava Raja, to the proper authority for consideration. So I submit, Sir, that this is eminently a matter in which I hope the non-official members will be at one on this point and if such a resolution is placed before the University, the University will certainly reconsider and give their best consideration to the resolution that has been passed in this hall. As has been pointed out by the Hon'ble Mr. Siva Rao in the case of the Intermediate and the B.A. examinations, we have now a compartmental system and I do not see why the Director of Public Instruction should not also join with us in recommending such a course to the University in the case of Secondary School-Leaving Certificate. I believe the object of these examinations is to test whether the student has a workable knowledge of certain subjects and if he has, I believe he need not be asked to undergo the examination again and pass the test in the next succeeding year in the subjects he has passed. I hope many of us have appeared for the F.A. and B.A. examinations and I believe many of us have forgotten our Logorithms and Binomial Theorems and other things. In fact we have left the whole thing in the examination hall itself. We have only a certain amount of workable and general knowledge of the subject and which we carry in our pockets. So I firmly hope that this matter will be considered favourably not only by non-officials but by officials and a unanimous resolution, if possible, be sent for the consideration of the University. If the Hon'ble Mr. Littlehailes as well as the Government think that they are not the proper authority, then I submit the Government may very well send the resolution of this house and the debate to the consideration of the University."

The Hon'ble Mr. V. MADHAVA RAJA :—" I heartily support the resolution moved by my friend Mr. Venkatappayya Pantulu. I do not think he has committed any very great mistake. The Hon'ble the Director of Public Instruction himself has said that this matter ought to be referred to the University and, if they recommend, ' we will be glad to accept.' It clearly shows that the final decision rests entirely with the Government. Instead of going a round-about way, why should not the matter be placed directly before the Government ? I have some knowledge of the hardships suffered by students and I can speak from personal experience as district board president, having half a dozen high schools under me ; if one of the students passess in all the subjects and fails in one subject for want of three marks, the rule says that the student should again appear for all the subjects. I think it is very hard and puts too much strain on the student. He should be allowed to appear only in the subject in which he failed just as in the B.A. and F.A. courses. I did not think that this particular resolution required so much speech on the part of the Government for accepting it. It is a very simple case for the Government to accept and change the rule. With these remarks I support the resolution."

The Hon'ble Mr. T. ARUMAINATHA PILLAI :—" Mr. President : I am extremely sorry to find that the Hon'ble the Director of Public Instruction has taken shelter in opposing this proposition under quite a technical plea. You will be pleased to see, Sir, that the effect of failure in one subject is to ask the student to appear again for all the subjects put together and make him study once more all the text-books. The difficulty, instead of being removed, is being simply enhanced. I would only submit that, if the Director of Public Instruction had laid before the Council any reasons why this resolution should not be accepted on the merits, most probably some of us would have been in his favour. But we are all aware of the condemnation of this Secondary School-Leaving Certificate examination both in the press and on the public platform and the Honourable Mover has given this Council various eminent reasons why the present course which is now being adopted by the University should be abrogated. To this the Hon'ble the Director of Public Instruction has not given any answer at all. I may even say that he has not touched any one of these questions. That simply shows the weakness of his own case. It further shows also that he practically admits that whatever has been said both in the press and in the platform and by my Hon'ble friend Mr. K. Venkatappayya Pantulu are all perfectly true and that the grievance which now exists against the Secondary School-Leaving Certificate examination is simply legitimate. Considering all these things, Mr. President, may I submit to you that to say that it is not in our power to remove these things and ask us to go to the Syndicate of the University to remove them—may I submit, Sir, that it is adding insult to the injury which our boys are already suffering. We feel strongly in this matter and, whatever the Government thinks, we feel that it is not in a position to say anything against all the

defects that have been pointed out by the mover. May I not submit, Sir, that it is the Government's duty to see that all these defects are removed ? But, if the Government say 'we cannot do it' and 'it is your duty to set up agitation', may I ask, Sir, is it fair, for the sake of the poor young boys of 15 whose lives have been blasted on account of these examinations, and whether the Government is not bound by duty to set matters right? After all what is asked by my friend is this: the University provides for compartmental examinations for the B.A. and the Intermediate courses: why not adopt it so far as this Secondary School-Leaving Certificate is concerned? Would it not conduce to bring about the result which my friend, the Hon'ble Mr. K. Venkatappayya Pantulu has asked this Council to do. If the Government is not going to accept it, Sir, then I can only say that the poor fate of these young boys whose lives are simply blasted would be upon its head."

The Hon'ble Mr. L. DAVIDSON :—" Mr. President: it was not my intention to intervene at all in this debate relating as it does to a matter which I thought might safely be left in the hands of the Director. But in the course of the discussion it has been wrongly imputed that his attitude amounts to a cowardly taking of shelter under technicalities. Now, in this respect Mr. Littlehailes is simply carrying out his brief and I cannot sit silent while accusations of this sort are being bandied about. The instructions which he was given regarding this resolution were to indicate that the proper tribunal for discussion was the Senate of the University. The rules under issue are the outcome of regulations sanctioned by the Government but it is the intention, as a measure of decentralization, that the power of initiative in matters like this should vest in the Syndicate who decide with the approval of the Senate—though I am not very familiar with the details of the University Act and the exact relationship before the Senate and the Syndicate—what colleges should be affiliated to the University and other similar matters. That being so, believing as I do in decentralization, I was bound to advise my colleagues to take up the position which the Director has set out. I feel strongly that any change of the description proposed, should first be ventilated before the authorities which primarily deal with it, i.e., the Syndicate, the Senate and the University.

"As the result of a fairly long experience in this Council and of a prolonged study of the newspaper press in Southern India, one thing has struck me almost more than anything else, and that is, that no man is so mean as not to be, in his own eyes at least, an educational expert. He has been at school, he has been at college and he thinks, not unnaturally, that he is entitled to have an opinion and to express it. He may also think that his are the only opinions which are right, being slow to recognize that there may be others who know more about educational questions than he does and that a body composed largely of educational experts such as the Senate, and still more the Syndicate, of the University of Madras may be better qualified to judge. It is in that view of the case that the Government would desire this question to be fully debated by the Senate and considered by the Syndicate, before undertaking themselves to express any opinion on the merits of the issue. I have been at school myself, at colleges both in London and at Oxford, and I have read the newspapers of this country for 30 years: I have served as Educational Under Secretary, and as Educational Secretary and have for some time past been in charge of the Educational portfolio of Government; but I should be the last person to dogmatize on such a question as merits of the compartmental system. It is emphatically a technical subject and I do not profess to be an expert in any sense. Still a lay-man may perhaps form and express a tentative opinion. And for my part I should suppose that the main object of the University rules is to ensure that those who are best fitted for a University course and those alone shall be admitted to it. The Government when they prescribed the School Final Examination and the Secondary School-Leaving Certificate scheme had no intention whatsoever of fixing pass minima or anything of that sort. In answer to one of the questions put before the Legislative Council at this very meeting it was emphasized that there is no such thing as passing or failing in the Secondary School-Leaving Certificate examination. But the University has found it necessary for the guidance of heads of colleges to prescribe certain minima which are intended to prevent colleges from admitting candidates who are obviously unfit to undergo any University course. There is no reasonable doubt that a candidate who passes simultaneously in all his subjects is materially more capable than one who fails in some of them. And if a boy who fails in one or more subjects ultimately passes in them, this does not mean that his capacity is on the same level; still less would this be the case if he were allowed the benefit of examination by compartments. Very few sixth form boys would fail ultimately to satisfy the University Regulations, if they were permitted to take up one subject at a time and had sufficient perseverance to appear for it again and again until they got through, repeating the process for other subjects in succession. That however is merely a personal opinion.

"My primary object in getting up now is to exonerate the Hon'ble the Director of Public Instruction from a charge which cannot properly be laid against him and to emphasize that decentralization is a sound principle and not a mere technicality."

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur T. BALAJI RAO NAYUDU :—" Previous speakers have said enough. Formerly, when the Matriculation examination was done away with and the School Final examination was introduced boys were allowed to appear in School Final examination in compartmental system. That system had been done away with subsequently and new rules were introduced that a boy who fails in one subject should appear in all the subjects again. I do not see the reason why the original rule was changed, when the B.A. and Intermediate examinations are still held in compartment system.

" Secondly, taking the results of this Presidency and comparing them with the results of the other presidencies in all the examinations, such as the B.A., Intermediate and the School Final those of the Madras Presidency seem to be very poor for the reason that the examinations in this province are more severe than in others. I therefore support this resolution."

The Hon'ble Mr. J. H. THONGER :—" Mr. President, in speaking upon this resolution I must confess that my better judgment is clouded by my sympathy for the youth of this country, the more so when I look back upon my school days and remember the nightmare these examinations were to me. The trouble at the present moment is, as it was in my case many years ago, that there is really no necessity for a vast number of these boys to go into these examinations at all, but going in for scholastic training they look upon it as their duty to do so, absolutely irrespective of what they are being trained for. In my particular case, I went in for examinations, though there was no particular necessity for it, for I was not being trained for any of the Educational Departments of Government, nor did I require to acquire a finished education which for instance a man requires for entering into the Indian Civil Service. I was being trained for a mercantile career, and I maintain that the education I received was sufficient to enable me to be more or less successful in my profession. The difficulty at the present day is that a very large number of boys who enter for a scholastic training consider that they are capable of entering into some kind of educational career or other, whilst as a matter of fact all they require is an elementary education to enable them to go back to their fathers' professions in the workshops and make better men than their fathers.

" In speaking upon this subject I think I am justified in saying that the spirit of the age is to lessen the difficulties for the boys, and in a place like India I am inclined to think that this is the right policy, for rules and regulations in connexion with examinations which may be suitable to western nations, with generations of education behind them, may not be suitable to present day conditions in India. I have taken the liberty on more than one occasion of warning this council against forcing education upon the youths of the country before they and the country itself are in a position to assimilate it. We see the first fruits of this policy in a universal complaint that the boys cannot pass their examinations—examinations which the previous generation of boys did not appear to have any difficulty in passing. Every argument that I can bring forward is a negative of this resolution. Nevertheless I propose to support it. While doing so I quite realize that the best thing for the country is that instead of making examinations easier they should be stiffened up, from the point of view that the benefits of education have been thrown open too rapidly to the youth of the country, and after having gone through his scholastic career he finds there is no outlet for him. Government and mercantile offices are besieged by semi-educated boys whose right place is really the workshop. They would probably make good workmen. They make very indifferent clerks. I take it that the very fact of this resolution having been brought forward by one of our Indian friends and that it has received very warm support from others, may be taken to mean that they realize and are prepared to accept the responsibilities of producing a generation of youths inferior to themselves in educational abilities, for this must inevitably be the case if there is any slackening in the stringency of examination rules, and it is on the presumption that they realize the responsibilities they are taking upon their shoulders that, if this resolution is taken to a division, I shall support it."

The Hon'ble the RAJA OF RAMNAD :—" The Hon'ble the Director of Public Instruction told us that the initiative should come from the Madras University. There is some apprehension in the minds of some of my honourable friends that that body may not take the initiative. It is in this view that the resolution has been placed before this Council. With your permission, I beg to move an amendment if the honourable the mover is agreeable to it. The amended resolution will be as follows : 'This Council recommends to His Excellency the Governor in Council that they be pleased to invite the opinion of the Madras University about abrogating rule VI of the University rules of eligibility requiring Secondary School-Leaving Certificate students undergoing supplementary course to present all the subjects once again for the public examination.' I do not know whether it will be acceptable to the honourable mover."

The Hon'ble the VICE-PRESIDENT :—" I would rather not accept an amendment at this stage. We have discussed the whole question and are nearing the end of it."

The Hon'ble Mr. K. VENKATAPPAYYA PANTULU :—" Sir, of course many of my friends in the Council have strongly supported me and I sincerely thank them for the support that they have given. That shows clearly that the resolution refers to a crying evil in the country and which requires immediate relief. It has been pointed out by the Hon'ble Mr. Davidson that the compartmental system is not a very desirable one and we need not be much enamoured of it. In his opinion it is better to maintain the present system which insists upon the student to pass examinations in all the subjects all at once as it will be a better test of the efficiency of candidates rather than give them opportunities to appear by compartmental method and pass the subjects at different times."

The Hon'ble Mr. L. DAVIDSON :—" May I ask, Sir, whether the Honourable Member said that I came from a country where the compartmental system obtains? If so, may I, with your leave, say that when many years ago I passed the Matriculation examination of the London University there was no compartmental system at all in force. I do not know whether it obtains at the present day or not. But I should like to repeat that I make no claim to be an educational expert and do not venture to pronounce any final judgment as to the merits of the compartmental system."

The Hon'ble Mr. K. VENKATAPPAYYA PANTULU :—" After all, one evil I can point out. It is our system that has not given an opportunity to a man like Professor Ramanujam, whose death is so much lamented, to pass the examination. He was declared to be the very best mathematician the world has ever produced. But it was not given to him to secure a pass in this University. That shows that we require the compartmental system and that this insistence on the candidate to appear in all the subjects at once is a great drawback and a defect in the system of education here. There is one other point that I wish to state. A statement is made in one of the important public documents, that there is in this country a good number of discontented and half educated men and many evils are due to them. The opinion is gaining ground in the country that educational authorities, in order to do away with this trouble, are very strict about examinations and stringent rules are being adopted in order to reduce the number of educated men. But I hope that it is not true. It is also stated that a particular standard of education should be insisted upon. If a candidate wants admission to the University, it is a wrong view to put obstacles in the way, because every person in the country is entitled to have the benefit of University education. It does not matter whether he is eminently fitted for it or not. It does not matter whether he reaches a particularly high standard of efficiency artificially fixed by the University. I think it is undue interference with the privilege of a citizen to receive the full benefit of educational institutions in the country. What does it matter if a number of failures occur in the University examinations just because judged from a particularly high standard the number of students appearing for it are supposed not fit for it. We ought to afford facilities for them to acquire the requisite knowledge. Why should the doors of the University be closed against anybody? That is unjust and unreasonable and undue interference with the rights of citizenship. With these words, I press my resolution for a division."

The Hon'ble Mr. R. LITTLEHAILES :—" The Honourable Member has indicated that I did not discuss the question for one reason. Another reason is that I did not consider this assembly fit to discuss educational matters of this kind and that the University was the place where this matter ought to be discussed in the first instance.

" It is open to any member of the Syndicate to bring a motion on any such matter relating to examinations, and to have it discussed at any meeting of the Senate. The Senate is the body, which either considers such a question itself, refers it to the Syndicate for consideration or appoints a committee for consideration and investigation. I might mention for the benefit of this Council that I have heard on the authority of a very eminent Indian gentleman that he was strongly opposed to the action of the University in failing a large number of candidates. Once he took the opportunity of sitting with a Board of Examiners. The Board passed 25 to 30 per cent of the candidates. He told me afterwards that he himself according to his opinion would not have passed more than 5 per cent although in his ignorance he formerly thought that the examination standard was too high. I just give that as an example which I have had on the authority of an Indian gentleman.

" The point is that the University is the body which ought to set this matter right and it is open, as I have said, to any member of the Senate to move a resolution in its meetings. There are some members of the Senate who are here. If the matter is one of very urgent importance it is open to the community at large to have the matter moved in the Senate. Only two days ago 15 members of the Senate asked for an extraordinary meeting of the Senate to be called to discuss the University results. According to the University regulations such a meeting must be held and a meeting has been called for the 30th of this month. It is open to the members of the public to move their friends in the Senate to bring forward a resolution in the ordinary meetings of the Senate and until the Senate discusses this problem and expresses an opinion upon it, it is a matter outside the scope of the Government. Primarily the Senate is responsible for University education in this country and it is not for any outside body—be it ever so important even for Government—to impose on the University conditions regulating admission to the University course, which that body had never an opportunity to discuss.

" One other point. The Honourable Member for the Ceded districts said that this examination was a Government examination. I might just correct him by stating that the Secondary School-Leaving Certificate examination is a joint examination conducted by a body on which the University nominates four representatives. It is a joint examination of Government and the University and as a result of that examination students are given marks, and these are entered in the certificates given to the pupils. They can then go out into the world as having completed the Secondary School-Leaving Certificate course and they are entitled to the various advantages, one of which is entrance into Government departments. The majority of these students, as pointed out by the Hon'ble Mr. Thonger, desire admission to the University course. It behoves the University to lay down any rules which it considers fit for this purpose, and this particular rule is a rule framed on the results of several years' working of the scheme. I think this Council ought to know one or two facts. One fact is that when the Secondary School-Leaving Certificate scheme was introduced it was open to the Principals of colleges to admit any student, whom they considered fit, provided he possessed a Secondary School-Leaving Certificate. This did not work well. On inquiry being made and certificates being called for it was discovered that a very large number of Principals were admitting students who were absolutely unfit for an University course. The marks obtained by some of them were below 20 per cent in English and in other subjects also they were very low. That being so, the Syndicate had to frame rules for admission and these rules were framed a few years ago in the

first instance and have been changed year by year in accordance with the increasing needs of the times and what has been shown as necessary in order to secure that first of all the Principal will admit the right standard of pupil and secondly that the pupils themselves are not to waste their money by paying for an education which they are not fitted to receive."

A poll was taken with the following result:—

For

The Hon'ble Mr. T. Arumainatha Pillai.
" Mr. M. C. Raja.
" Mr. K. Venkatappayya Pantulu.
" Mr. P. Siva Rao.
" Mr. B. Venkatapati Raju.
" Mr. W. Vijayaraghava Mudaliyar.
" Mr. T. Richmond.
" Mr. V. Madhava Raja.
" Rao Bahadur T. Balaji Rao Nayudu Garu.
" the Raja of Pithapuram.
" the Raja of Ramnad.
" the Zamindar of Parlakimedi.
" Mr. C. V. S. Narasimha Raju.
" Diwan Bahadur Sir P. Tyagaraya Chetti Garu.
" Mr. B. V. Narasimha Ayyar.
" Rao Bahadur N. Subba Rao Avargal.
" Rai Bahadur T. N. Sivagnanam Pillai Avargal.
" Mr. J. H. Thonger.
" Khan Bahadur Haji Abd-ul-lah Haji Qasim Sahib Bahadur.
" Khan Bahadur A. T. G. M. Ahmad Tambi Marakkayar Sahib Bahadur.

Against

The Hon'ble Mr. L. Davidson, C.S.I.
" Mr. C. G. Todhunter, C.S.I.
" Mr. R. A. Graham.
" Major-General G. G. Giffard, C.S.I., I.M.S.
" Diwan Bahadur T. Desika Achariyar Avargal.
" Mr. R. Littlehailes.
" Mr. A. Y. G. Campbell.
" Mr. S. Cox.
" Diwan Bahadur L. D. Swamikannu Pillai Avargal, I.S.O.
" Mr. E. S. Lloyd.
" Mr. W. J. J. Howley, C.S.I.

The resolution was carried, 20 voting *for* and 11 *against*.

The Council adjourned for lunch.

The Council re-assembled at 3 p.m.

RESOLUTION *RE* ADMISSION OF WOMEN OF ALL CASTES INTO BRAHMAN WIDOWS' HOME.

The Hon'ble Mr. M. C. RAJA moved the following resolution :—

"IX. That this Council recommends to His Excellency the Governor in Council that the Brahman Widows' Home maintained by Government on the Madras Marina be converted into a Student's Hostel for women of all castes and creeds corresponding to the Victoria Hostel in which young men of all castes and creeds live under one roof though they have separate boarding arrangements."

In doing so he said :—" Mr. President, in proposing this resolution my attitude is that of a peace-maker and not that of a partisan. Between the Brahman widows for whom the hostel in question is provided and the community to which I belong there is a great deal in common. We are both the victims of social and religious tyranny—sufferers at the hands of orthodox Hindu customs. As a Brahman widow is regarded as an ill-omen, likewise are my people regarded as untouchable. She is shorn of her beauty and kept in subjection in the house, the slave of the family. Likewise are the Panchamas deprived of freedom of intercourse with the people and kept in subjection and ignorance, the hewers of wood, and the drawers of water for the people at large. I cannot therefore be expected to have other feelings than those of sympathy for the class of people for which the Brahman widows' home maintained by Government caters.

If then I come forward to move a resolution suggesting a change with regard to this institution it is not from want of sympathy but in the interests of justice. You know that the Brahman widows' home is regarded by a large section of the people with great deal of suspicion and dislike bordering on resentment. At more than one non-Brahman Conference held in this city and elsewhere, resolutions were passed disapproving of Government's action in maintaining this institution at the expense of the general tax-payer, and if I am not mistaken when Mr. Montagu was in Madras with His Excellency the Viceroy and other advisers for the purpose of evolving a scheme of constitutional reform in India, the Madras Dravidian Association, the

15TH JULY 1920.] (*Mr. Raja.*)

premier non-Brahman organization of Southern India prior even to the South Indian Peoples' Association represented in this council by Sir P. Tyagaraya Chetti, mentioned this as a particular instance of the Madras Government's partiality for the Brahmans and its solicitude in promoting their interest. It is thus a grievance of some year's standing which I call upon your Excellency's Government to tackle to the satisfaction of all parties concerned. This hostel is regarded as an instrument of Government policy in favouring a particular class and is an eye-sore to non-Brahmans who form a large majority of the people. It is a bone of contention between the Government and the Brahmans on the one hand and the non-Brahman people on the other, and as long as the Government Brahman Widows' Home stands there with its huge circular tower rising above its castle walls, the non-Brahmans will feel, not altogether without an appearance of reason on their side, that the Madras Government is unduly solicitous of the interest of one particular community, a community which besides being vociferous abroad has free access to the ears and the purse of the Government. My attitude in this controversy is, as I have said, that of a peace-maker and not that of a partisan. My community suffers at the hands of Brahmans and non-Brahmans alike. The Brahman inculcates the doctrine of inherent superiority of caste and inferiority of birth with its inhuman corollary of the untouchableness of certain people and he stands aloof and the non-Brahman applies this doctrine to us with the blind obedience of an unthinking people. Thus we the Athi-Dravidas have reason to complain of the attitude of both classes towards us. Why then do I ask to have this question discussed before this Council? Because if this Government Brahman Widows' Home, as the sign-board at the gate of this institution designates, is the expression of a bias in Government policy in favour of a so-called high caste, the sooner that bias is removed the better will it be for the promotion of good feeling among the various communities, and the smooth administration of the country.

" What are the arguments in favour of Government maintaining a home or hostel for Brahman widows on caste basis?

(1) The lot of widows in this country is very pitiable, and especially of young widows the victims of early marriage. Such widows abound in the Brahman community. This class of people therefore require help and relief.

(2) They could be trained into school mistresses and nurses and their services could be made available for the people at large.

(3) The Government are prepared to give facilities for the widows of other communities if such widows are forthcoming in sufficient members.

(4) If Brahman widows are to be helped to become educated as a class, this could be done, they being given facilities in the shape of free-boarding and lodging, and this could be done only on a caste basis by their being housed together under a Brahman superintendent.

" Let me examine these arguments in detail. It is true that the Brahman widows are an unfortunate class, but it should be remembered that their lot is unfortunate only when compared with that of their fortunate sisters in the Brahman community itself, that outside their community there are people sunk in ignorance and poverty with the stigma attached to them of social and religious inferiority. These people are large in number and their contribution to the economic development of the country is infinitely greater, and what is being done for them, compared with what might be done and ought to be done for them is utterly inadequate by the side of what is being done for the Brahman widows. The number of scholarships given to these persons is proportionately greater than the number of scholarships awarded to Panchama pupils. The number of Panchama scholarships is 16 at present whereas every inmate of the widows home gets a scholarship to cover all her expenses. Some time ago, when I asked Government to ear-mark a certain amount for scholarships for pupils of my community the answer was given that it is not usual to ear-mark sums for any section of the community. I wonder if the expenditure incurred by Government on account of this hostel, does not come under the description of " ear-marking " educational funds and that for a very minor section of the community. It is because the beneficiaries in these cases belong to first caste and fifth caste or no caste respectively. You know the fate of the five lakhs set apart in the budget for the amelioration of the condition of the Panchamas. Out of this amount three lakhs have been resumed, and about one lakh goes to paying the establishment charges of the office of the protector of the interests of the depressed classes and other officials connected with it; and out of the two lakhs set apart in the budget for building elementary schools for depressed classes one lakh has been absorbed for raising the salaries of Government servants. Do not these classes deserve the Government's sympathy? Is not their lot as pitiable nay, even more pitiable than that of the Brahman widows who get substantial scholarships even while having well-to-do relatives to support them.

" As for them being trained into school-mistresses and nurses and their services being made available for the people at large, it would be interesting to learn how many of these widows have become school-mistresses and nurses and whether the Government thinks that the rusult even in this respect justifies the outlay. Moreover, are the Government sure that if equal facilities in the shape of free, boarding and lodging and material supervision are given to women of other communities, non-Brahman Hindus including Nayars, Thiyas, Athi-Dravidas, etc., they will not become equally useful as teachers and nurses. If the Government thinks that they will not be quite so acceptable among Hindus as teachers, does the Government know that there is among non-Brahmans a strong prejudice against Brahman widows, a prejudice which they share with and have imbibed from Brahmans themselves and a repugnance to their girls being taught by these

people. It has been said that Hindu parents do not like their daughters being taught by Christian mistresses, but non-Brahman Hindu parents do not like their daughters being taught by Brahman widows either. By way of pacifying opposition to Government maintaining the sectarian institution which the Brahman widows' home undoubtedly, is, it has been said that Government is quite willing to encourage the education of non-Brahman Hindu widows, if such widows will be forthcoming in sufficient numbers. You know that the custom of infant marriage is not so prevalent among non-Brahmans as among Brahmans, since the non-Brahmans marry late both men and women ; the numbers of young widows is not so great amongst them as amongst Brahmins. To say therefore that the Government would provide equal facilities for non-Brahman widows as for Brahman widows is to offer something for which there is, thanks to a more humane, social ordering, no need at all. I understand that in connexion with and by the side of the Government Brahman widows' home in the midst of a congested area a small place is provided for the lodging of a few non-Brahmin widows who have come forward ; but what an accommodation they are provided with ! Their lodgings are mere hovels by the side of the mighty palace in which the Brahman widows are lodged. No wonder the non-Brahmans feel that the non-Brahman ladies get a sort of step-motherly treatment from Government, while the Brahman ladies are treated as the children of the house. As for the argument that if the Brahman widows are to be housed and fed by Government, this could only be done on a caste basis. I regard this argument as an answer to itself. What does a caste basis mean ? It means that Government should encourage Brahmin widows in their exclusiveness, should help them to regard themselves as a class apart from and superior to others, and do all this at the expense of the general tax-payer. If the Brahmins want their widows to maintain their caste exclusiveness and caste superiority, they ought to start and conduct at their own expense an institution for the practice of Varnashrama Dharma by the widows of their community and they are well able to do this. They have got the means and the skill. Varnashrama Dharma is not the innocent and noble doctrine which it seems to be. It is their doctrine which enables the Brahman to arrogate to himself virtues which he does not possess and which has degraded certain classes and stigmatized them as Sudras and untouchables. It is because this hostel is conducted on the lines of such an inhuman doctrine and that under the auspices of the Government as its very name—the Government Brahman Widows' Home signifies—that the non-Brahmans strongly object to its existence and a Panchama and an untouchable feel called upon to protest against this institution as conducted on its present lines. At present it is a nursery of Brahman orthodoxy, a breeding place for the germs of concomitant notions of caste inferiority. Caste flourishes in this country, thanks to the genius of Manu, independently of Government assistance, and in spite of the attacks of reformers and missionaries, why should Government help to entrench it, at the expense of the tax-payer behind the fortifications of Kernan castle ?

"I propose therefore that the institution be reformed and reconstituted on a broader and a non-sectarian basis. Let its doors be thrown open not only to widows' but women generally, whether they be maids, matrons' or widows. It should not be necessary for a woman to become a widow to become a member of a Government Women Student Hostel. Let the membership be thrown open to all women students to whatever caste or creed they may belong. There are a sufficient number of women students in Madras or coming to Madras who want hostel accommodation—school pupils, arts college students, medical students and teachers. And finally opinion and social practice have sufficiently advanced to allow of a commingling of women students. They do this in schools and colleges and even with regard to living under one roof, they manage it in Queen Mary's College for Women. No doubt they divide into compartments when they go for their mess ; but for the rest they live for all practical purposes as one body. They have, if I am not mistaken, no caste Superintendents for each section of the students. Here, Nayars, Thiyas, Christians, Brahmans, Anglo-Indians, live in one Residential College. What is possible in Queen Mary's College among women and in Victoria Hostel among men ought surely to be possible among women students and teachers in a place not far from either of these places. The acceptance of my resolution will remove a source of irritation among the non-Brahman classes ; it will encourage education among women of all classes, it will show to the world that the Government is not partial to a community which boasts of its enlightenment and is well able and ought to take care of its less fortunate members. It will, above all, bring together under one roof women of all classes and castes and creeds and promote mutual understanding and mutual respect and thus tend to the unification of the people. For, friendships formed among women across distinctions of caste and creed will be deeper and more enduring and more unifying than friendships formed amongst mere men."

The Hon'ble the RAJA OF PITHAPURAM :—"Mr. President, I beg to second the resolution moved by my Hon'ble friend Mr. Raja. I understand that at present there is no provision for Panchama women. I think it is a great drawback. It is a well-known fact that widows who do not belong to the Brahman caste are generally poorer than the Brahman widows, and especially the Panchamas are so. It goes without saying that those who are poorer and more helpless should be cared for more by the Government. By that I do not mean to say that the Brahman widows should be left helpless. I do want the Government to help those Brahman widows who are really poor ; but at the same time I request the Government to provide for other castes, and especially for the depressed classes whom we Hindus have been treating with contempt to the disgrace of our community. As regards the present widows' home it is situated in a very healthy locality ; and it is but proper that, even if there are certain homes for other

communities in other localities, all these should be brought together and kept in the best locality possible; thereby clearly showing to the public that the Government do not favour any one caste but look upon all classes alike. With these few remarks I second the resolution."

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur V. K. RAMANUJA ACHARIYAR:—"Mr. President, I have every sympathy for the elevation of the depressed classes, and members of these classes have been admitted freely into local bodies and into all boys' schools, but our women are not so liberal. They are very conservative. This Brahman Widows' Home was maintained by Miss Subbalakshmi Ammal out of funds obtained by public subscription. Government undertook to give scholarships. If this is an eyesore to the non-Brahmans, as the Hon'ble Mr. Raja said, and if they dislike the Government giving grants to them, by all means let them withdraw the grant; but do not compel them to take Panchama girls into their hostels. I think social reform will then be going at a very rapid pace. I know if this resolution is accepted and enforced, one result will follow. The school will be shut up and we, Brahmans, who have been anxiously waiting to get school-mistresses of a high order will be prevented from doing so. But we shall not despair. We shall maintain the school out of subscriptions collected among ourselves. I am not anxious that the Brahman widows should go and teach in the families of non-Brahmans. I am not anxious that they should go and offer their services, but we want their services for ourselves. It is now open to the Government to say whether they will help the Brahman widows. They may help non-Brahman widows and they may have as many hostels as there are castes. I have no objection. But if they want to yield to the Hon'ble Mr. Raja's request, namely, to the admission of girls of the class whom he represents, let them withdraw the grant. Let them not insult them by insisting upon their taking in the Panchama girls."

The Hon'ble the ZAMINDAR OF PARLAKIMEDI:—"Mr. President, I strongly support the resolution moved by the Hon'ble Mr. Raja. The Madras Brahman Widows' Home should, I think, be termed as the Madras Widows' Home, and made accessible to widows of all communities. It is a Government institution financed by public funds. So, in these days of advancement and culture, to say that we give it only to one community and none to others is rather hard. No favouritism, I think, on any ground should be shown to any community whatever. The Government should be liberal in their dealings to the ratepayers and of course if the Government are going to say that they are going to provide widows' homes to different communities, I have nothing to say. But I think it will be an impossibility in the range of practical politics. As you know, Sir, the number of different communities in this Presidency is great. With these few words, I support the resolution moved by the Hon'ble Mr. Raja."

The Hon'ble Mr. B. V. NARASIMHA AYYAR:—"Mr. President, I wish to intervene at this stage because, I am afraid, the facts we are discussing are not well known. The name 'Brahman Widows' Home' has led many people to misconceive the institution. It is not a home in which the Brahman widows are all received and separate education imparted so that it has now to be converted into a students' hostel to which various communities should be admitted. I shall mention what it is, in the first place. It is at present nothing but a students' hostel.

"Every one in the Brahman Widows' Home is a student studying in the Girls' school in the Big street, Triplicane. With reference to this school, I may point out that this Brahman Widows' hostel, as I may call it, is not the only hostel attached. There are two other hostels of which one is called the Hindu Home. The girls who are staying in it belong to all other castes, excluding the depressed classes and the Brahman widows. Next there is the Christian Girls' Home or hostel which receives only Christian girls. So it is incorrect to suppose that the Brahman Widows' Home is a unique institution maintained for the benefit of the Brahman widows only and that there is nothing corresponding to it for other communities. This is the radical misconception at the bottom of this resolution. I do not know whether the arguments of the Hon'ble the Raja of Parlakimedi that everything should be opened for every class, will be accepted by the members of his class and whether they will say 'mix up all classes, mix up all institutions.' I do not know whether they will go so far because of the theoretical advantage of having perfect equality of treatment. We must take facts as we find them. No doubt it is the work of reformers to minimize, as far as possible, the rigours of caste, but it is one thing to desire movement in that direction and another to mistake ideals for facts. Let us by all means have another non-Brahman hostel and another Christian hostel, and a Panchama hostel. What would my friend say to the institution under Mr. Macphail, the Christian College, where both of us studied? Would he advise the mixing up of the hostels attached to the college?"

The Hon'ble Mr. M. C. RAJA:—"It is a mission institution; it is not maintained from public funds."

The Hon'ble Mr. B. V. NARASIMHA AYYAR:—"I am glad that my friend points out the distinction. It is quite true that so far as the Government institutions are concerned, it is a different matter. We are responsible for Government institutions and we are luckily not responsible for mission institutions which may not take his advice. The Christian college authorities will find it absolutely impossible to accept it. We will find our teachers there desire far more earnestly the progress of the country than many others who advocate social reform;

yet they find it impossible to adopt his advice, for, if it was possible to do so, the teachers in the Christian college would have admitted Panchamas in the various caste hostels. It is clearly not practical politics there. It is equally clear that it is not practical politics at all to talk of mixing up hostels here. The Hon'ble Mr. M. C. Raja points in his resolution to the desirability of having separate boarding arrangements corresponding to the Victoria Hostel. What is taking place there and in the Queen Mary's hostel? The same arrangements have been made in respect of the Triplicane school. We have got the Brahman widow students put in the Widows' Home, the Christian ladies put in the Christian ladies' hostel. It is exactly like the Queen Mary's College arrangements. There we have got separate boarding arrangements, one for Christians and one for non-Brahmans and one for Brahmans. It is not necessary that, wherever Government money shall be spent there shall be no caste distinction. If the Honourable Mover realized that this Home is one of the three hostels run exactly on the lines of the Christian college hostels, he would not have come up with this resolution. I understand that applications are not forthcoming from Panchamas for a home for their lady students, as female education is not sufficiently advanced among them. Mr. Raja must rather work in that direction and not ask that in the Brahman Widows' Home the Panchama community be admitted. Unfortunately the sentiment against such admission is so deep-rooted. I would ask you, Sir, what would happen to this institution if the Hon'ble Mr. Raja's proposition is accepted. You would have to shut it up. Among Brahmans, perhaps among males, there are a large number of reformers, but ladies, especially widows, are conservative. You cannot expect them all at once to understand that the Panchama also is a fellow creature and every Panchama is a brother or sister. If the resolution is passed, it will ruin the Widows' Home which has done very good and useful work so far. I hope the Hon'ble Mr. Raja would practically show proof of his sympathy with widows by not trying to wreck the only institution which is doing such useful work. I am entirely at one with the Hon'ble Mr. M. C. Raja that, as far as possible, we must recognize equality, but there are limits, and I hope the Hon'ble Mr. Raja will agree with me that there are limits which we cannot get over, and that we ought not to ruin the institution in attempting to work out the principle of equality. I think the Hon'ble the Rajah of Parlakimedi was quite right in enunciating general principles. Are you able to transfer the theory into practice? The application of the principle will be a difficult matter. I visited this institution twice; and I know that the adoption of Mr. Raja's proposition would be to ruin a very valuable institution which the Government can boast of."

The Hon'ble Mr. R. LITTLEHAILES:—"Mr. President, I must thank the Honourable Member from Salem, in the first instance for studying the facts in connexion with the resolution, and secondly for explaining these facts before the Council. I should like merely to supplement a few statements which have been already made. At the present moment we have, in connexion with the Triplicane Secondary and Training School for Women, three hostels. In one of these hostels, Brahmans are admitted, in the second of these, non-Brahman Caste Hindus, and in the third, Indian Christians are admitted. That, sir, is the present position. We have three hostels, each with a separate building, two of which are rented and the third is owned by Government. Each hostel has its own arrangements and each is a separate dwelling and boarding institution. At a meeting of this Council held on the 10th March last, recommendations were made that a hostel be established for Panchama children on the lines of the other hostels. The present position is that we have accommodation and boarding arrangement for every kind of girl except the Panchamas. It is true that we have at present no institution for the Panchamas But it was pointed out to the Honourable Mover in March last that if any Panchama girl would be forthcoming for study in the institution, suitable arrangements would be made for boarding, on exactly the same lines as arrangements are at present made for other classes. With that assurance the Honourable Mover withdrew the resolution, if I remember right.

"The old Ice-house which is the largest building we have at present, is full. We have nearly 100 Braman girls boarding in that institution and we cannot admit any more. If we have more Brahman widows coming along, we should be compelled to open a second hostel for Brahmans, or whatever class of community it is which desires to seek admission in the Secondary and Training School, Triplicane. The Honourable Mover has quoted two examples of hostels, one in the resolution itself and the other in his speech. May I ask him if he has been to the Queen Mary's College for Women and the Victoria Students' hostel? If he has been over to the Queen Mary's College, he will know that we have at the present moment four separate buidings, one of which is rented and the other three are Government property. Arrangements have been made so that all castes and communities are joined together not in the same building or in the same room, but each in a separate building in which classes who have interests in common, who have habits in common and who find it congenial to live together are placed together. They have their own boarding arrangements, so that the analogy of the Queen Mary's college put forward by the Honourable Member is scarcely a perfect one.

"Let me turn to the Victoria Students' Hostel. I speak with a considerable amount of first-hand knowledge, since I was warden of that hostel some time ago. That institution, with the exception of one single room, is so divided that each room will hold one or two students only. Owing to lack of hostel accommodation these rooms, which were originally intended for two students each, now hold three students. But in the allocation of rooms, a matter which the warden takes into his own hands, persons belonging to the same district if possible, to the same caste if possible, and to the same sub-caste as far as possible, are placed together in one and the

same room, so that in the Victoria Students' Hostel, the students live, brahman with brahman, a non-brahman with a non-brahman, a telugu student with a telugu student, a tamil student with a tamil student, a nayar with a nayar and so on. That is the arrangement that we have in the Victoria Hostel, and, as far as possible, boarding arrangements for all castes are separate.

"If the Council will bear with me in following the analogy, it will see that the hostels which are accessible to the Government Secondary and Training School, Triplicane, are exactly analagous, so far as possible, to what exist in the Queen Mary's College and the Victoria Hostel. Incidentally I may mention, and the Honourable Member from Salem will bear me out, when I mention that that building is composed mainly of accommodation of large rooms and large verandahs, each of which holds about 10 students. If we wish to carry out the recommendations of the Honourable Mover we should make structural alterations and construct small rooms in place of the present large rooms that we have. The expense would be such that I fear I should not be entitled to recommend it to Government, in view of the fact that we have at present all the necessary arrangements. Let us carry out the argument further. If we divide the Ice-house into various separate rooms and if we admit the members of the various castes, the result would be additional expense, because we would have to duplicate or triplicate the existing boarding arrangements and thereby multiply the cost of the establishment of these institutions.

"I submit to this Council that the arrangement that we have at present is both more suitable and more economical than any other. I have no doubt that this Council has the financial interests of the administration at heart. Before sitting down, I would like to say a word with regard to the partiality of Government alleged by the Hon'ble Mr. M. C. Raja. The position, as I have explained, is one of administrative and financial convenience. There is no preferential treatment given to one class over any other class. It is unfortunate that the name Brahman Widows' Home has been taken up. As a matter of fact, it is not only a Brahman Widows' Home. It was started in the year 1912, if I remember rightly, with 4 inmates. It has at present expanded to considerably over a hundred inmates in the hostels for women. The instructions issued by the Department of Public Instruction are that whenever funds allowed, for Panchamas are insufficient for the inspecting officers to grant scholarships to any deserving cases, a report has to be submitted to the Director of Public Instruction with a view to additional scholarships being sanctioned by him or for making applications to Government. In exactly the same way, the procedure is followed whenever any help is required by non-Brahman women, who are prepared to devote their lives to the teaching or medical profession. When an application is made, funds are practically always available for the grant of scholarships to the various applicants. If at any time it is found that the hostel building that we at present use for one particular community is too large, that is to say if the accommodation exceeds the demand, the department will at once make other arrangements so that the total number of persons who desire admission may always find accommodation. Having pointed out to the Honourable Member that we are actually doing what is asked for in the resolution, I hope the resolution will not be pressed."

The Hon'ble Mr. B. VENKATAPATI RAJU :—"Mr. President, I rise to say a few words on behalf of other non-brahmans as though those who have spoken are averse to the prosperity and progress of Brahmin widows. The Hon'ble Mr. M. C. Raja and the Hon'ble the Raja of Pithapuram spoke about it. First of all, I would urge that the principle on which the Hon'ble Mr. M. C. Raja based his argument is practically accepted by the Government, because a few days back they have issued a circular to all the boards and municipalities that public money ought not to be spent on any account unless it is made open to all classes, creeds and communities, and therefore Mr. Raja might be completely satisfied with that. Does Mr. M. C. Raja want an Indian Members' cloak room to be placed close to that of the European Members' cloak room? These things are done to suit the habits of the various people. Do you want to fight for such petty matters? If the Hon'ble Mr. Raja has got a number of people and wants separate accommodation perfectly, the Government must give accommodation and everyone of us would equally sympathise with such a request. If it is possible for all the social reformers in India and all the members who speak here and the Government to induce half the number of Brahman ladies to associate with Panchama girls, I am sure they will no more be widows, because they would re-marry. Unless they are reformed, they will not give up their old habits. Moreover, the Raja of Parlakimedi suggests that the widows will only be Brahmin widows. Most of the other classes will not have widows, because they will re-marry."

The Hon'ble the ZAMINDAR OF PARLAKIMEDI :—"There are Kshatriya widows also because they do not re-marry at all."

The Hon'ble Mr. B. VENKATAPATI RAJU :—"There are also widows of several other classes. But there will not be as many widows in other castes as there are in Brahmins. I congratulate both the Rajah of Pithapuram and the Rajah of Parlakimedi on the principle advocated by them. There will be a day when these two Zemindar representatives in our Presidency will come down to say that they do not want class representations and privileges and that they want to be with Mr. M. C. Raja to work for the elevation of the country. That is a day for which we all pray. I congratulate them on their strong principle that hereafter there should be no distinction between caste and caste, between man and man. The Hon'ble Mr. M. C. Raja has got the support of the Government for his principle, and hence I hope he does not press his resolution."

The Hon'ble Mr. P. SIVA RAO :—"I wish to say a few words in regard to this matter, because I had the pleasure of driving to this institution which has proved an eye-sore to the Hon'ble Mr. Raja. With the Hon'ble Mr. B. V. Narasimha Ayyar I tried to find out what was wrong with this institution and both of us were of an open mind, and if there were any defects, we wanted to suggest some improvements in the working of the institution to the Government. We had a long interview with the lady superintendent of that institution, Miss Subbalakshmiammal. She was trying to explain what the widows' home really meant. The principal institution is the Secondary School, which is run for girls situated, I believe. in Thulasingaperumal Koil Street and the widows' home is a hostel attached to it. As was well explained by the Honourable the Director of Public Instruction, there are three such hostels attached to that school. I do not know whether the Hon'ble Mr. Raja was drawing the attention of this council to any disparity in the treatment to the widows of this particular community or whether he was pointing out any particular restrictions that operated against them.

"The Hon'ble Mr. Raja did not quote even one instance in which a panchama widow—I do not know whether panchama widows are not allowed to re-marry—applied for admission into any of these hostels and whether she was refused admission. The Director of Public Instruction was telling us that every application had been given all consideration possible. So if we try to analyse the grievances of the Hon'ble Mr. Raja, it would appear that the Home has excited his jealousy and that he only envies the lot of these Brahman widows. Of course the building where the Home is, is a splendid one ; I used to spend my college days there when I was studying in the Law College.

"Mr. Raja has quoted the parallel of the Queen Mary's College. I have tried to ascertain what is being done there. As pointed out by the Director of Public Instruction, there too the girls do not live all under one roof. There are four separate buildings—one for Christians, one for non-brahmans, one for Brahmans and one for others. Even in the Victoria Hostel also there are separate quarters provided for Tamils, Telugus. Canarese, Muhammadans and Christians and so forth. Would the Hon'ble Mr. Raja for the sake of social reform ask all these people to mess together so that this might promote fellowship, comradeship and unity? He says that he must rub shoulders with the Brahmans. Is this a reasonable grievance to be brought forward before the Members of the Legislative Council ?

"I also took care to ascertain from the Lady Superintendent, who was kind enough to explain to me the beneficient objects of the institution, and also to mention to me that there are some well-to-do ladies in the home who pay for their expenses. The Government grant scholarships only to the poor widows and absolutely there is no grievance to be brought forward before the Council.

"As for the support which the resolution has received in the hands of the Raja of Pithapuram I would ask whether there was not the Newington College which received the warmest support from Government. The Zamindars—Is not the Rajkumar College specially intended for instruction to the sons of Chiefs and Zamindars ? Would Mr. Raja come forward to-morrow and fight against these institutions ? There are also some European schools, where special instruction is being given to European boys. Would he come forward and say that these institutions should be abolished, or that as the Government are spending the taxpayers' money on these institutions, panchamas also should be admitted there ?

"Mr. Raja's desire appears to be not so much to ameliorate or remove the disability which his community are suffering from, but seems to be rather to assert his own previleges and to effect a piece of social reform by executing action. I am not here to justify any caste system or the view of the orthodox community."

The Hon'ble the RAJA OF PITHAPURAM :—"May I just remind the Hon'ble Mr. Siva Rao that the Newington College was only intended for a particular class ? Classes exist all over the world, but caste exists only in India. I request the Hon'ble Mr. Siva Rao and the Hon'ble Mr. Venkatapatti Raju to remember that."

The Hon'ble Mr. P. SIVA RAO :—"I have been forcibly reminded by the Raja of Pithapuram that the Newington College was meant for the protection of a privileged class, but caste is only a petrified class. If he wants to retain the privilege of a certain class of people I do not see why he should not apply the same principle to the protection of a certain caste. They all exist on the same principle.

"This widows' home is doing splendid work. It is meant for the protection of the unfortunate Brahman ladies who, according to the customs of their caste, are prohibited from re-marrying, and the Government have taken upon themselves to educate them, to teach them useful arts probably to enable them to earn their livelihood and to make them useful citizens. I cannot see why anybody should be dissatisfied with this. It is perfectly open to Mr. Raja to ask for a separate hostel or for accommodation in the Christian hostel attached to it so long as he does not insist on his associating with orthodox brahmans."

The Hon'ble the Rev. E. M. MACPHAIL :—"I am going to ask the Hon'ble Mr. Raja to be good enough to withdraw his proposition because I think he has achieved his object. I do not think there is the least chance of his resolution being carried after what has been said by the Director of Public Instruction and one or two other members, and I think it is not desirable that his proposition should be carried.

"The Hon'ble Mr. Narasimha Ayyar has pointed out that in the college, of which I have the honour to be the head, we have different hostels for different castes. In some cases we have hostels which contain more than one caste. The fact of the matter is that it is of the greatest importance in every country and especially in India to recognise facts. There is no use trying to pretend that in this country there is nothing in the nature of caste. I think that what was in the Hon'ble Mr. Raja's mind in bringing forward this resolution was the feeling that probably a great deal more money was being spent for the benefit of a particular community than ought to be spent. In other words, that a large number of the Brahmans, who are quite able to pay for their education are getting their education paid for them by means of scholarships. I jump to this conclusion from the questions which the Hon'ble Mr. Raja asked and which curiously enough the Government was unable to answer. These indicate a suspicion on his part with regard to the kind of people who are benefiting by this hostel and the question he wishes to get at is whether a large amount of public money is not being spent on the education of people who can afford to pay for it. If the Government had been able to reassure the Hon'ble Mr. Raja on this point, I do not think Mr. Raja would have felt so much.

"I am always glad when the Hon'ble Mr. Raja brings forward such a resolution. It has such extremely good results on the Hon'ble Mr. Narasimha Ayyar and the Hon'ble Mr. Siva Rao, for it leads them to advocate caution and the desirability of changing slowly. I sympathise entirely with the Hon'ble Mr. Narasimha Ayyar in the remarks which he made with regard to the effect which this resolution might have in destroying this institution.

"I know the Hon'ble Mr. Siva Rao is moving a resolution that all Indians should share retiring rooms with Europeans. I would ask him whether he would not apply the principle which he is preaching now when he comes to move his resolution."

The Hon'ble Diwan Bahadur Sir P. TYAGARAYA CHETTI :—"Sir, I am very thankful to the Hon'ble Mr. Macphail for having spoken all that I wanted to say. The question is a very simple one, whether the tax-payer's money should be spent upon one class and very little of it should be spent on the other class. The Honourable the Director of Public Instruction has told us that there is a hostel for Brahman widows, there is a hostel for non-Brahman widows and there is a hostel for Christians. Am I to understand that the hostel provided for Brahman widows is of the same kind of building as what is proposed for non-Brahman widows and Christian widows? Am I to understand from my friends the Hon'ble Mr. Narasimha Ayyar and the Hon'ble Mr. Siva Rao that the buildings for all these are of the same kind? Is there no difference made? From what I have heard the unfortunate Christians are placed in some corner in Triplicane and the unfortunate non-Brahmans are placed in another corner, whereas the Brahman widows are placed in a beautiful splendid mansion in the beach costing perhaps several lakhs of rupees and additions are being made now. Is there any comparison? As the Hon'ble Mr Raja says, it is an eye-sore. I think any reasonable man would think that it is a cause for irritation to keep these unfortunate non-Brahman widows in a corner of Triplicane when the Brahman widows are placed in the beach in such grand buildings. These people can afford to pay for it. I suppose that most of the widows that are now lodged there can pay. They are all well-to-do people. If well-to-do people are cared for so much and helped by Government, I say it is wrong on principle. If all classes are placed on the same level, I say it is all right. Is it so? I think no. I do not suppose that the Government will say that it is so. Therefore I say it is wrong on principle to give one kind of accommodation to one set of people and another kind of accommodation to another set of people. Let the Government treat all alike. That is what I want."

The Hon'ble Mr. B. V. NARASIMHA AYYAR :—"A word of personal explanation. The Hon'ble Sir P. Tyagaraya Chetti has referred to me in his speech. He has taken for granted that well-to-do pupils are paid fat stipends in the widows' hostel. I did not advocate any difference of treatment between classes. It is not correct to say that the majority of the pupils there are well-to-do widows. In fact there are three well-to-do pupils there who pay for their lodging and boarding. The others get Rs. 10 or Rs. 15.—not a very high rate compared with the Rs. 25 stipend paid to each female pupil in Mysore."

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur N. SUBBA RAO :—"I was glad to hear the speakers who preceded me because I was able to hear two sides of the question from different points of view. I think we cannot blink facts and we cannot blink the social conditions of India. We have these great groups of castes which have not yet been knocked down and we know that there are communities which have been enjoying certain privileges hitherto which they would not give up without a fight, and I know those who have not been enjoying the privileges would like to get similar privileges even after a fight with those who have been enjoying these privileges. What I mean, sir, is that it is not really that the Hon'ble Mr. Raja wants to, convert this into a big hostel in which Panchama girls, non-Brahman girls and Christian girls should jostle with each other and mess with each other. I believe his idea seems to be, that he wants that the Government should look to the interests of the community as a whole, should not make any difference between the several communities, and try to bring amity and advancement among all sections. With the spirit of this resolution, I quite agree. Of course the Hon'ble Mr. Littlehailes, who spoke on behalf of Government, tried to keep the balance even, and he said that there have been hostels both for Brahman widows and non-Brahmans and Christians and so on. He also said that there are separate buildings and

separate messing arrangements. I beg to support the resolution from a broader point of view. We are all talking of democracy. We should consider every one as brothers and we do not want to see that in social and other matters we should keep each other at arm's length. That is a position which I cannot bear for a moment. As was pointed out by the Hon'ble Sir P. Tyagaraya Chetti, the Brahman widows are enjoying nice sea breeze, whereas non-Brahmans and Christians are getting the same from the gutters of Triplicane and not the salubrious breeze from the seaside. I want that the Government might consider this question in the light as they have been considering the Queen Mary's College and Victoria Hostel arrangements. I think almost all of us have seen the old Ice House, the present Widows' Home. It is enclosed by a high wall which may be very appropriate for Brahman widows as no one can see from outside—something like a prison house. On the Mylapore side, there are a number of dirty and insanitary houses and any amount of land adjoining it. What I want to suggest is that all these may be acquired and they may be domolished and we can have two or three blocks of buildings in a continuous place, and all classes of girl students can be accommodated. But at the same time I want that all these Brahmans, non-Brahmans and Christians must be under the same roof, or at least in the same compound and consider themselves as sisters and work up for the good of the country. I want all girls to be under the same roof with separate messing arrangements because it is not easy for us to jump at social reform all at once. I therefore suggest to Government that there should be a hostel common to all, with separate messing arrangements.

"The Hon'ble Sir P. Tyagaraya Chetti will be satisfied, as all students will get sea-breeze. So with these few remarks I wish to support the resolution."

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur A. T. G. M. AHMAD TAMBI MARAKAYYAR :—"Though I have no interest to get a Muhammadan widows' hostel I should like to say a few words. I thought it proper that I should say something. We have been discussing it for a long time and it is better that we come to a conclusion soon. I know there is a good deal of talk outside by the non-Brahman community and others that the Government have made a great mistake in providing a Brahman widows' hostel. I do not know if the time has come for the women of all castes to live together ; I do not know whether it would be workable. The best plan I would suggest to you, Brahman friends, is that they would sooner convert themselves into Muhammadans and make all widows marry. Then there will be no trouble. Again, I would ask the Hon'ble Mr. Raja if there are any widows of his community available. There is no necessity for a widows' home for Panchamas. It is only the Brahman widows that are suffering for want of a house. It does not mean that I am pleading for Brahmans. My opinion is that, it would be better if these people would get rid of these widows and soon vacate the house called the Brahman Widows' Home. It was given by the Government purely for the Brahmans. If they vacate it there will be no difficulty and waste of time of the Council in asking for a separate students' hostel for each community. I will quote one instance. So far as my experience goes, though the European gentlemen make no distinction between a low caste man and a high caste man in England they are still following the scruples of community ; especially they do not admit us as members of their club so that we can mess together and live together. As a matter of fact, in high class European clubs they do not include even an European working in a workshop as a member of the club to mingle freely with them and live together and play billiards and tennis. They always make this distinction in India. And so, is the time come to ask Brahman women to live together with women of other castes ? I do not think it is right on our part to say so as some of my friends said. My view is that the time has not come to make that unique arrangement."

The Hon'ble Diwan Bahadur T. DESIKA ACHARIYAR :—"Sir, the question of admitting Panchamas to schools and institutions of this kind is bound to raise difficult and delicate situations. In Totiyam, a village in the District of Trichinopoly, by admitting Panchamas into the Elementary school there it lost 70 per cent of its pupils. I am faced with a similar situation in Lalgudi by the admission of a few Panchama pupils, and the whole school is likely to lose a good portion of its strength. A similar situation has arisen in Jayakondasholapuram. I am mentioning all these things because if even in the case of elementary schools where young Panchama children get admission, we experience so much difficulty, we cannot legislate in this country to abolish all caste distinctions all at once, which is what by implication the Hon'ble Mr. Raja desires. We cannot by a resolution say that all caste distinctions should cease and that all castes must inter-marry and inter-dine. Perhaps such a proposition would be as practicable as the proposition of the Hon'ble Mr. Marakkayar that all Brahmans should become Muhammadans and thus put an end to the trouble raised by the unfortunate condition of young Brahmin widows. If the Hon'ble Mr. Raja has any grievance with reference to the community he represents, the correct thing would be for him to ask the Government to spend the same amount of money on behalf of the widows of his community and to give them the same kind of treatment as is alleged to be accorded to Brahmin widows. If the Panchamas were to be admitted into the Brahman Widows' Home, that home would have no members at all. Obviously this is not a correct solution of the difficulty. I feel that if panchama widows want the same treatment as Brahman widows and high-caste non-Brahman widows, Panchama widows should be given liberal treatment ; but I think that the proposition put forward before this Council is not likely to do any good to the Panchamas, while it will ruin the Brahman Widows' Home. The present resolution is very like that relating to the wells which Panchamas wanted access to. If

Panchamas would not go and draw water from Panchama wells at all and wanted agraharam wells thrown open to them, what were the Brahmans to do? The Brahmans should go without water as they would not go to the Panchama wells. In a country of diverse castes and creeds such propositions seem not to be in the range of practical politics. I therefore oppose the resolution."

The Hon'ble Mr. M. C. RAJA :—" Mr. President, I should like to make a few remarks. My friend the Hon'ble Mr. Narasimha Ayyar said that it would not be possible for us to make a common widows' home and to treat other classes equally. But these Brahman widows who are now in the Brahman Widows' Home are going to be the future teachers and nurses and if they cannot regard other classes as their sisters, how is it possible for them to teach and help other communities? The Hon'ble Mr. Littlehailes has said that there are three hostels now, one for the Brahman widows, one for Indian Christians and one for non-Brahmans. It is true that there are three, but the non-Brahman hostel and the Indian Christian hostel are situated in a crowded locality where the inmates breathe foul air. Whereas these Brahman widows enjoy the sea breeze on the marina. I wish to know if Mr. Littlehailes had at any time visited these two homes. I heard that some of my Brahman friends here visited the Brahman Widows' Home this morning, but they failed to visit the other two homes. If they had only visited the other two, I am sure they would have found out that the facilities offered here are far greater than the facilities offered in the other two homes. After all the money spent on these Brahman widows by Government, will be a waste, if these widows are not going to treat others as equals.

" My main idea is to bring the other two hostels also side by side with the Brahman Widows' Home on the marina. I think the Hon'ble Mr. Littlehailes has found out a solution ; he has stated that if more Brahman widow are forthcoming the Government are prepared to construct another hostel side by side with the Brahman Widows' Home. When the Government is prepared to build another hostel, if more Brahman widows are forthcoming, why not they put up that building now and house the poor non-Brahman and Christian widows there side by side with the Brahman Widows' Home on the marina? The Hon'ble Mr. T. Desika Achariyar has sounded a note of warning and stated that 75 per cent of the pupils in one of the schools left the institution when Panchamas were admitted. In 1837, Rev. John Anderson felt the same difficulty in the General Assembly School. When he began to admit Panchama boys, the caste parents of the caste boys withdrew all their children and the school became empty. So there may be some stray cases, but the Government need not be afraid of those. After all, the Hon'ble Mr. Macphail has caught the right point. Larger sums are spent on a particular class, the Brahman community. We form six millions of the population and the Brahmans I believe $1\frac{1}{2}$ millions and the money spent on the education of Brahman widows is far greater than the money spent on the education of Panchamas and therefore I say the Government is partial towards the Brahmans. I am however, taking the advice of my master Mr. Macphail in this matter, and I now beg to withdraw the resolution."

The resolution was by leave withdrawn.

RESOLUTION *RE* RESETTLEMENT OF THE VIZAGAPATAM DISTRICT.

The Hon'ble Mr. C. V. S. NARASIMHA RAJU moved the following resolution :—

" X. This Council recommends to the Governor in Council that, in the resettlement of the Vizagapatam district, orders may be passed that classification by settlement officers should be done regarding resumed inams in the district and assessment be fixed thereafter."

In doing so, he said :—" Mr. Vice-President, after the first settlement a good number of service inams were resumed by the Government. When these were resumed, classifiers were not appointed—I mean by classifiers persons who are acquainted with the scientific classification of the soils—but the business was entrusted to tahsildars who were not acquainted with the principles of classification of the soils. The tahsildars and their subordinates, the revenue inspectors, made a certain classification of these soils, their main object being to fix the assessment on a level with the existing rent or kist on those lands at the time of their resumption. Now I understand that in the resettlement a percentage enhancement is to be made on these inams and that no classification is to be made by settlement officers. If this process is to be continued for each re-settlement, the assessment on these lands would certainly continue to be very high. As it is in a good number of cases, the assessment is high, simply because the kist on these lands paid to the inamdars was high and the tahsildars only classified these lands so as to yield the same assessment to the Government. If a scientific classification is made, in a good number of cases, the assessment will be reduced but it is reasonable that the cultivating pattadar should have a reasonable rent fixed thereupon, instead of being asked to pay the old assessment with the percentage enhancement as fixed on other Government lands in this district. I am aware that the work of classification will be very extensive but the justice of the case demands it. In the case of resumed inams in Government villages there will not be that difficulty. Because the classification will be that of the surrounding lands. But in this district most of the lands are zamindari lands and there are no existing classified lands surrounding

them and so the hardship is greater. Therefore I hope that the Government will consider the justice of the case and order the classification of these lands before any enhancement is ordered on them. With these remarks I commend this resolution for the acceptence of the Government."

The Hon,ble Mr. B. VENKATAPATI RAJU :—"I beg to second this resolution."

The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. TODHUNTER :—"Mr. President, in this case again the Honourble Mover, in his zeal for his constituency, has imposed upon the Council a debate on a matter which is not of much general interest. I must, however, thank him for having brought before the Council a concrete instance of a case in which it is not desirable to limit the process of resettlement to a percentage enhancement, that is to say, a case in which he considers reclassification necessary.

"As he has indicated, the resumed inams to which his resolution refers fall into several different classes. In the first place, there are those which lie in the midst of ryotwari land. These will be treated like the ryotwari land which is adjacent to them and no further action is necessary. Then there is a large class of what are known as unlocalisable inams. Some of these are merely excesses on title-deed areas and if the whole is resumed of course the excess is resumed with the rest and can be classified. But there are others which are really unlocalisable because the boundaries by which they are described can no longer be found or because they have been merged in larger holdings or for similar reasons. In these cases I think it must be clear that, since we cannot find the land, we cannot classify it. A third set of cases again are the resumed inams in whole inam villages. I don't know if these are the cases which the honourable mover referred to when he spoke of the action of the tahsildars in respect of their assessment. A block survey and classification was carried out in these villages in 1917 for the purpose of levy of land-cess. I have so far no reason to suppose that that classification was inaccurate, and if it was accurate, there seems to be no reason why in these cases we should not apply the new settlement rates to the classification made in 1917.

"There remains the difficult case of the resumed inams in zamindari villages. There are no less than 3,324 acres of these scattered over 264 villages which are to be found in all the fourteen taluks of the district. Now, as the honourable mover admits, it would be a very serious business to carry out a classification of this very large number of scattered areas and before I can give him any undertaking that they shall be reclasssfied, I wish to find out what is the basis upon which the inam settlement was conducted. It is quite true that there is a difference between the average rates fixed at the inam settlement and the average rates fixed at the ryotwari settlement and I am having inquiries made as to what was the plan followed in arriving at the former rates. In addition to that, it is necessary to ascertain what a reclassification would cost and I have called for an estimate of that also.

"I hope the Honourable Member will realise from this that we are going carefully into the whole matter and doing our best to do justice to his constituency."

The Hon'ble Mr. C. V. S. NARASIMHA RAJU :—"The classes which I mainly referred to are the classes of land last referred to by the Hon'ble Mr. C. G. Todhunter. There are inams situated in zamindari villages and there the assessment is very heavy. Of course, the Government will have to undergo heavy cost and trouble in reclassifying them. But my only submission is, that justice of the case demands once for all a scientific classification should be made and assessment should be fixed thereafter. For the time being the tahsildars themselves make the assessment, but if that assessment is to be continued and the enhancement is to be given effect to for each settlement, it will be a great hardship; and I think the Government will see their way to fully examine the case and order a reclassification whatever be the cost, as the justice of the case demands on the part of Government to incur this extra expenditure. With these few remarks and on the assurance of the Hon'ble Mr. Todhunter, I withdraw my resolution."

The resolution was by leave withdrawn.

RESOLUTION *RE* EXPENDITURE OF TASDIK ALLOWANCES.

The following resolution stood in the name of the Hon'ble Mr. B. V. Narasimha Ayyar.

"**XI. This Council recommends to His Excellency in Council that a committee be appointed to examine whether the tasdik allowances are properly expended and sufficient, and to suggest remedies for defects noted.**"

The Hon'ble Mr. B. V. NARASIMHA AYYAR :—"I do not move the resolution."

With the permission of the Hon'ble the Vice-President the rosolution was withdrawn.

RESOLUTION *RE* ADMISSION OF INDIANS TO THE RETIRING ROOMS ON RAILWAYS.

The Hon'ble Mr. P. SIVA RAO :—"The resolution that I propose to move reads thus :—

'**XII. This Council recommends to His Excellency the Governor in Council that the retiring rooms on railways may be thrown open to Indians also.**'

"There are certain stations such as Guntakal, Arkonam, Renigunta and Bellary where retiring rooms have been provided and in the railway guide it is stated that these rooms are

intended solely for Europeans. Once I felt great necessity to go to one of these retiring rooms at Guntakal. I was told by the Stationmaster that it was only meant for Europeans. He did not even suggest that it could be extended to people living in European style. He said that the rules prevented him from admitting Indians. This is not only my own personal experience. Once an Indian Collector when he was camping at Guntakkal tried to get into one of these retiring rooms and he was not allowed the privilege. In Bellary there are two retiring rooms, one reserved for railway officials and the other intended for the European passengers.

"Last time I gave notice of this resolution, but after consulting Mr. Knapp who said that he would undertake to elicit further information in regard to this matter, I agreed to postpone it till the next meeting. The next meeting has come and I do not think the matter has been settled satisfactorily. I do not know the precise attitude of the railway authorities, whether they are willing to make these railway retiring rooms available for Indians also. I do not see any evidence of their disposition to do so. One reason that has been strongly urged is this, that originally they were intended for European and American travellers, who were not expected to find accommodation elsewhere near the railway station, suited to their requirements. That may be so. I do not say that the European should be shut out When it is not occupied by Europeans, where is the difficulty in allowing Indians as well. Then, there is as much need for an Indian to occupy these retiring rooms as there is need for an European. It is time enough that these distinctions should be thrown away. It is stated by the Railway Company that their administration is not bound to provide retiring rooms. That may be so. If they maintain them, they must throw it open to all classes; as for instance, in the railway carriages there is absolutely no distinction between Europeans and Indians in the first and second class compartments. The distinction is made only in the third class. It would be well at least if the railway company maintain two sets of rooms, one set being allotted to Indians and the other to Europeans. They do not seem to be willing to do that even. We are grossly dissatisfied that the Indians whatever their position in life may be and whatever their habits should be shut out from these rooms. The Hon'ble Mr. Narasimha Raju brought it to the notice of Government that he felt the same trouble at Bezwada also and the Hon'ble Mr. Balaji Rao Nayudu drew the attention of Government to the same matter.

"I am quite aware that we have not got control over the Railway administration and that we can only suggest and persuade them to comply with our wishes. It is sometimes threatened that if we put pressure on them they might close the existing rooms against all travellers, European or Indian. If they are so unreasonable as to close these rooms in a fit of anger simply because we try to induce them to do a certain thing, let them do so. We may also put it to them that it is not a correct attitude; as the Company is responsible for the convenience of the public, they should not resort to such threatening measure as this.

"But I am willing to look upon such an event with equanimity. I shall rather have these rooms closed against all, than have them open to one class and denied to the other class. I need not detain the Council any longer and I think the principle of the resolution must be acceptable to all. With these words, I commend the resolution to the acceptance of the Council."

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur T. BALAJI RAO NAYUDU:—"I second this resolution and beg to state that on a previous occasion, I brought forward the question about closing the retiring rooms for Indians and the Government were pleased to inform me that the results of their inquiry was that the railway company was trying to allot separate set of rooms for Indians, and that for want of accommodation to their own staff the railway company was going to close the retiring rooms at Bezwada for the use of passengers. When new station was constructed there were two sets of rooms built on either side of the bridge, one to accommodate the European gentleman and the other to accommodate Indian gentlemen. I do not know why subsequently the railway company did not want to allow first and second class Indian passengers to make use of the rooms put up for them. Later on when I put up interpellation, and probably as a result of which, it was stated that Indians living in European style can make use of the rooms. Several Indian gentlemen in the district of Kistna wanted to make use of the rooms. The Anglo-Indian Stationmaster declared that they were not living in European style. Nobody knew what the definition of living in European style was. Later on, I got a communication that the railway authorities were going to close all the rooms, so that European gentlemen also would be deprived of their rooms. My exertions to secure accommodation for Indians have resulted in the Europeans being deprived of the accommodation which they already had. This is the state of affairs as far as Bezwada is concerned. When Europeans and Indians are allowed to travel in the same first class compartments, I do not see any objection to a different set of retiring rooms being used by Indians, and if the Government cannot compel the railway company at once they may take up the question once again."

The Hon'ble Mr. L. DAVIDSON:—"I confess it came as a surprise to me to hear the Honourable Mover say that he did not know the precise attitude of the railway companies in this matter, because I have been at some pains to ascertain their attitude and to explain it to Mr. Siva Rao in advance of this meeting by means of a letter which the Secretary sent him under my instructions. His speech has shown that the mover is in fact conversant with the general outlines of the attitude of the railway companies, but I should like, Sir, with your permission to read exactly what was communicated to him as a result of the inquiries which the Hon'ble Mr. Knapp undertook to make when this resolution was first brought up. This is the letter which the Secretary sent on the 7th July.

'Dear Sir—

'With reference to your resolution in regard to the use of railway retiring rooms by Indians which you propose to move at the next meeting of the Legislative Council, you will recollect that though you gave notice of the same resolution for the meeting in March last, it was not actually moved, because the Hon'ble Mr. Knapp had in agreement with you undertaken to make inquiries in order to see whether any satisfactory arrangement could be come to with the railway administrations. I am now directed to inform you of the outcome of the inquiries made in pursuance of that undertaking.

'2. Retiring rooms were originally provided

(*a*) at certain junctions in the vicinity of which no accommodation suitable for Europeans was available, and

(*b*) at other stations for the special convenience of European and American tourists. The primary object thus was to provide facilities for the European or American traveller in places where the local conditions had created a special demand for accommodation at the railway station itself; and the rooms together with the attached domestic offices were accordingly furnished to suit the requirements of these particular sections of the travelling public.

'3. In course of time the use of the rooms was extended to all first and second class passengers being (*a*) Europeans or (*b*) Indians conforming to European habits of life. It is believed that Indians who do not live in European style generally find no great difficulty in procuring accommodation which suits their requirements at the large centres where retiring rooms are now provided, and if the rooms were now made available for this class, they might be occupied by those who do not really require them to the exclusion of those for whom the accommodation was originally provided. It would also involve some additional expense on equipment and maintenance which the railway administrations do not feel justified in incurring at present.

'4. The foregoing is a summary of the position as ascertained by inquiry, but there is one important further consideration. You are perhaps not aware that under the Indian Railways Act railway administrations are not bound to provide accommodation of this nature; their legal obligation is restricted to the provision of suitable waiting rooms. The authorities of both the South Indian Railway and the Madras and Southern Mahratta Railway are in need of further accommodation for members of their own staff and are already considering the question whether this should not be provided by utilising the retiring rooms for the purpose, in which case they would be closed to the public. If the resolution of which you gave notice is pressed, it seems probable that immediate action will be taken in that direction'."

The Hon'ble Mr. P. SIVA RAO :—"May I say a word of personal explanation. It is true that I got this communication but I thought it was a demi-official communication and I was not justified in referring to it in the Council. I got this reply."

The Hon'ble Mr. L. DAVIDSON :—"I do not think there could have been objection any to the Honourable Member's referring to that communication. It is not marked confidential in any way. In any case the Honourable Member has in fact made use of the material furnished in that communication, and in my opinion he was quite justified in doing so. But I do not think he was justified in saying that he 'did not know the precise attitude of the railway companies'; and that is why I have read out the letter.

"The Honourable Member has referred to 'certain uncomfortable details.' I do not propose to enter into any discussion of that aspect of the case; it is not suitable for debate in this Council. One of the reasons, however, why the Hon'ble Mr. Knapp wished to postpone the discussion in the first instance was to see whether an arrangement satisfactory to every one could not be arrived at in communication with the railway administrations.

"An endeavour was made to achieve that object but it has failed. We must therefore as it seems to me recognize that no satisfactory solution is at pr s ent practicable, whatever may be the case in the future, and we must recollect that in this matter the final decision rests with the railway administrations. Therefore all that we—I speak here on behalf of the Government—can properly do is to pass on the record of the proceedings of this debate to the authorities concerned in order that they may devote such further consideration to it as they may think fit.

"I had intended when I rose to speak on this resolution to begin by referring to the salutary advice given yesterday to the Hon'ble Mr. Raja by the Hon'ble Mr. Macphail when he quoted with approval from the Hon'ble Mr. Siva Rao speech on Resolution No. IX and suggested that Mr. Siva Rao might do well to apply the same principles to this resolution. The advice was to recognise the facts of the case and to bear in mind what the probable outcome of pressing the resolution would be. Now we have been told by the railway administrations that the probable outcome in this case will be the complete closure of these retiring rooms, which they are not legally bound to maintain. That is a probability, I should say, which it is worth while to bear in mind. For the rest I can only repeat that the matter not being one under the control of the Local Government all that they can do—and they are perfectly ready to do it — is to pass on the record of the proceedings of this Council to the railway administrations concerned."

The Hon'ble Mr. B. V. NARASIMHA AYYAR :—"I think I can at this stage very properly come in with an amendment which, I believe, will command the assent of a very large majority of this Council. The essence of what Mr. Siva Rao demanded has been put into it and it can be passed without any further discussion. His intention is not to be jostle with Europeans or any other class. He is not anxious that one and the same room should be provided for all, if other

15TH JULY 1920.] (*Mr. Narasimha Ayyar ; Mr. Ahmad Tambi Marakkayar ; the Vice-President ; Mr. Venkatappayya Pantulu.)*

rooms could be provided. All that he wants is that there should be no discrimination made against Indians as such and therefore I believe the sense of the entire Council will support him in demanding that 'retiring rooms on railways in this Presidency should be provided for Indians also, wherever similar provision is made for other communities, i.e., for the first and second class passengers.' That is the essence of what he has stated and I believe no reasonable exception can be taken to it in that form. Perhaps the present form implies that there is a desire to jostle with Europeans. I believe it raises unnecessary issues and the time of the Council need not be wasted in discussing what was not in the mind of Mr. Siva Rao. The basis of the complaint is that no provision is made for a large class of people when such provision can be made. Therefore I think in this shape the resolution will be acceptable to all."

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur A. T. G. M. AHMAD TAMBI MARAKKAYAR :—"I second the amendment. In doing so I wish to say a few words. I fully sympathise with the object of Mr. Siva Rao's resolution. I know as a matter of fact that the South Indian Railway have provided separate Indian retiring rooms in Tanjore and Madura. I have occupied these rooms very often. It is true that they say in their Tariff Book that these rooms are available for Indian gentlemen living in European style and manner. But it does not mean that they should wear boots and hats as Mr. Nayudu said. Only they want that we should adopt their customs. I will give an instance to explain it. Some time ago one European Port Officer, a manager of the Madura Company, another Indian gentleman and myself were travelling in a first class carriage. The Indian gentleman went to the water closet to wash his mouth. He spat in the basin his betel leaf chewings and tried to wash them out but unfortunately there was no water in the tap and so he left the basin dirty and returned. Some time afterwards the European Port Officer wanted to use the basin but he found it dirty and came away. He complained of this to me. There are such Indians, not like Mr. Siva Rao, or Mr. Nayudu, who dirty the retiring room by using it like this. It is only for this reason that the railway companies have put in such a clause in their book.

"I agree with Mr. Narasimha Ayyar's amendment. No doubt there is a good deal of outcry among Indians who are travelling in the higher classes that they are suffering for want of suitable retiring rooms. At the same time there are some things which are more urgently needed than these retiring rooms, such as waiting rooms, sun-shades and others. There is no doubt that we Indians are not well-treated by railway companies in the matter of retiring rooms and such other conveniences. I am sure the railway company will give due regard to the recommendations of the Government if they move in the matter."

The Hon'ble the VICE-PRESIDENT :—"The amendment proposed is that the whole resolution after the word 'Council' should be omitted and the following words substituted. As substituted, the resolution will read thus—

"This Council recommends to His Excellency the Governor in Council that suitable rooms on railways in this Presidency may be provided for first and second class Indians also wherever similar provision is made for other communities.'

"I say nothing about the merits of it. But it does not seem to me that this can be called an amendment to the original resolution and I regret I cannot accept it as such. It will certainly be convenient to discuss it as a fresh resolution, if notice is given, at a later meeting."

The Hon'ble Mr. B. V. NARASIMHA AYYAR :—"Would it not be taking up the time of the Council twice over the same matter ?"

The Hon'ble the VICE-PRESIDENT :—"You are out of order."

The Hon'ble Mr. K. VENKATAPPAYYA PANTULU :—"Mr. President, I support this resolution which has been ably moved by my friend the Hon'ble Mr. Siva Rao. In supporting the resolution, I am not anxious to oust the Europeans or cause any embarrassment to them but there is a real grievance and it is that even gentlemen of position and enlightenment travelling in the first or second class are not given opportunities to occupy these rooms. I know particularly in Bezwada there are a number of rooms built both for Europeans and Indians but somehow it happened that when the rooms were ready Indians were refused admission and I know an enlightened zamindar and an Indian Barrister both of them were refused admission. The zamindar wrote to me a letter and I forwarded that letter to Government and the Government were pleased to state what was stated now, i.e., that the conditions are different and the railway authorities are not willing to give it to Indians. The same has been stated to us by the Hon'ble Mr. Davidson. All the same, Sir, we do feel the grievance. The Hon'ble Mr. Macphail may point out that the Hon'ble Mr. Siva Rao is rather inconsistent in arguing his case in the matter of these railway retiring rooms, inconsistent with what he has stated with reference to the Widows' Home. Here, things are different. The passengers are willing to pay and they are not simply seeking admission for nothing. It is not for extension of patronage or favour that they seek. The question is for equal treatment, under some conditions, of respectable class of persons who are ready to pay whatever is demanded of them. Conditions may be insisted upon that the rooms must be kept clean or some penalties may be fixed; in case these rooms are spoiled that the

occupants may have to meet the charges and so on. Whatever that may be, they claim no doubt that they should also be given equal treatment and equal facilities because they also are in need of those facilities. It is stated that Indian gentlemen living in Indian fashion have got accommodation elsewhere in the towns and so they need not insist upon having accommodation in these rooms but I would state that persons coming from distant parts and ready to start again the next morning cannot find accommodation all at once in the town. At least, where there are more than one room, one may be set apart for the Indians and another room may be set apart for Europeans after making small alterations in the things required. After all these arrangements are not costly. They can be easily done. For these reasons I support the resolution."

The Hon'ble Mr. C. V. S. NARASIMHA RAJU :—"I am not really able to understand this threatening attitude of the railway authorities. If I understand the Hon'ble Mr. Davidson correctly, he made me understand that the result is the railway authorities are against giving accommodation to Europeans and Indians because there is no statutory obligation on their part to maintain retiring rooms. This attitude is not at all a correct attitude and the Government will be pleased to explain to the railway authorities that they should never take this attitude because it is their business to look to the comfort of the travelling public whether Indians or Europeans."

The Hon'ble Mr. L. DAVIDSON :—" With reference to what the Honourable Member has said, I do not think that he need interpret the attitude of the railway authorities as a direct threat in the matter. I should draw his attention to the exact words used, namely—'The authorities (of the two railway administrations) are in need of further accommodation for members of their own staff and they are already considering the question whether this should not be provided by utilizing the retiring rooms for the purposes. . . If the resolution is pressed, it seems probable that immediate action will be taken in that direction.'

" In the case of one of the two railways it had actually been proposed to close these rooms irrespective of the present resolution, and I received a copy of a draft notification of closure with effect from the 10th June, but at my request this was held in suspense."

The Hon'ble Mr. C. V. S. NARASIMHA RAJU :—" At least as far as I can understand it is really threatening. Now the Government may be pleased to bring to the notice of the railway administration that in the districts European officers as well as Indians are putting up in the same rest-house. Whether they like it or not they are obliged to do it. In the districts they are not maintaining separate rest-houses for Europeans and Indians. Nowadays the Indians have adopted the system of living in rest-houses and soon after an Indian officer or an Indian vacates a rest-house a European officer is occupying it, whether the Indian has used it in the manner described by the Hon'ble Mr. Ahmad Tambi Marakkayar or not. Whether the Indian lives in European style or not he has a right to occupy a rest-house maintained by the local board or in some cases by the Public Works Department. The same rest-houses are being occupied by Europeans. If there is no distinction in this case why should any distiniction be made in the matter of railway administration. I think the Government will do well to bring forward all these facts and convince the railway administration not to show this distinction of races in the matter of retiring rooms."

The Hon'ble Mr. T. ARUMAINATHA PILLAI :—" I rise to support the resolution now before the house. I take into consideration the fact that some of us Indians are not accustomed to use the retiring rooms in the manner in which they are intended to be used, by the railway authorities. Yet in spite of that fact, I would only request you, Sir, to take the spirit of the resolution and to see that the Indians also are provided with retiring rooms in the various railway stations. If I understand my fiend the Hon'ble Mr. Siva Rao correctly, I believe what I have said before is the correct intepretation of the resolution.

" As a matter of fact from my short experience I could well assert that on account of the refusal to provide us with any sort of retiring rooms, one had to go out and sleep outside on choultry pials and in some other places. I do not see any reason why Indians if they go in their own dress should be refused admission even in retiring rooms, whereas the same Indian, if he could only put on a hat, would be admitted into the same rooms. I submit, Sir, that the reasons that are alleged against the admission of Indians into the retiring rooms are not at all valid. I have heard from the Hon'ble Mr. Davidson a letter written by the railway authorities to the Government. When my friend the Hon'ble Mr. Narasimha Raju referred to it—that it constitutes a threat, there was refutation on the part of the Hon'ble Mr. Davidson that it was not so, but, on the other hand, that these rooms might be required at some future time,—they have not fixed the time,—for the accommodation of their own officials. They go on to say that some of these retiring rooms would have to be closed entirely. With great deference to the interpretation put upon it by the Hon'ble Mr. Davidson, I must still say that that letter contains a threat and nothing more. The railway authorities are expected to serve the interests of the public but on the other hand, if you are going to look into the attitude which has been taken by the railway authorities, one cannot but come to the conclusion that they want to be masters of the people instead of being persons who are asked to provide comforts to the people of this presidency. I

submit, Sir, that attitude of the railway authorities ought not to be tolerated. We feel it as a matter of inconvenience and one does not see any reason why this sort of difference should be tolerated between the same subjects of His Majesty, upon the broad principle that there ought to be no differences shown by any sort of institutions that are created in this country, on the ground of racial difference and that any person residing in this place, if he is prepared to abide by all the conditions that might be laid down by the authorities, should be provided with all the comforts. So I beg to support the resolution moved by the Hon'ble Mr. Siva Rao."

The Hon'ble Mr. P. SIVA RAO :—"Now, Sir, I wish first to clear myself of the charge of inconsistency that has been brought against me. It has been suggested that my attitude towards the Hon'ble Mr. Raja's resolution is inconsistent with the attitude I have taken now. I have been complaining that no accommodation whatever has been made for the Indians. I do not complain so much about the reservation of a certain room or one or two rooms exclusively for a member of any community but my complaint is that absolutely no accommodation whatever has been made for Indians at certain stations. Even when there are two rooms they do not set apart even one room for the Indians. In Bellary there are two rooms and they could easily set apart one room for the Indians. Now I have no option but to press the resolution to the end, and if they had provided one room for the Indians there I would have no quarrel at all. As regards the attitude of the railway, I am constrained to say that it is one of threat. They say that they are not willing to do it, and that they may require the additional accommodation for their own officers. Never mind, let them close it. The Hon'ble Member in charge said that the copy of the debate would be sent up. If that means that the Government are going to recommend the resolution, I am willing to withdraw. But what is the use of sending the debate, simply saying that Siva Rao moved the resolution and so and so seconded it? If they would suggest to the railway company that the proposed course is desirable, I should be willing to withdraw. Otherwise, I am going to press it to a division. It is a public utility company which is living almost upon the moneys derived from the people and if it does not care for the convenience of the people, I am really surprised at it. Indians, whatever their position may be, have got no accommodation. What accomodation have they at Guntakal, where they have to stop for hours together? As the Hon'ble Mr. Arumainatha Pillai said, we should go out and sleep on a street pial. Then, men of the position of an Indian Collector, for instance the Collector of Anantapur, and a Muhammadan Officer in the position of Mr. Riazuddin, Assistant Commissioner of Salt and Abkari, where are they to go? As regards Indians living in European style; it is a vague definition. Does it mean dress, or diet or anything else? I only ask for bare justice. I did not except so much trouble in the reception of the resolution I brought up and I was simply astounded at the way in which my resolution had met in the hands of the Government. Let the railway company behave as they will and let the Government take any attitude they will. They have to face public opinion. I have no option but to press the resolution."

The Hon'ble Mr. L. DAVIDSON :—"I have a very few words to say. I find it rather difficult to follow the position of the Hon'ble Mr. Siva Rao. I understand from what he has just been saying that he would be willing to accept the amendment proposed by the Hon'ble Mr. Narasimha Ayyar. Is this the case?"

The Hon'ble Mr. P. SIVA RAO :—"If that had not been ruled out I would have gladly accepted it."

The Hon'ble Mr. L. DAVIDSON :—"Much the same proposal was made by the Hon'ble Mr. Knapp, in the month of March. He then wrote to the Hon'ble Mr. Siva Rao and asked whether the arrangements made in the South Indian Railway would meet his views. If the Hon'ble Member will permit me, I will read part of his demi-official reply to that inquiry; it is not marked *confidential*."

The Hon'ble Mr. P. SIVA RAO :—"I have no objection."

The Hon'ble Mr. L. DAVIDSON :—"This is what Mr. Siva Rao wrote :—

'I am for the abolition of all these racial distinctions. All the rooms should be thrown open to *all*, whether Europeans or Indians, as in the case of travellers' bungalows and the railway carriages.'

"It was because of this uncompromising attitude then adopted by the Hon'ble Mr. Siva Rao that the attempt at an amicable settlement with the railway administrations broke down. I am not prepared to say what attitude they would take towards the amendment suggested by the Hon'ble Mr. Narasimha Ayyar, but on behalf of the Government I will undertake to communicate the proceedings of the Council in the debate to the two railway authorities concerned though I can give no undertaking as to what expression of opinion, if any, the Government will attach to that communication."

The Hon'ble the VICE-PRESIDENT :—"Do I take it that the Honourable Member presses his resolution to a division?"

The Hon'ble Mr. P. SIVA RAO :—"Yes."

A poll was taken with the following result:—

For	*Against.*
The Hon'ble Mr. T. Arumainatha Pillai.	The Hon'ble Mr. L. Davidson, C.S.I.
" Mr. K. Venkatappayya Pantulu.	" Mr. C. G. Todhunter, C.S.I.
" Mr. P. Siva Rao.	" Mr. R. A. Graham.
" Rao Bahadur T. Namberumal Chetti Garu.	" the Surgeon-General.
" Mr. B. Venkatapati Raju.	" Mr. R. Littlehailes.
" the Raja of Ramnad.	" Diwan Bahadur L. D. Swamikannu Pillai Avargal, I.S.O.
" Rao Bahadur T. Balaji Rao Nayudu Garu.	" Mr. M. D. Devadoss.
" Mr. C. V. S. Narasimha Raju.	" Mr. T. Richmond.
" Mr. B. V. Narasimha Ayyar.	" Mr. J. H. Thonger.
" Rao Bahadur N. Subba Rao.	" Mr. E. S. Lloyd.
" Rai Bahadur T. N. Sivagnanam Pillai Avargal.	" Mr. W. J. J. Howley, C.S.I.
" Khan Bahadur A. T. G. M. Ahmad Tambi Marakkayar Sahib Bahadur.	" the Advocate-General.

Twelve voted *for* and twelve *against* the resolution.

The Hon'ble the VICE-PRESIDENT :—"I should like to take the Council into my confidence."

The Hon'ble Mr. B. V. NARASIMHA AYYAR :—"May we know whether the President voted in the first instance, and if so whether he has a casting vote ?"

The Hon'ble the VICE-PRESIDENT :—"There are 12 for and 12 against. I have not voted either way."

The Hon'ble Mr. B. V. NARASIMHA AYYAR :—"A copy of the proceedings of the Council may be sent to the Railway Board concerned."

The Hon'ble the VICE-PRESIDENT :—"We cannot send up a resolution like this without committing the Council to some decision in the matter. I consider that the proper redress to be obtained for Indian first and second class passengers—of whom I am as much one as anybody else—is by means of a resolution such as suggested by the Hon'ble Mr. Narasimha Ayyar. I however refused to accept it on the ground that it should have been previously notified and then brought to the notice of the authorities so that the Railway Department and my Hon'ble Colleague might have had an opportunity of considering it. But a resolution like this, 'that the European retiring rooms on railways may be thrown open to Indians also', will only have the effect of the abolition of those concessions which our European fellow subjects are at present enjoying. I do not believe that that will carry us far. For these reasons I give my casting vote against the resolution which I declare to be lost."

The resolution was lost.

RESOLUTION *RE* INFORMAL MEETINGS OF THE FINANCE COMMITTEE.

The Hon'ble Mr. B. VENKATAPATI RAJU moved the following resolution :—

'XIII. This Council recommends to the Governor in Council that the Government be pleased to follow the procedure adopted in the United Provinces that informal meetings of the Finance Committee be held from time to time throughout the year to consider about the receipts and expenditure of the Government'.

In doing so, he said :—"Mr. President, though it is rather late, I have no objection to finishing in a few words, because the point is plain and the request is simple. What I ask to do in the resolution is that the Government be pleased to follow the procedure adopted in the United Provinces in regard to the holding of informal meetings of the Finance Committee throughout the year to consider about the receipts and expenditure of the Government. Mr. President, such of the members who have served on the Finance Committee of this Council or of the previous councils and those who have read the rules will find that the Finance Committee for the consideration of the Draft Financial Statement, comes into existence on the 5th January and ends by the 25th January when it was accepted and presented, and afterwards they have not got legal existence, as I find from rules 2 and 6. Therefore any request we may make cannot be pressed under the rules and even with reference to the procedure adopted by the Finance Committee, it is only private and informal. But what I suggest is that hereafter, whether we will it or no it is absolutely necessary for officials and non-officials to come together and consider and devise ways and means of securing the revenue and spending it some on reserved and some on transferred subjects. Why not do that now ? In the United Provinces I am told by a member of that Council that they are consulted not only with reference to the

15TH JULY 1920.] (*Mr. Venkatapati Raju; Mr. Narasimha Ayyar; Mr. Todhunter.*)

Draft Financial Statement but also with reference to any novel items of expenditure out of the moneys granted. Supposing a large amount of money is wanted to meet expenditure on account of the increase of salaries to the establishments, the Finance Member can invite the members to an informal discussion in order to suggest what items of expenditure may be removed to meet the particular demand in question; no State secrets need be divulged. Instances of this sort may be multiplied. I am told that in the United Provinces the members are frequently invited to discuss in a private and informal manner. And I only appeal, not as a matter of right because the procedure is otherwise, but as matter for the future good work of the administration that the officials should allow the non-officials to learn the ways how the money once allotted is being appropriated and how some items are utilized for some other heads on which money may be usefully spent. That can easily be done if the Finance Member wants to consult us. The other day with reference to the Salaries Committee all the members were invited to an informal discussion. Here all the members are not wanted and only those who are selected by the Council, and who know something about it, have to be invited for any informal discussion. The rules need not be strictly adhered to; meetings would be private and informal and I think it would be a useful procedure and can well be followed in our province. I do not think that any further words are needed for commending this resolution for the acceptance of the Finance Member as well as of the Government."

The Hon'ble Mr. B. V. NARASIMHA AYYAR :—"I propose to second this resolution. It is a very late hour and I do not propose to weary the Council with a long speech. The proposition is simple and its justice is patent."

The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. TODHUNTER :—"Mr. President, I thought that when, at the last meeting of the Council, I had satisfied the Hon'ble Mr. Narasimha Ayyar as regards our financial procedure, I had satisfied the most exacting critic of the Finance Department in this Council. It was a great surprise therefore to me to find him supporting this resolution and, like Oliver Twist, asking for more.

"The Honourable mover says that his point is plain and his request simple. I am afraid I cannot altogether accept that statement. His proposal is that the Finance Committee should be called together from time to time, but while making it he admits that there is now no Finance Committee to be called together, since, as the rules show, the Finance Committee is constituted on a date not later than the 5th January for the examination of the budget of the ensuing year and it ceases to exist on the day on which the budget which has been examined by it comes into force.

"Of course, it would be possible to hold an election now for the Finance Committee for 1921–22. But I would ask the Council to consider whether it would really be useful to appoint such a committee now to deal with the budget for the ensuing year. By the time the budget for 1921–22 comes under consideration His Excellency will be considering the appointment of ministers and the budget will be prepared with the assistance of the ministers and perhaps of a standing committee of the new Council.

"Nor do I see any great need for giving greater facilities for discussion at this stage. So far as the receipts are concerned, we are already publishing monthly in the gazette a statement of receipts up to date compared with what is known as the budget proportion, while as regards expenditure we have, at the instance of the Hon'ble Mr. Narasimha Ayyar, undertaken to place on the table a statement of reallotments of sums of Rs. 50,000 and over. The first of such statements forms a part of the agenda for this meeting and a very serious statement, I venture to think, it is. With these materials before them, Honourable Members have ample opportunity of criticism of such intermediate action as is possible to the Government under the existing financial rules. When I proposed at the last meeting to offer the second statement to the Council, I said that the endeavour of the Government was to place Honourable Members during the transition period from the old to the new form of government as nearly as might be in the position which is held by Members of Parliament.

"With the Reforms will come in a totally different method of financial control. The Government's power of reappropriation will be greatly curtailed, and it will be necessary for them to come before the Council with a supplementary estimate whenever it is desired to make any material change. In addition to this, there will be a Committee on Public Accounts performing a continuous scrutiny of the receipt and expenditure of public money. In addition to this again, there will apparently be a standing committee attached to the Finance Department. This will be an advisory body with no power to control the administration. The object of the institution of such committees, in the words of the Secretary of State, will be 'in the main to give their members an insight into the responsibilities and the difficulties of administration and through their members to diffuse the knowledge thus gained through the legislature as a whole.' That, I take it, is very much the object which the Honourable Member has in view in his present proposal.

"The Honourable Member has cited in favour of his proposal the example of the United Provinces. I am not very fully informed as to the practice there. But from such information as I have, I think it is not widely different from that which we have adopted. I cannot find that the Finance Committee at its periodical meetings does anything in the way of actual scrutiny of receipts. What they have placed before them in this respect is a periodical statement of savings from which reappropriations are made. They have also placed before them a

statement of reappropriations somewhat similar to that now placed on the table on which, I presume, they record their opinions. Thus, the main difference between our practice and theirs is that we publish our receipts in the gazette and lay a statement of our reappropriations before the whole Council, while in the United Provinces the corresponding figures are examined by a committee.

"I hope I have said enough to show that in six months' time the members of the Council will have a full measure of control, that for the intervening period we have taken reasonable steps towards giving them a similar measure of control and that there will be no advantage now in constituting a committee which under the rules is concerned only with the budget when this Council will have no concern with the budget of the ensuing year."

With the permission of the Hon'ble the Vice-President the resolution was withdrawn.

RESOLUTION *RE* NEW HOSPITAL IN THE TUTICORIN MUNICIPALITY.

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur T. N. SIVAGNANAM PILLAI moved the following resolution :—

'XIV. This Council recommends to His Excellency the Governor in Council that, in deference to the unanimous resolution of the Municipal Council, Tuticorin, they will be pleased to sanction the construction of an up-to-date hospital at the site selected by the local council.'

In doing so, he said :—" Sir, the resolution that I propose to move is in connexion with the hospital at Tuticorin. Some ten months ago the municipal council of Tuticorin after debating on various particulars and at various times came to he unanimous conclusion that it was necessary to abandon the present hospital and construct a new up-to-date hospital on the site selected by them. As usual, the matter had to go to Government through the Surgeon-General. In his recommendation, the Surgeon-General did not appear to have supported the proposal and the Government passed orders accordingly, referring the Council to the Surgeon-General's recommendation. I came to know of this then, and in the course of an informal conversation with the Surgeon-General here, I requested him to visit the place, so that he might have an opportunity of reconsidering his decision if it was necessary to do so. He was kind enough to concede to my request, and he also told me that he would keep his mind open till the inspection. It was then arranged for an inspection, but the inspection did not come off for some time on account of the various duties which tne Surgeon-General had to discharge. Finally, on the 12th April he was kind enough to go to Tuticorin and also took with him the Sanitary Engineer. In the presence of the chairman, myself, and, I believe, the Revenue Divisional Officer, the two sites were inspected. Really it is a question as to whether any decision that had been arrived at unanimously by a municipal council, supported as it is by the recommendation of the European Divisional Officer Mr. Tottenham, and that of the Collector Mr. Cox, could very easily be set aside on grounds which, I am going to show, are not maintainable. In the first place, I will give you a short description of the present hospital. It is situated in a swampy place. With every rainfall the ground gets swampy and it has been condemned by various officers, high and low, who had occasion to visit the institution. It may be within the recollection of the Honourable Members of the present Executive Council who had occasion to visit the place that they had also written remarks condemning the institution. I believe that Hon'ble Sir Rajagopala Achariyar and Sir John Atkinson have written very strongly about it. That hospital is situated in a most congested locality. There is a big sewage drain which goes behind the hospital. It is situated in a locality where constantly carts have to go. It is called the great cotton road. In the summer season the place will be dusty and streams of carts laden with cotton will be going to and fro. It may be called the artery of the town. In front of it, you have got smithies working all the day and even till late in the night, and there are two bandy pettahs in front from which always emerge a din of noise. I should say that such surroundings are not at all harmonious for the accommodation of in-patients, many of whom are labour cases. This matter had been engaging the attention of the municipal council for a long time and they decided that in the interests of the place and owing to the fact that there was no up-to-date hospital in any portion of the Tinnevelly district—because the combined hospital at Tinnevelly has been given up —they must go in for a new site situated in a more healthy locality away from congestion where the inmates of the hospital can have peace and rest which they richly deserve.

"The new site is situated at a distance of about half a mile exactly on the other side of the road. As part of the peace memorial the people propose to construct a hospital and they are collecting funds for it and hope to get the necessary amount relying upon Government to give their quota. The present hospital is about 1 acre and 12 cents in extent, whereas the site that is now proposed to be acquired is 16 acres and 8 cents. In the present building it is hardly possible to accommodate the nursing staff, the midwives and the various other people who have to stop there, and at the time of my inspection, they bitterly complained of the unwholesomeness and the cramped nature of the accommodation that was given to them. I have described to you at this late hour the advantageous situation of the one and the disadvantages of the other. I need not labour the point further than by saying that the proposal having been accepted by the whole of the townsmen as the best solution of the difficulty, very strong argument will have

to be urged why their decision should be upset. I have got only one endorsement of the Surgeon-General. It is not known whether the Surgeon-General has submitted the result of his inspection to Government. The Government have not yet passed final orders. I will tell you that his remarks are based upon a misapprehension of the whole thing. The Surgeon-General's endorsement as communicated to the municipality runs as follows: 'The site proposed is very unsuitable.' That is of course a dictum. The Sanitary Engineer who accompanied the Surgeon-General had no objection to the new site selected. The first objection of the Surgeon-General is that the poor, the mill hands and the port coolies all live at the opposite end of the town and they would not be benefited by a new hospital outside the town, however pleasant such site may be. In the first place, the site selected is not out of the town. It is just on the outskirts of the town and is in the direction of the town that is extending. Those acquainted with Tuticorin may well know that the Puchle channel runs on the northern side; on the eastern side there is the sea, and on the south the salt pans. Any extension that can be made to the town can only be made in the direction of south-west and west, and it is in that direction that the proposed site is situated. In fact after the municipality had come to this conclusion, various people who want to buy lands are going in that direction for buying other lands. If we do not catch hold of this opportunity and if as a result of subsequent mature consideration, we find that the site that we have selected is the best site, then we will have to pay very heavily for acquisition charges. The Surgeon-General says the poor, the mill hand and the port coolies are living at the opposite end of the town. With deference to the Surgeon-General, I must say that it is not borne out by the facts. If the Surgeon-General wanted this point to be refuted on the spot, I could have shown him the places where the coolies now live. Here is a plan which shows that a certain section of the cooly population is living on the north-eastern portion, but that part where the hospital is proposed to be located is the portion where houses for coolies are springing up in large numbers in two villages close by, one in the south and the other in the south-east. It is therefore clear that this is the site that is best suited for the people. I am therefore sorry that the statements made in the endorsement of the Surgeon-General that the site proposed is unsuitable as the poor, the mill hands and the port coolies are living in the opposite end of the town do not appear to be maintainable. I do not know what further arguments the Surgeon-General has got, but in their absence I am not able to proceed further. I will now proceed to what the Sanitary Engineer says."

The Hon'ble the VICE-PRESIDENT:—"I fear the Honourable Member has greatly exceeded his time limit. I do not want to interrupt him. After the Surgeon-General says what he has got to say in the matter, he can reply."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur T. N. SIVAGNANAM PILLAI:—"I would have preferred to take up the resolution to-morrow, but as I was asked to move it to-day, at this late hour, I shall be very brief in my remarks."

The Hon'ble the VICE-PRESIDENT:—"We have got to make some progress."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur T. N. SIVAGNANAM PILLAI:—"I have not stated anything that is not connected with the subject before the Council."

The Hon'ble the VICE-PRESIDENT:—"No; but you have greatly exceeded the time limit."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur T. N. SIVAGNANAM PILLAI:—"I will finish soon. If the subject had been taken up in the earlier part of the day, I would have dilated. The note of the Sanitary Engineer runs like this: 'The proposed site for the new hospital was inspected. The site in itself is suitable enough, but the chief objection is that it is not central nor near the industrial quarters (I have tried to show that both these statements are not maintainable), from which accidents and similar cases are likely to come. Nor is it so convenient to the poor inhabited quarters.' All these statements are not supported by facts. The existing site is very much cramped. The Sanitary Engineer admits this. Having condemned the site as unsuitable, he has given arguments which will help people to make it a suitable site. That I think is going far out of the way. With the money that we are going to realize by the sale of the old site, we can get the new site. The new land sells at one-third of the price of the old land. With the sale-proceeds of the old land together with the contribution that Government may be pleased to give, we can purchase the new site. The Sanitary Engineer wants us to tar the road in front of the hospital. Tarring a road in a mufassal place is quite an unheard of thing. What is the good of tarring a road for a place which is unsuitable? Will that make the site more suitable? We must first consider the suitability of the ground. It is only if it is acceptable, we must take the necessary steps. On the other hand every inspecting officer from the lowest to the highest has condemned the existing site and there is no plea put forth that this site is in any way better than the proposed site. As I will have an opportunity of replying to the Surgeon-General and meeting his arguments, I refrain from proceeding further."

The Hon'ble Mr. B. V. NARASIMHA AYYAR:—"I formally second it."

The Hon'ble the SURGEON-GENERAL:—"Mr. President, as this resolution has been admitted by His Excellency the Governor, I suppose we must consider that there is something in it of general public interest. Otherwise I should have thought that the parochial interest of one of the smallest municipalities in a corner of the Presidency is hardly a matter of public interest for discussion in this Council. As the resolution has been admitted I must set to work to refute the arguments brought forward by the Honourable Member.

(The Surgeon-General; Mr. Sivagnanam Pillai; the Vice-President; Mr. Venkatappayya Pantulu.) [15TH JULY 1920.

"What seems to me to be of public interest is the large question as to whether a municipal council which has no money but wants to build a hospital and proposes to ask the Government for practically the whole of the cost, should or should not take the advice of Government as to where the hospital should be located. I think that is a subject which comes up in many municipalities and it will probably have to be decided in several instances before long. I have taken the greatest trouble with regard to the Tuticorin hospital. I went there twice and I have spoken to everybody concerned. I have tried to find out where the in-patients and out-patients who come to the hospital live and I can refute every statement of the Honourable mover.

"Most of the patients of this hospital live as far away from the new site as it is possible on that particular portion of the earth's surface to live. It is proposed to build the new hospital outside the town—or as the Honourable mover says on the outskirts of the town, though what the difference is between the outskirts and outside of a town, I do not know. That raises another question of general interest. The question has come up in Madras, it has come up in Cochin, in Kurnool and several other places, whether it is best to build a hospital outside a town, or if you like it, on the outskirts of the town in the healthy portion of the suburbs where patients would be more comfortable in the quieter surroundings and would be altogether better off or whether you will build it as has been done in the case of the great towns like Calcutta, Bombay, London and Vienna in the middle of the town close to the poorest part of the town, to which people can always find easy access, where the patients will not be put to the inconvenience of being carried to and fro and where their friends can go to see them easily. It is after all merely a matter of opinion. In America in several of the large cities they have decided to build hospitals not only outside the towns but a few miles away from them and to overcome the difficulty of distance they have special ambulance tram-cars and motor-cars and lorries to take the patients to and fro. I doubt whether Tuticorin will be able to find money to do all or any of these things in the near future. My professional opinion which I put at the disposal of the municipal council is that after balancing the pros and cons it would be better for them to retain the present site, enlarge their present hospital and modernise it rather than take the hospital outside the town as far away from the patients as it is possible to do. If they say that they are not willing to take my opinion, they can ignore it.

"The Honourable mover says that the town is likely to extend in the direction of the new site of the hospital. If it is, that may be a good argument. But as far as I can see the town is likely to go in the opposite direction, that owing to the fact that large port activities are going to take place the whole population or the centre of gravity of the town is likely to shift in the other direction. As soon as I received that information I at once thought that the whole subject would have to be looked into again, and when it is definitely known that there is going to be a change in the port of Tuticorin I would be glad to go there again, meet the Honourable Member and if necessary the whole of the town council and anybody else interested in the matter and try to come to an unanimous decision.

"This is the position. The town council wish to build a hospital. They want Government to provide most of the money. They say they do not want my professional opinion. Very well, I still think that it is not the right way to do things. First of all, we ought to have the matter decided by expert opinion and secondly by consultation with everybody concerned.

"The Honourable mover says that the council is unanimously of opinion that the hospital should be built on the new site. I would say that 18 months ago they were of that opinion, I do not think they are of that opinion now, because they had not the case properly put before them. If the case has to be reconsidered, as it seems likely, probably the Honourable Member would wish to withdraw his resolution."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur T. N. SIVAGNANAM PILLAI :—"I do not know what to do. As the Surgeon-General says that the matter has not been finally settled, it is unnecessary for me to traverse his arguments . . ."

The Hon'ble the VICE-PRESIDENT :—"I understand the Surgeon-General to say that the whole question will have to be reconsidered in view of certain changes likely to take place in the port before long, but the last word in the matter of course rests with the local body; and it is as well that the Surgeon-General should be given full opportunity of stating what he has to say to the local body.

"Very few members of the Council can know anything about the rights or wrongs of the location of a hospital at Tuticorin. I should therefore advise the Honourable Member to accept the assurance given by the Surgeon-General and discuss the matter with him when he goes to Tuticorin."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur T. N. SIVAGNANAM PILLAI :—"In deference to the advice given by the Hon'ble the President I withdraw the resolution for the present."

The resolution was by leave withdrawn.

RESOLUTION *RE* SECONDARY SCHOOL-LEAVING CERTIFICATE EXAMINATION IN THE VERNACULAR.

The Hon'ble the VICE-PRESIDENT :—"I understand that the Director of Public Instruction will give a reply which will be acceptable to the mover of the resolution. I would therefore suggest that the latter formally move his resolution. If after hearing the Director of Public Instruction he has anything to say, he may say that later on."

The Hon'ble Mr. K. VENKATAPPAYYA PANTULU :—"I formally move the resolution."

15TH JULY 1920.] *(Mr. Venkatapati Raju; Mr. Littlehailes; Mr. Venkatappayya Pantulu; the Vice-President.)*

The following was the resolution which was moved :—

'XV. This Council recommends to the Governor in Council that provision be made permitting institutions preparing candidates for Secondary School-Leaving Certificate Public examination to adopt vernacular as the medium of instruction, if they so desire, in all non-language subjects, and in that case allowing the candidates appearing for the public examination from such institutions to answer the question papers in those subjects in vernacular.'

The Hon'ble Mr. B. VENKATAPATI RAJU :—"I second the resolution."

The Hon'ble Mr. R. LITTLEHAILES :—"I shall not detain the Council for more than a few minutes. I intended to quote the recommendations of the University Commission on this point and also the recommendations which were made by the Conference of Educationists at Simla in 1917 but to save the time of the Council I shall not go into details but will merely mention that this resolution can be divided appropriately into two portions. The first is that provision should be made in order that in high school classes instruction may be given in the vernacular and the second is that an examination in the vernacular may take place at the end of the school course.

"With reference to the first part of the resolution, there is nothing in the Madras Educational Rules which prevents instruction being given in the high school classes in the vernacular. Moreover, we do specifically prescribe that instruction shall not be given in English in the first, second and third forms without specific sanction. So that the first portion of the resolution is unnecessary.

"With regard to the second portion of the resolution that provision should be made for examination in the vernacular at the end of the school course, I may invite the attention of the Council to the fact that we have never yet had a single application for examination in the vernacular at the end of the high school course. As soon as I receive an application I shall feel it incumbent upon me to advise Government to make provision for examination in the vernacular."

The Hon'ble Mr. K. VENKATAPPAYYA PANTULU :—"A similar resolution was moved in 1917 by the Hon'ble Mr. Suryanarayanamurti Pantulu and the then Director of Public Instruction, the Hon'ble Mr. Stone, was pleased to state almost the same thing which the present Director of Public Instruction has stated now. The difficulty is, so far as the Lower Secondary classes are concerned, there is permission given to instruct the students through the medium of the vernacular."

The Hon'ble the VICE-PRESIDENT :—"Is it not compulsion?"

The Hon'ble Mr. K. VENKATAPPAYYA PANTULU :—"But in the case of the higher classes there is no prohibition as is pointed out by the Hon'ble Mr. Littlehailes that instruction should not be given in the vernacular. At the same time I have inquired of some of the heads of the institutions why they have not adopted the vernacular as the medium of instruction though pronouncement was made in this Council by the Hon'ble the Director of Public Instruction then that there was nothing to prevent heads of institutions to adopt the vernacular as the medium of instruction in the higher classes also. They stated that whereas there are certain specific provisions in the Lower Secondary course there is no similar provision actually allowing instruction through the medium of vernaculars in the case of higher classes. As there is not a specific provision therefor, they are hesitating to adopt it. All that I ask is that some such provision should be made or some assurance should be given by the Director of Public Instruction that there will be no objection for the heads of institutions to adopt vernaculars as the media of instruction in the higher classes also. If such an assurance is given, I hope that some at least of the heads of schools will be willing to adopt vernaculars as the media of instruction. The Calcutta University Commission has recommended as a matter of fact in all compulsory courses that media of instruction except in Mathematics. All that I ask is that some assurance should be given that if vernacular is adopted as the medium of instruction, there will be no objection."

The Hon'ble the VICE-PRESIDENT :—"Has not the Director of Public Instruction given the assurance now?"

The Hon'ble Mr. K. VENKATAPPAYYA PANTULU :—"In the rules there is nothing to prevent."

The Hon'ble the VICE-PRESIDENT :—"I am sure the speech of the Director of Public Instruction could be quoted whenever wanted.

"May I take it that the Honourable Member withdraws his resolution?"

The Hon'ble Mr. K. VENKATAPPAYYA PANTULU :—"Yes."

The resolution was by leave withdrawn.

(Mr. Raja ; Mr. Narasimha Ayyar ; Mr. Lloyd.) [15TH JULY 1920.

RESOLUTION *RE* REPRESENTATION OF TEMPERANCE OPINION ON THE MADRAS LICENSING BOARD.

The Hon'ble Mr. M. C. RAJA moved the following resolution :—

"XVI. That this Council recommends to His Excellency the Governor in Council to be pleased to provide for adequate representation of temperance opinion on the Madras Licensing Board."

The Hon'ble Mr. B. V. NARASIMHA AYYAR :—"I second it."

The Hon'ble Mr. E. S. LLYOD :—"I understand that I am authorized to say on behalf of Government that the Government are prepared to accept this resolution and have already taken steps to appoint a suitable member on the board. This will probably meet the wishes of the Hon'ble Mr. Raja."

The resolution was put to the vote and carried.

The Council adjourned till 11 a.m. on Friday the 16th July 1920.

F. J. RICHARDS,
Acting Secretary to Govt., L. & M. (Legislative) Dept.

Proceedings of an Adjourned Meeting of the Council of the Governor of Fort St. George assembled for the purpose of making Laws and Regulations under the provisions of the Act of Parliament, 5 & 6 Geo. V, Ch. 61.

The Council re-assembled at the Senate House, Chepauk, at 11 a.m. on Friday, the 16th day of July 1920.

PRESENT:

The Hon'ble Diwan Bahadur Sir P. RAJAGOPALA ACHARIYAR Avargal, K.C.S.I., C.I.E. Vice-President—*Presiding*.
The Hon'ble Mr. L. DAVIDSON, C.S.I.
The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. TODHUNTER, C.S.I.
The Hon'ble Mr. A. Y. G. CAMPBELL, C.I.E.
The Hon'ble Mr. S. COX.
The Hon'ble Major-General G. G. GIFFARD, C.S.I., I.M.S.
The Hon'ble Mr. R. A. GRAHAM.
The Hon'ble Mr. W. J. J. HOWLEY, C.S.I.
The Hon'ble Mr. R. LITTLEHAILES.
The Hon'ble Mr. E. S. LLOYD.
The Hon'ble Diwan Bahadur L. D. SWAMIKANNU PILLAI Avargal, I.S.O.
The Hon'ble Diwan Bahadur Sir P. TYAGARAYA CHETTI Garu, *Kt.*
The Hon'ble the Rev. E. M. MACPHAIL, O.B.E.
The Hon'ble Mr. C. V. S. NARASIMHA RAJU.
The Hon'ble Mr. K. VENKATAPPAYYA PANTULU.
The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur T. BALAJI RAO NAYUDU Garu.
The Hon'ble Mr. P. SIVA RAO.
The Hon'ble Mr. W. VIJAYARAGHAVA MUDALIYAR.
The Hon'ble Mr. B. V. NARASIMHA AYYAR.
The Hon'ble Mr. V. MADHAVA RAJA, Elaya Nambidi of Kollengode.
The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur V. K. RAMANUJA ACHARIYAR Avargal.
The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur T. N. SIVAGNANAM PILLAI Avargal.
The Hon'ble B. RAJA RAJESWARA SETUPUTI alias MUTTURAMALINGA SETUPATI Avargal, Raja of Ramnad.
The Hon'ble Mr. B. VENKATAPATI RAJU.
The Hon'ble Mr. T. R. RAMACHANDRA AYYAR.
The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur HAJI ABD-UL-LAH HAJI QASIM SAHIB Bahadur.
The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur A. T. G. M. AHMAD TAMBI MARAKKAYAR SAHIB Bahadur.
The Hon'ble Mr. J. H. THONGER.
The Hon'ble Mr. T. ARUMAINATHA PILLAI.
The Hon'ble Diwan Bahadur T. DESIKA ACHARIYAR Avargal.
The Hon'ble Mr. M. D. DEVADOSS.
The Hon'ble Mr. H. H. G. MITCHELL, O.B.E.
The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur T. NAMBERUMAL CHETTI Garu.
The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur N. SUBBA RAO Avargal.

(The Vice-President ; Mr. Venkatapati Raju ; Sir Tyagaraya Chetti ; Mr. Desika Achariyar ; Mr. Narasimha Ayyar.) [16TH JULY 1920

In the absence of His Excellency the President, the Hon'ble Diwan Bahadur Sir P. Rajagopala Achariyar Avargal, K.C.S.I., C.I.E., presided.

The Hon'ble the VICE-PRESIDENT :—" I understand that the Hon'ble Mr. B. Venkatapati Raju wants to make a motion."

RESOLUTION THANKING THE GOVERNMENT OF INDIA AND THE SECRETARY OF STATE FOR THE APPOINTMENT OF THE HON'BLE MR. B. N. SARMA TO THE INDIAN EXECUTIVE COUNCIL.

The Hon'ble Mr. B. VENKATAPATI RAJU :—" Mr. President, I may be permitted to move a resolution on behalf of the non-official members of this Council to express our heartfelt thanks to the Secretary of State for India and the Government of India for appointing the Hon'ble Mr. B. N. Sarma, a representative of our Legislative Council, to the Executive Council of the Government of India. Mr. President, the officials and the non-officials are well acquainted with the Hon'ble Mr. Sarma. Madras had got the good fortune of sending one of its members, Sir Sankaran Nayar, to represent us and now we have another fortunate circumstance that the Hon'ble Mr. Sarma also is similarly honoured by the Government of India and the Secretary of State. I think all the non-official members without any exception unanimously agree and join with me in expressing our felicitations to convey our thanks on this occasion. With your permission, Mr. President, I shall move the resolution to convey our thanks to the Government of India and the Secretary of State on behalf of the non-official members of this Council."

'The non-official members of this Council request His Excellency the Governor in Council to convey their heartfelt thanks to the Government of India and the Secretary of State for appointing the Hon'ble Mr. B. N. Sarma, representative of this Council in the Imperial Legislative Council to the Indian Executive Council.'

The Hon'ble Diwan Bahadur Sir P. TYAGARAYA CHETTI :—" Mr. President, I am exceedingly glad to second the resolution moved by my Honourable friend. I may mention how glad I am to see that my friend Mr. Sarma has been appointed to the Viceroy's Executive Council. I was proud of having had my old friend Sir Sankaran Nayar of the Madras Presidency in the Executive Council of India and now I have the greater pleasure to see my personal friend Mr. Sarma being made a member of the Council and I ask the Government to convey our thanks to the Secretary of State for having brought about this."

The Hon'ble Diwan Bahadur T. DESIKA ACHARIYAR :—" I gladly associate myself with this resolution which is most acceptable to us all non-official members of this Council. The Hon'ble Mr. Sarma has been doing excellent work on this Council and has represented us in a markedly able manner in the India Council and it is a matter for gratification to us all that he has been called upon to occupy the exalted position of a member of the Viceroy's Executive Council."

The Hon'ble the VICE-PRESIDENT :—"May I take it that all non-official members support the resolution proposed by the Hon'ble Mr. B. Venkatapati Raju and seconded by the Hon'ble Sir P. Tyagaraya Chettiyar ? "

The resolution was put to the Council and carried unanimously.

The Hon'ble the VICE-PRESIDENT :—" The Government will gladly submit the resolution to the Government of India and the Secretary of State.

" The Council will now resume consideration of the resolutions on matters of general public interest."

RESOLUTION *RE* THE CONDITION OF THE HILL TRIBES IN THE SALEM, COIMBATORE AND NILGIRI DISTRICTS.

The Hon'ble Mr. B. V. NARASIMHA AYYAR moved the following resolution :—

" XVII. This Council recommends to His Excellency in Council that a committee may be appointed to inquire into the condition of the hill tribes of the Salem, Coimbatore and Nilgiri districts and to report on the measures required for ameliorating their condition."

In doing so, he said :—" Mr. President, this resolution is to the effect that a committee may be appointed to inquire into the condition of the hill tribes of the Salem, Coimbatore and Nilgiri districts and to report on the measures required for ameliorating their condition. The object of this resolution is to promote the condition of certain hill tribes. The three districts chosen are the districts which I am most familiar with and which I directly represent. I do not by the mention of these exclude others. The reason why I have preferred this is because I know a great deal about the condition of the hill tribes there and the urgent necessity that

there is for attending to them. I know that there is a protector of the depressed classes, i e., the Labour Commissioner Mr. Paddison, and the fact that there is such an officer might perhaps be thought in some quarters to be a reason why a committee should be considered unnecessary. I wish to point out that a protector or a person who attends to the depressed classes in all the 25 districts of the Presidency is called upon to do too much. I know there is also a scheme for giving him the help of about eight officers of the grade of Deputy Collector with some staff. I know that in spite of that it would be much easier and better for a committee of the sort I mention to tackle that problem immediately and for that reason I am moving this resolution. The reason why I consider the present officer and his future Deputy Collectors would not be of much immediate use is this. There are several problems connected with these hill tribes that are very urgent, in respect of which we may expect a lot of information from persons of the locality concerned. If you get a committee fairly conversant with these three districts and if the committee begins at once its work, it will find a number of problems ready at hand, of which some of the details are already known to them, and the committee will be able to tackle the problem in a few months and submit a report but it would be quite otherwise with Mr. Paddison and his subordinate staff. I may point out that these hill tribes are the shyest of communities that I have ever seen. If any persons go up from the plains these hill tribes fly away from their presence. They have had a bitter experience of the astuteness of the men of the plains who go up and lend them say Rs. 10 and the acres of the poor hill tribes worth, it may be, about Rs. 300 to Rs. 500, disappear in the course of a few years. They have a natural fear of the men of the plains. They will not easily communicate their ideas. There are a few persons however who have obtained their confidence and have understood something about their conditions and will be able notwithstanding this shyness to attend to them. I tried my very best to obtain first-hand knowledge of their grievances. I think only on one or two occasions I moved this Council by way of questions about the conditions of the Salem and Coimbatore hill tribes, those districts being confined to my operations of work. Mr. Legh was the Collector of the Salem district for a series of years and I repeatedly pressed on him to attend to the conditions of the Salem Malaiyalis. For instance their community is slowly progressing in population unlike other hill tribes which are dwindling. I asked the Collector to notice the fact that these hill tribes are suffering for want of land. They have got to go in only for lands which are called village greens. I have pointed out time and again that it is absolutely necessary to make provision for their increasing wants. I suggested that lands might be given by the Forest Department. The Forest Department said that these were reserved for climatic purposes, but yet so far as planters were concerned they were given enough lands. I pointed out that similar grants should be made to the hill tribes, Malaiyalis, instead of giving more favourable treatment to planter X or Y whether Indian or European it does not matter. Mr. Legh who promised to consider the matter went on leave and his successor took the available land and gave it away to the planters without reference to me leaving the poor hill tribes helpless. This is what has happened in one instance. I know they have other grievances also and amongst their grievances I can point out that in some instances as on the Kalroyans they have got the tenure of the married men paying Rs. 2 and unmarried men paying Re. 1 to their *Dorais* for the privilege of cultivating any land they can manage to cultivate. They have certain grievances in that respect also. I will not enter into the details of the matter, but I think a committee is the proper body to consider their conditions. I wish to point out that I have taken these matters to the notice of the local authorities time and again and on two occasions I brought it to the notice of the Government with the result that I was referred back again to local authorities. Similarly in the Coimbatore district it was once again that the Forest Department came into conflict with certain persons in the Anamalais and their occupation was nearly gone. Recently I think in the Nilgiri district, a planter, who is a keen sportsman, I must say to his credit, drove down to my bungalow and said : 'here are your men, the Ezhuvas: they had an extensive acreage of 3,000 acres of forest land available for cultivation. They were under Government care' and what happened to these? Some enterprising men were able to secure some cotton seeds at Madura and applied to Government for the assignment of these 3,000 acres for the cultivation of cotton. The land was assigned to them. They are Messrs. Steel and Clementson. The consequence was that these lands passed away from the hands of the Ezhuvas into those of two gentlemen. What was their concern? They were a trading company and they were not likely to look after the interests of the hill tribes. And so here is an illustration of a portion of the Nilgiri district abutting on the Mysore boundary in which the interests of the Ezhuva hill tribes were not considered at all. These Ezhuvas would hardly combine together for the purpose of putting forward a resolution at the meeting, and it was difficult for me to catch hold of an Ezhuva and get his views.

"I think it would be advantageous to the Government to appoint a committee for these districts, or one committe for each of these three districts, including persons having some local knowledge. I should not be sorry to see Mr. Paddison with his assistants working on this committee. What is wanted is a body of men who have got local knowledge of these matters and who can devote their attention immediately to this question and who can actually go down to those places and visit the hill tops. I think such a committee is likly to do very good work. I am not in the least disparaging any officer or officers whose names I might have mentioned. Therefore, I presume that the subject-matter of this resolution must commend the sympathy of us all and the unanimous support not only of the non-official members but of the entire Council."

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur N. SUBBA RAO :—" I beg to second the resolution."

The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. TODHUNTER :—" Mr. President, the Honourable Member has somewhat taken me by surprise, because I judged from the wording of his resolution that his idea was that his own constituency should be given precedence over the rest of the Presidency in the matter of improvement of the condition of the hill tribes. When he came to move his resolution, however, he said that he did not mind if several committees were appointed for different parts of the Presidency, in other words, he urged the case of the hill tribes as a whole.

" Again, I judged from his resolution that his concern was with developing the hill tribes by education, sanitation and other similar measures. What he has laid stress on, however, is not so much the need for development as certain disabilities which he says they are suffering under. I am afraid I am not prepared to discuss all these in detail. I did, when he moved the matter of the village greens in Salem some time ago, go carefully into the matter and my conclusion was that the hill tribes in the Shevaroys had no real grievance against the authorities. The complaint which he has made on behalf of the Ezhuvas is new to me. My impression has hitherto been that they were glad of the opportunity of earning good wages. If, however, he will let me know the details of any specific grievance of the kind, I shall be glad to have them gone into.

" To come now to the general question, I need hardly say that we are as keen as the Honourable Mover on improving the condition of the hill tribes, and perhaps it will be well if I say a word or two as to the lines on which we are trying to work. What we are trying to do in the first place is to settle these people on the land by granting them land for cultivation on special terms and preventing them from alienating it to the plainsmen. A summary of the concessions that have been made in this respect will be found in the press communiqué issued on the subject. In some cases loans on special terms are being granted. In the next place, the Forest Department are endeavouring to secure them settled occupation by enlisting their aid in protecting the forests, which they have hitherto been so fond of destroying. The Honourable Member is no doubt aware of the work that is being done in this respect among the Chenchus in the Nallamalais. Again we are doing a certain amount of educational work, but as regards this, the Hon'ble the Director of Public Instruction tells me that to put a teacher from the plains into a village on the hills is about as much use as putting a drop of water in a basin of mercury. In the case of some of the more advanced tribes, such as the Badagas, we have formed co-operative societies. It will thus be seen that we are doing something for these hill tribes, though slowly.

" Meanwhile we have created two special agencies for dealing with these tribes. For the important hill tribes in the Agency tracts, we have appointed an Agency Commissioner, one main object of whose appointment is to take up the whole question of the hill tribes, as is shown in the list of his duties given in reply to a question on the paper. He is trying to begin with to redistribute the divisions on a language basis, so that the officers who are dealing with the tribes may be able to understand them better and help them along on the road of civilization. For the rest of the tribes, we have the Labour Commissioner. It is true he has got a great deal of work on hand for the reason that when his appointment was created we did not expect that conciliation and settlement of labour disputes would form any part of his duties. As strikes have become more and more frequent, conciliation has become a main part of them.

" We have not yet got the sanction of the Government of India for the appointment of the Assistants to the Labour Commissioner to which the Honourable Member has referred. When we get such sanction, we propose to employ them when and as particular problems present themselves.

" But I should like to sound a note of warning. As the Honourable Mover has said, the hill tribes are a very shy people. Their case is very different from that of the labouring or depressed classes. In the case of the latter, all that you need is men, money and good-will, to help them to improve their condition by giving them education and teaching them to adopt a better standard of living. The hill tribes on the other hand are a shy and proud people and whoever is put on to deal with the question must first of all study the tribe before he begins to teach them. It is difficult to find the right people to attack this question. In the case of the Chenchus, we have been fortunate in securing an officer who has made a special study of the problem But as I have already said, these are not matters which can be rushed. We are quite ready to go into them as the problems show themselves, and as soon as we get the Government of India's sanction for the appointment of officers, we shall try to find suitable men to attack the particular problems that are most urgent.

" Meanwhile I doubt very much if we should really gain anything by appointing a series of committees to investigate these problems, when we are not ready to follow the inquiry by action. We must first have men ready to get to work. If, however, the Honourable Member will give me specific particulars of the complaints he has referred to, I will undertake that the district staff shall make inquiries into them. I hope I have said enough to show to the Honourable Mover that we have the problem in hand and that it has our sympathy, but that the time has not come for making an exhaustive inquiry."

The Hon'ble Mr. B. V. NARASIMHA AYYAR :—" May I have information whether the Government have appointed anybody to carry on this inquiry ? Is anybody working now on the matter ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. TODHUNTER :—"We have the Agency Commissioner taking up the question of the hill tribes in the Agency and a special officer dealing with the Chenchus and we are waiting for the Labour Commissioner to formulate a regular programme for his department as a whole, which will include the hill tribes in the other areas."

The Hon'ble Mr. B. V. NARASIMHA AYYAR :—"I have not caught exactly the line which the Hon'ble Mr. Todhunter is taking. I do not understand whether he thinks that a committee is likely to be useless or harmful. He says that it is hoped that something will be done soon. I am sorry the Hon'ble Mr. Raja is not here. I think strictly speaking he represents the depressed classes and these hill tribes come under that category in a way, though they rank themselves very high in point of caste. I do not know what Mr. Raja would have said if he had heard the Hon'ble Mr. Todhunter say 'some staff may be appointed in 1921 and some inquiry will be made some day'. I must say that it is rather disappointing to be told that something will be done some day when nothing is being done at present on behalf of these hill tribes. As for the existing revenue staff they do as much for these tribes as I am doing. I am afraid I am able to look into the matter once in six months or so and the revenue staff is not doing even that at all. What I think is that we must make it the work of somebody to look into the conditions of the hill tribes. I do not want any discontent to be sown among them. What I want to be done is good humanitarian work which the Government are bound to do. These backward classes have no representatives in any of the boards or councils from top to bottom. They have no chance of their condition getting known and it is just as well that on such people we should occasionally bestow some thought and once for all try to find out what their grievances and difficulties are. For this purpose I wanted a small committee to be appointed. I do not see what disadvantage there is in starting such a committee. I do not know whether I am to understand the Hon'ble Mr. Todhunter to say that it is undesirable or harmful to appoint such a committee. May I know why it cannot be done at least for one district, say Salem. I am prepared to find workers and it would be better if some officials also could be spared to serve on the committee. I think it is just worth while for the Hon'ble Mr. Todhunter to see whether such a committee would do any harm."

The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. TODHUNTER :—"All that I say is that at present the appointment of a committee of inquiry would be premature. The question of improving the condition of the labouring classes and the hill tribes is an enormous question and we are only just beginning to deal with it. We want to proceed in an orderly and regular way. As the Honourable Mover himself has told us, the question is a most difficult one owing to the shyness and pride of these people. We must get suitable men to deal with it; if not, it is quite easy to do more harm than good. In fact, anybody who knows the history of excise in the Agency tracts can understand how our best efforts to carry on reforms on lines that are suitable to the plains at one time did more harm than good among the hill tribes.

"Further, the Honourable Member is anxious that these committees should have officials on them. We are at present shorthanded in every department and more especially in the Forest Department, which is the department mainly concerned with these tribes. Therefore, I ask the Honourable Member to let this matter stand over until the Commissioner of Labour has had time to formulate a regular programme of the work and we have officers to spare to help the committee."

The Hon'ble Mr. B. V. NARASIMHA AYYAR :—"When will that be?"

The Hon'ble the VICE-PRESIDENT :—"Order, order. The Honourable Member in charge has replied to the mover. Does the latter wish to press his resolution?"

The Hon'ble Mr. B. V. NARASIMHA AYYAR :—"Yes."

The resolution was put to the vote and lost.

RESOLUTION *RE* POSTPONEMENT OF RESETTLEMENT.

The Hon'ble Mr. P. SIVA RAO :—"Mr. President, I beg to move the following resolution :—

'XVIII. This Council recommends to His Excellency the Governor in Council that the resettlement in progress may be postponed till the principles of it are embodied in a statute.'

"Mr. President, I may just draw the attention of the Council to the recommendations of the Royal Commission on Decentralization. It is in the following terms. In paragraph 252 of the report they say: 'We consider that the general principles of assessment such for instance as the proportion of the net profits of the land which the Government shall be entitled to take and the period of settlement should be embodied in a provincial legislation instead of being left to executive order as is now the case outside Bombay.' And following upon the recommendations of the Decentralization Commission the matter came before the Joint Committee of both Houses of Parliament and in paragraph 11 of the report of the Joint Select Committee on the Government of India Bill they recommend as follows :—'The Committee are impressed by the objection raised by many witnesses to the manner in which certain classes of taxation

can be levied upon the people of India by executive action, without, in some cases, any statutory limitations and in other cases without adequate prescription by statute of the method of assessment. They considered that the imposition of new burdens should be gradually brought more within the purview of the legislature and in particular without expressing any judgment on the question whether the land revenue is rent or tax, they advise that the process of revising land revenue assessment ought to be brought under closer regulation by a statute as soon as possible. At present the statutory basis of charging revenue on the land varies in different provinces, but in some at least the pitch of assessment is entirely at the discretion of the Executive Government. No branch of the administration is regulated with great elaboration or care. But the people who are most affected have no voice in shaping the system and the rules are often obscure and imperfectly understood by those who pay the revenue. The committee are of opinion that the time has come to embody in the law the main principles by which the land revenue is determined, the methods of valuation, the pitch of assessment, the periods of revision, the graduation of enhancement and the other chief processes which touch the well-being of the revenue payers.' As soon as these findings were published I drew the attention of the Government to them and asked whether the Local Government contemplated any legislation in the matter on the lines suggested in the Joint Committee's report. I was given the answer that the whole matter was under consideration. I again pressed the same matter in the present Council. In answer to one of my interpellations (Question No. 87) the Government are pleased to say 'the Board of Revenue has been asked to prepare a draft Bill for consideration by the Government.' Now, Sir, it stands to reason that when this legislation is contemplated that the settlements now in progress in the Presidency—in Bellary, Anantapur, Tanjore and other districts—may be held up. It is a very legitimate request on my part to ask that these resettlements should not be sanctioned till the principles are settled in the manner already indicated.

"The only objection to this course can be 'what is to be done with the establishments that are already entertained? Are we to disband them? What are we to do with the spade work that has already been done so far.' That may be the possible objection. But all that has been done so far is only the preliminary work, the collection of facts and figures and inquiry into the economic condition of the people. It has to be done in any event. We shall take full benefit of this inquiry when the proper time comes, and we can make the best possible use of these facts and figures when the principles of land settlement are embodied in a statute. The next objection that may be raised is that everywhere there is a demand for more money. Probably that may be the line of argument. I only anticipate, that it may be said 'How are we to get the necessary revenue, if we are to hold back the settlement?' I am not opposed at all to the raising of more money. I only contend that the money should be collected according to certain well-known principles. If not now, it may be collected some time hence. This Bill, it is said, is under preparation in the office of the Board of Revenue, and it may not take very long to get it drafted and submitted for consideration. We expect to have two or three meetings before the end of the year, and we may take it that the Government will be pleased to consider this as one of the progressive measures that are contemplated and marked as urgent by red label along with the Village Panchayat Bill, the Local Boards Bill, Elementary Education Bill and so on. If the Government only take care to publish the Bill and if the Select Committee is asked to make its report then and there and finish the report within the prescribed time, all these stages will be gone through before the end of the year. If only the Government shows its willingness, it would not be difficult to achieve the object in view.

"I need not detain the Council any longer. It is perfectly legitimate for me to ask that these settlements be hung up till the principles are embodied in the statute."

The Hon'ble Mr. B. VENKATAPATI RAJU:—"Mr. President, I have great pleasure in seconding the resolution moved by the Hon'ble Mr. Siva Rao. The settlement question has been discussed in this Council for the last 10 or 12 years from various standpoints, the popular representatives suggesting one method of settlement and the Government holding another view that it would not be possible to realize the revenues required to carry on the administration. But there is one point which cannot escape the attention of the Government. There are several pattadars who are unable to contribute the increased revenue from time to time. Such of those who own an acre or two or pay an assessment of 10 or 12 rupees might be exempted from paying increased revenues. I do not think Government would be losers to a very great extent and even if they be losers, it is not fair that increased revenue should be taken from such persons. I do not believe that any exemption should be made in the case of rich persons who are bound to pay in order to contribute for general expenditure. But with reference to minor pattadars, there is no safeguard now that their holdings will be exempted from revision of assessment. On the recommendation of the Joint Committee, I am sure very shortly this Government would introduce a Bill in order to settle the principles on which land revenue has to be assessed in this country. Therefore my friend's appeal to the Government that the present assessment be postponed till that Bill is passed is a reasonable one. Government has got every right to recover the increased revenue from rich persons. Some assurance must be given that poor pattadars' assessment will not be increased. I hope the Government will favourably consider this request from the representatives of the people."

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur V. K. RAMANUJA ACHARIYAR:—"I am not in sympathy with this resolution, for the reason that one who accepts this accepts the proposition that the principles of settlement should be embodied in a statute. What I have been always anxious to

do is to abolish resettlements altogether, the Government taking power to raise as much money as they require at the time of the preparation of the budget by a percentage enhancement of assessment in all districts. Holding that view I do not favour the idea that the principles of settlement should be embodied in an Act. The principles are well known, whether they are embodied in an Act or not. We consider that resettlements are a great hindrance to the progress of the country. They press very heavily on the poorer people. Re-settlements as at present conducted should come to an end. Therefore I feel bound to oppose this resolution."

The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. TODHUNTER :—" The Honourable Mover has stated the case against the resolution under three or four heads, but I am afraid I was not able to follow him when he was dealing with one of the most important objections. First he stated that we should hold up all settlement work. This he admitted would mean the disbandment of large establishments. Then he proceeded to say that the work of making preliminary economic inquiries must go on whatever principles may be laid down later on. In that case, there is no need to disband the establishment. May I know whether the Honourable Member wishes to have the establishment disbanded or not?"

The Hon'ble Mr. P. SIVA RAO :—" It all depends upon the stage at which we have arrived. I can't say anything as I do not know the precise stage in which matters stand."

The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. TODHUNTER :—" We have an establishment of about two or three thousand men. And if we are going to disband that establishment altogether and recruit them afresh after five years—it is likely to be five years before this legislation takes effect, for reasons I will give later on—we shall be putting the country to a great deal of expense for nothing. If, on the other hand, we need the work which the establishment is at present doing, whatever principles may be laid down hereafter, then this resolution falls to the ground, inasmuch as settlement operations cannot be suspended if we maintain the establishments.

"Then again as regards the increased taxation to which the districts under settlement are liable, the Honourable Mover says that the money due may be collected according to certain well-known principles. What these principles are, I confess, is a mystery to me. It is these very principles that we want to get into the Bill, and until we have announced these principles, I do not see how we can possibly collect an enhanced assessment from the districts which are now ripe for settlement.

"The Honourable Member also says that we could pass the Bill this year as an emergent piece of legislation. Apparently he is not aware that the Government of India have directed that this legislation should wait for the new Council. Apparently again he has not observed that, under the new rules framed under the Government of India Act, it is likely that any Bill of this sort will have to go up to the Government of India. One of these rules provides that, if any such legislation materially modifies the principles upon which settlements are at present conducted, the Bill is to be reserved for the consideration of the Governor-General. The Hon'ble Mr. V. K. Ramanuja Achariyar suggests that settlement operations should be limited to a percentage enhancement of assessment. The Honourable the Seconder of the resolution wants the exemption of the small pattadar. The acceptance of either proposition would mean a very material modification of present principles. Thus the Bill would have probably not only to go before the new Council, but also to be discussed by the Governor-General. I don't think it likely that the new Council assembling in January would be able to take it up next cold weather and I think it is optimistic to hope that the Bill would be passed in 1922, and if we remember that it is an all-India matter and one that affects all provinces and that this Bill would have to be submitted along with similar Bills to the Governor-General, I don't think we could expect it to be passed before 1923. Meanwhile, we should have to disband our establishment and when the Bill was passed to collect and train them all again.

"Now what are we to do in the intervening period? We have eight districts ripe for settlement, and apparently the effect of accepting the resolution would be that we should shut off all settlement work for a period likely to extend to five years. Are these districts to escape all increase in assessment for that period? Is that fair to the other districts which have recently been settled? This, I consider, is the strongest objection to the resolution. A district settled in 1921 would be paying enhanced assessment at the new rates, while a district due for settlement in 1922 would escape the increased assessment till 1927 or until the Honourable Member had discovered and applied the principles he has referred to, of which I am quite unaware at present."

"That being so, I won't press further the question of finance, which, though not very important, is still a serious matter, or of the difficulties involved in disbanding the staff and re-assembling them; nor need I lay stress on the fact that a great deal of what the staff is doing is work of the nature of bringing the ordinary land revenue work up to date. I rest my objection to this resolution on the ground which I took in replying to the Hon'ble Mr. Arumainatha Pillai's budget speech that it would be unfair to the districts which have recently undergone resettlement."

The Hon'ble Mr. P. SIVA RAO :—" I have carefully heard what the Honourable Member in charge had to say. He asked me the question whether I would recommend the immediate disbandment of the settlement establishment. I told him the preliminary work could go on. The collection of facts and figures is as important now as it would be after these principles are embodied in legislation. The question of disbandment depends upon the stage of progress

which has been reached in these settlement operations. There are several stages in a resettlement affair. The last stage is reached when the specification report is sent up recommending a certain enhancement in the present rate. This has to go up to the Board of Revenue and Government have to sanction it finally. Even if the last stage is postponed till the principles are embodied I shall be satisfied, as I said only the preliminary work might go on.

"The Honourable Member in charge said that the Bill will have to go up to the Government of India and he expects that it may take some time. I accept it. But what is the use of embodying these principles in legislation when we cannot apply those principles immediately to the case of these districts ? When we finish all these districts the principles will have to be invoked only after thirty years when we resettle the districts. My Honourable friend Mr. V. K. Ramanuja Achariyar has opposed the resolution. I have always got the greatest respect for his views especially on resettlement questions. He says that these settlements are killing poor people and he wants to abolish resettlements altogether. As an alternative method I suggested that these principles might be formulated by way of legislation so that the Legislative Council must have some hold on these matters.

"I need not say anything more except as regards financial aspect, whatever increment is supposed to come from the land revenue settlement. I think it is bound to come in course of time. I daresay the resources of the Government will be augmented ; people cannot escape taxation. They will have to bear this additional burden but only I have been pleading that, let them bear the burden on certain well-defined principles which after full discussion in the Legislative Council are embodied in law."

The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. TODHUNTER :—"The Honourable Member, if I understand him aright, has now shifted his ground. He no longer proposes to postpone resettlement. He wishes the preliminary operations which are now going on to continue. He complains however, that the Legislative Council has no power at present to alter the principles enunciated in a scheme report. So far as this goes, I would point out to him that the scheme reports are published and that any Member of this Council has the right to move a resolution upon one. I submit to the Council, therefore, that we should carry on on the present basis until a new basis has been found. And in this connexion, I should like to mention that, whatever new principles we may adopt, it seems likely that there will have to be a levelling up of existing settlements before we can apply the new principles to them. This, in fact, is one of the important conditions of the several interesting schemes which I have seen stated in the newspapers. If we are to have this process of levelling up before we embark on any new principles, then I think it is clear that we ought to carry on on the present basis until the new principles are settled."

The Hon'ble the VICE-PRESIDENT :—"I take it that the Honourable Member wants to take a division on the motion."

The motion was put to the vote and lost.

RESOLUTION *RE* APPOINTMENT OF INDIANS TO ASSIST MR. A. R. KNAPP IN EFFECTING ECONOMY IN GOVERNMENT EXPENDITURE.

The Hon'ble Mr. B. VENKATAPATI RAJU :—" Mr. President, the resolution which I have the honour to move runs as follows :—

'XIX. This Council recommends to the Governor in Council that the Government be pleased to appoint one Indian official and one Indian non-official to assist the Hon'ble Mr. Knapp in the matter of economising Government expenditure in the various departments.'

"This Government is alive to the consideration of economising expenditure, because I understand that before the Hon'ble Mr. Knapp was appointed to look after this business, Mr. Tottenham had been appointed for some time and I take it that the Hon'ble Mr. Clegg also had been appointed for some time. But anyhow we have the Hon'ble Mr. Knapp specially appointed to economise expenditure. This war which has shaken the world has shaken the foundation of finance of several countries. For the problems which we thought would be very considerable and important in the pre-war days we have to spend several crores where we thought lakhs would do. In those circumstances it is well that this Government has taken the earliest opportunity of appointing a special officer to look into this matter and I believe the other Provinces are following us in this direction ; and I may invite the attention of this Council that even in England they have appointed what they call Reconstruction Committee with Lord Haldane as the Chairman and Mr. Montagu as another Member with two heads of Financial Departments and with two representatives of industries and a Member of Parliament to consider this question. They have worked hard for a period of 18 months from July 1917 to the end of 1918. They have presented several suggestions as to how best to economise expenditure and even England is not the first because we know even in Germany the Prussian Diet has been appointing officials and experts to find out the best method of economising expenditure and gentlemen you will find what America has done in this direction was the best reform, because during the time of the Presidentship of Mr. Taft of the United States, in the year 1912, he approached both the Houses of Congress with a message that unless they economised the expenditure and unless they found the best method of utilizing the money raised from the people

to secure to the people the best advantage without allowing a single pie to run to waste it would be disastrous. With that object in view they appointed a Commission in 1912 which sat for several years. Their method I think we can very well adopt in our Province. Their method is after personal study of each department to draw a sketch of its functions, organizations and methods, to settle with the department itself and make constructive suggestions. Because Mr. President, it is not enough to sit at one place, send for papers or to ask several heads of departments to come to him and to have a talk on business matters. What they have done in America you must do similarly go and find out: how the work is being carried out, whether there is not possibility of reducing the staff or minimising the expenditure or suggesting some other method of finding efficient way of saving money. When such advanced countries as America and England thought it necessary, I do not think India would say, we do not want any special officer to look into the matter and suggest methods but my resolution is not only that Mr. Knapp should do it but what I wanted is that he should be assisted and you may pertinently ask why he should be assisted by an Indian official and an Indian non-official. I say, whatever it may be said, it is generally claimed and accepted by all without any exception that European mind has got the driving power, originality and initiative to keep discipline and several other virtues but there is another thing which they generally lack, the industry and patience to look into the figures, which we can easily find in an Indian because he would be at it. To look into the figures is a bugbear. If you go to the Financial department, you will find from the lowest wrung of the ladder Indians helping the Government in various ways and it is not too much to ask that in the matter of figures it is far better to rely upon Indian help and therefore I suggested an Indian official, but I may say at the outset, whoever is wanted, official or non-official he must be agreeable to the temperament of the Hon'ble Mr. Knapp. Otherwise it would not serve any useful purpose. You must have a harmonious body to work together with Mr. Knapp. An Indian official who has worked in all these departments from a clerk upwards knows perfectly well which clerk has got much work, which clerk has not got work at all, who are not doing useful work, who are useless for the department. He knows perfectly well from personal experience what branch of the work is being carried on without difficulty and what branch of work is being carried on causing unnecessary waste of public money. Therefore I suggested an official whom the Government may take into confidence. I suggested also an Indian non-official, the reason being that whatever it may be said it is absolutely necessary in days to come that they should be in complete touch with public opinion. Complete touch with public opinion will only come in when they will freely have got the assistance of a non-official who knows these matters and knows how the people are suffering under the administration of several departments. They know perfectly well what to do: the officials may bring it to the notice of their superiors how several departments work. A non-official who has freshness of mind can assist in the reduction of the cost of the administration. Of course he is not an expert in the sense that he knows the details of this business but he knows this, that how far this routine business is affecting the country. For that purpose I suggest a non-official also may be taken in whom the Government have confidence. It is necessary that every department must be thoroughly overhauled from the muchi up to the highest officer and it is not enough that some seven or eight clerks are removed because they would not come up to one day's salary of high officials. We must see how an efficient administration can be carried on at less expense. You must make the best use of the money you collect from the people and that is the reason why in most civilized Governments they employ what they call a Minister of National Economy and we will one day see Mr. Knapp himself Minister of National Economy for our Province. And therefore it is but fair that he should be ably assisted by able persons in order to thoroughly sift the matter and present the report in due course taking its own time so that the Government will be compelled to adopt the methods because generally, Mr. President, every department says that it is undermanned, the staff is not sufficient, the work is too much for the hands they employ.

"The Finance Member has to see whether the whole amount spent in any department is absolutely necessary, because from the same fund he has to distribute to several departments. If each department's suggestions and recommendations were to be accepted I do not think any Finance Member would bear the burden for a moment, because every department wants to suggest increase and if those recommendations were to be accepted in toto it is hopeless for any Government to finance. Therefore the Finance Member will always look into the matter and see whether the expenditure is absolutely necessary, and in order to help the Finance Member we must have a report by a board who have got not only an expert knowledge but also who are in touch with the public and present all useful suggestions so that there may be every possibility to economise. When the Government are alive to this and has appointed an officer I am only suggesting an additional help to that officer to enable him to come to a correct conclusion. I think our Presidency also would be largely benefited. Under these circumstances I commend the resolution to the acceptance of this Council."

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur T. Balaji Rao Nayudu :—"In seconding the resolution I beg to invite the attention of the Honourable Members of the Council to the remark that I made at the budget speech about the increase of work in all the departments and the likelihood of curtailing some portions of it. The Government were pleased to say that the matter has already been taken in hand and that an officer would be appointed to examine the question and put forward proposals. What the Honourable Mover now says is that the appointment of two

Indian Assistants—one official and one non-official—under Mr. Knapp is necessary. The appointment of a non-official seems to be necessary because every department will say that it is undermanned, that there is more work and that more establishment is required, and the official is ordinarily inclined to side them, whereas a man who is not in service is apt to see more to the interests of the public, and say how the saving could be arrived at. I therefore second the proposition moved by the Hon'ble Mr. Venkatapati Raju in suggesting that the Hon'ble Mr. Knapp be given the assistance of one Indian official and one Indian non-official."

The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. TODHUNTER :—" The main reason why I have to oppose this resolution is that the Honourable Mover gives us credit for good deeds which we have not done. I am afraid I shall disappoint him when I say that it is no part of Mr. Knapp's functions to carry out a campaign of economy on the scale which he imagines. Mr. Knapp is first of all employed on questions connected with the Reforms, which alone gave full time work to an officer before his appointment. In addition to this, he has a number of duties connected with the visit of the Prince of Wales and in addition to that he is engaged on the question of carrying into effect the recommendations made by Mr. Tottenham for improving the working of the offices, which it is hoped will also be followed by a reduction in establishment. He has not, however, been directed to make a campaign of economy in all departments of the Government. That would be an immense task which could not be completed within the six months for which he is appointed. I think Honourable Members of this Council will agree that he has quite as much as he can do in the time.

" As regards giving him the assistance of an Indian officer, he already has, as an assistant, an Indian officer who has all the qualities which the Honourable Member has declared to be necessary. I refer to M.R.Ry. Rao Sahib V. Gopalakrishna Ayyar, who is one of the best officers we have in the Secretariat. So far, therefore, we are in agreement.

" It remains to be considered whether we could attach a non-official to Mr. Knapp. Since his inquiry is not a general inquiry into economies, but only one into the placing of Government offices on a more business-like footing, I don't think that it would really help to post any non-official gentleman to assist him. On the other hand, I think the Honourable Mover will agree that we can hardly ask a non-official gentleman to go and sit by the side of the clerks to show them how to keep their books better.

" What the Honourable Member has in mind, however, is a very much larger question and one into which we may perhaps later on be compelled to go. It is perfectly true, as he has said, that the war has brought about a complete alteration of the situation. To anyone who observes the systems of Government in the different provinces, it is, I think, a striking fact that each partakes very much of the character of the people of the province concerned. I will not give instances from other provinces lest I should say that which might displease. But in the case of Madras, I think it will be agreed that, as the Honourable Member has indicated, the genius of the people tends to meticulous and painstaking care, and tends, if anything, too much to reduce every administrative matter to ten places of decimals. This characteristic, coupled with an exceptionally cheap and efficient subordinate staff, has resulted in a system which is the pride of Madras and the despair of its rivals. Whether it be in the planting of millions of survey stones or in the marking of thousands of toddy-bearing trees, we carry our procedure to a degree of detail which is not attempted elsewhere. As more than one official from the north has said to me, 'The first thing you people in Madras seem to do is to go and put a number on everything you can see.'

" Now, this system of meticulous detail has in the past been extraordinarily successful in bringing in revenue. Instead of settling with the village as they do in the north, we have settled with the individual ryot, with the result that we add to our revenue what would otherwise go to the middleman. Similarly as regards abkāri and many other matters.

" But while this was all very well while we had, as I have said, a very cheap and efficient subordinate agency to rely upon, matters are going to be very different if we are practically going to double that agency's pay. Our profit will be turned to loss, or at any rate reduced below the returns of the more rough and ready systems of some other places, and the question arises whether we shall not have to consider the revision of the system as a whole with a view to the drastic cutting down of the numbers of the establishments, while we increase their pay. If we do decide that we must reconsider our policy on these lines, I think Honourable Members will agree that we shall be undertaking a gigantic task. It will not be a question of cutting off a return here and there or the elimination of a few clerks and peons, but the revision root and branch of the whole system, which is clearly not a matter that can be done in six months.

" Meanwhile, we are doing what we can on the basis of the inquiries made by Mr. Tottenham, while we are also examining the increase in salaries which must be given on account of the enormous increase of prices which has taken place. Meanwhile, again, if Honourable Members have any such line of economy to suggest, we shall only be too glad to consider their suggestions. But as I have said, the scope of inquiry entrusted to Mr. Knapp during his six months of inquiry is limited. He has already an Indian official to help him and I don't think it will serve any useful purpose to associate a non-official with him at present."

The Hon'ble Mr. B. VENKATAPATI RAJU :—" Mr. President, I am glad to learn from the Hon'ble Mr. Todhunter that an able Indian official has been given to assist Mr. Knapp, and

I am delighted to learn from the communiqué that the Hon'ble Mr. Knapp is going to suggest methods of economizing expenditure. If it is not done systematically, I think the Government would reconsider the whole position because any amount that has been spent on such an inquiry, even though it be Rs. 20,000, would save several lakhs on that account.

"If the Hon'ble Mr. Knapp who has been deputed by the Government for period of six months is to be elevated to some higher appointment after the period of his duty, they should find somebody else who may be able to continue the work and do it thoroughly. He should go to every district, and taluk, he should see every public office and see how work is carried on and how best the expenditure can be minimized. There is no use of hastily finishing this mode of inquiry; we must have a patient and persevering inquiry. What is being done in America? It is a highly civilized country and we see very able persons there are obliged to sit year after year to economize the national expenditure. It is not too much for me to ask this Government to employ a full-time officer, not a part-time officer like Mr. Knapp who has got multifarious duties to do—arrangements regarding the reception of His Royal Highness the Prince of Wales, work in connexion with the reforms, etc. We must have a full-time officer solely devoted to that purpose, because it is a life and death question so far as financial matters are concerned. It is not a matter which can be done at leisure moments. If the Government take it so lightly, I am afraid we shall not arrive at any real economy in the matter of finance. We must have a thoroughly able body which will go deep into the matter and which will present useful suggestions with a view to real economy. I do not press this resolution but I leave the question to be settled by the Government, especially the Hon'ble Mr. Todhunter, who is looking after the financial interests of this Presidency, in order to find out how several lakhs can be saved out of the expenditure of several crores."

The resolution was by leave withdrawn.

RESOLUTION *RE* ADVERSE REMARKS OF OFFICERS ON REPORTS OF LOCAL BODIES.

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur T. N. SIVAGNANAM PILLAI:—"The resolution that I propose to move runs as follows:—

'XX. This Council recommends to His Excellency the Governor in Council that in all cases in which adverse remarks are made by intermediate officers on reports submitted to Government by chairmen of municipal councils and Presidents of Local Boards, copies of those remarks be forwarded to the latter for explanation or criticism before Government pass orders thereon.'

"This is a very simple proposition and I do not know whether many words of mine are needed to demonstrate it. Nobody is likely to question the necessity for a resolution like this. Government themselves have admitted the principle of it as they have inserted a provision similar to this in section 33 of the new Municipal Act in the case of administration reports. My suggestion is that not only in the case of administration reports but in the case of other reports submitted to the Local and Municipal Department in connexion with the local fund and municipal matters, the presidents of local boards and the chairmen of municipal councils must be given an opportunity of either explaining or criticizing the remarks of intermediate officers. As a matter of fact, it is from actual experience that I say that such a provision is absolutely needed. It was only yesterday that some such thing came before the Council; if that matter had been referred to the municipal council in the first instance, probably a lot of writing would have been saved. Now however we are on the right side and so, in the case of all reports sent by the chairmen of municipalities and presidents of local boards, I suggest that the remarks made by intermediate officers may be communicated to the bodies concerned. I do not want the Government to communicate confidential remarks. If, however, on the basis of confidential remarks made by intermediate officers, Government are going to take any action prejudicial to the municipality or the local board, it seems but fair that the Government should communicate those remarks. With these few words I commend the resolution for the acceptance of His Excellency the Governor in Council."

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur N. SUBBA RAO:—"I beg to second this resolution. When the Municipal Act was considered in the Select Committee as well as in this Council, I was always advocating that the Collector must be considered as an agent of the Government on their behalf and no more; and that he ought not to be considered as an autocrat or a gentleman who has got control over the municipal administration. As has been pointed out by the honourable mover, the principle has been accepted by the Government in the matter of section 33 of the Municipal Act. It would be good thing that there should be an open criticism, that is to say, if the Collector finds any defects in the municipal administration and disagrees with the views of the municipality or its chairman, an opportunity should be given to the chairman to explain matters; but what is being done now-a-days is that a good many things are said against the council or against the chairman which he is not able to rebut. It is in fairness, I should

submit, sir, that an opportunity should be given to the chairman and to the council, especially when the Government is going to be an arbitrator of questions in which the municipal council and the Collector disagree. For these reasons I second this resolution."

The Hon'ble Mr. R. A. GRAHAM :—" Mr. President : I do not think it is possible to accept the principle contained in the resolution as originally framed, that in all cases in which an officer of Government makes a remark on a report from a local board or municipal council his remarks should be communicated to the president or chairman as the case may be. As Mr. Subba Rao has said the Collector is an agent of the Government. As an agent of the Government, he must be free to make such remarks as he considers necessary on any proceeding of the local body and his remarks must ordinarily be entitled to privilege. But I am instructed to say that the Government are prepared to agree that where it is intended to take action on remarks made by a Collector the president or chairman should be entitled to know what they are. Therefore, if the Honourable Member is prepared to modify the resolution slightly so as to make it run thus :—

'This Council recommends to His Excellency the Governor in Council that when adverse remarks are made by intermediate officers on reports submitted to Government by chairmen of municipal councils and presidents of local boards copies of those remarks shall ordinarily be forwarded to the latter for explanation or criticism in cases in which the Government propose to base their orders thereon.'

"The Government are prepared to accept."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur T. N. SIVAGNANAM PILLAI :—" I shall gladly accept the amendment."

The Hon'ble Mr. R. A. GRAHAM :—" In these circumstances I am instructed to say that the Government are prepared to accept the resolution."

The Hon'ble the VICE-PRESIDENT : —" As the amendment has been accepted, I shall put the resolution as amended to vote."

The resolution as amended was put to the Council and carried.

RESOLUTION *RE* LOCATION OF THE GOVERNMENT LEPER HOSPITAL.

The following resolution which stood in the name of the Hon'ble Mr. M. C. Raja was not moved as the Honourable the Additional Member was not present :—

" XXI. That this Council recommends to His Excellency the Governor in Council to be pleased to remove the Government Leper Hospital, which has been recently removed to the Natal Emigration Depot, Kassimode, Madras, from the Monegar Choultry to a better and more sanitary spot such as Vyasarpadi, Guindy and Pallavaram."

RESOLUTION *RE* PAPER INDUSTRY.

The Hon'ble Mr. P. SIVA RAO :—" Mr. President, the resolution I propose to move stands thus :—

'XXII. This Council recommends to His Excellency the Governor in Council that the possibilities of paper-making in this presidency may be investigated.'

"The Honourable Members of the Council are aware of the world crisis in paper which has been prevailing for some time past and they are also aware that the prices of paper have gone up most abnormally sometimes 500 and 600 per cent, selling at 5 or 6 times its former value. Now, any means of relieving this world crisis in however humble a manner will be a welcome step. I propose that so far as this Presidency at least is concerned that some scheme may be started to make paper out of bamboo pulp. I have got an elaborate note in my hand published under the auspices of the Government of India known as 'The Indian Forest Record' by Mr. R. F. Pearson. It is a very elaborate note which contains the research and a very full inquiry of the possibilities of paper-making especially of bamboo pulp. It is noted here in this report that some select divisions throughout India were selected for experiment. In the Madras Presidency similar places were also selected one in the South Kanara district, one in North and South Malabar forest divisions. There is a complete note as to the present condition of the paper pulp, and various other cognate matters, bamboos, their mode of growth, possible outturn and even the cost of manufacturing bamboo paper pulp. I need not detain, the Honourable Members of the Council with a detailed account of the results arrived at in the course of this inquiry. The book is a Government publication and it can be easily referred to.

16TH JULY 1920.] (*Mr. Siva Rao ; Mr. Subba Rao ; Mr. Campbell.*)

"That establishes that paper-making out of bamboo pulp is a commercial success. It is also pointed out by various experts who can speak with authority on the point that if this industry is only taken up earnestly, that India can soon be one of the world's sources of paper supply. And then, it is further stated that with the abundance of materials India can easily be made independent of paper imports from outside if favourable facilities are granted. She can supply other countries. That is the expert opinion of people who have some familiarity with the subject and who can form an opinion in the matter. It is also noted that India requires 80,000 tons of paper whereas it produces only a very limited quantity of about 30,000 tons.

"Since I sent up this resolution, a company has been formed known as 'the Carnatic Paper Mills, Limited, Madras.' Its object is to start the paper-making business in important centres in this Presidency in or about Madras, and at such other places as the Directors may think proper. It is going to erect mill or mills of the most modern and approved type for the manufacture of paper and paper pulp and straw boards. This company has been formed with well-known directors. It is entirely an Indian concern. I do not want Government now to start this industry on its own initiative or to further investigate the possibilities of paper-making. All that I want to do under the present circumstances, is to appeal to the Government to render as much help as it can to the Carnatic Paper Mills by way of leases of bamboo forests. I make another earnest appeal to the Forest department to render all help to this company which has been formed."

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur N. SUBBA RAO :—"I have great pleasure in seconding this resolution. I think this is a very important matter and that the Government will view it with the respect that it deserves. I may preface my few remarks by reading out what Lord Meston said while presiding at a lecture in the National Liberal Club on the question of Indian poverty. From this morning's paper we can see what he has said. It is to the following effect: 'If India was to continue her progress there must be a large advancement in State assistance based upon the fullest development of her industries and the increasing prosperity of her people.' Lord Meston himself who has an intimate knowledge of the needs of the country has said so. I therefore submit, sir, that in this matter in which already the people are taking an interest and for which there can be no better evidence than our own retired District Forest Officer Rao Bahadur Alwar Chetti who is connected with the Carnatic Paper Mills has come to-day to watch the proceedings.

"It is the bounden duty of Government to help us in industrial development to the best of their resources. I know that in my district when a German Company before the war asked for some information, the District Forest Officer asked the Ranger who supplied some very little information. That is not the sort of information that we want. What we require is that the Forest department must investigate through a special officer, if possible, into the possibilities of producing paper pulp; because there are certain districts which abound in bamboos, trees and shrubs, etc., which can certainly produce any amount of pulp.

"But none of us know what it is and the Forest Department has not, I say without fear of contradiction, attempted much in this direction. Regular investigation should be made and the Forest department must place the information before the public as to which are the forests which can produce the raw material, to what extent and the area, the facilities of transport, etc. In fact, everything that will tend to facilitate in producing the paper pulp should be furnished to the public. Then the Department of Industries must take up the information in hand and give us further information as to the cost of the plant required and all facilities and information for running such companies. I have already stated in my budget speech that we, Indians, do not have opportunities, the training and facilities for helping in the industrial regeneration. It is the Government, as Lord Meston says, that should render assistance in this matter. With these few words, I second the resolution."

The Hon'ble Mr. A. Y. G. CAMPBELL :—"Mr. President: when I read the terms of this resolution I was anxious to learn what the Honourable Mover wanted us to do. I gather that his particular desire is that the Government should give special assistance to the Carnatic Paper Mills Company. I understand that that company intends to work on bamboo forests in the Northern Circars. They have been in correspondence with the Chief Conservator of Forests and he has already directed that the District Forest Officer should make a survey of the bamboo area and submit a report, with a map of the bamboo country showing the rivers, streams, roads, and other communications, and information regarding the labour supply and the present methods of working bamboo forests. I believe that when that information is obtained, it may be of considerable value to the company and will prove to be what the company desire to have. The Hon'ble Mr. Subba Rao referred to other matters. I think his request for a general investigation has been largely answered by the Honourable Mover, who referred to Mr. Pearson's report, in which will be found three definite schemes for the establishment of paper pulp factories on the West Coast in this Presidency. The actual location of each factory is indicated in a map as well as the sources of supply, etc. But the present time may not be suitable for the establishment of pulp factories in the Malabar and South Kanara districts, because the bamboos have recently died and it may be some years before bamboos will be available in sufficient numbers for the purpose of supplying a factory. The question of paper-making has long been under consideration of the Government. I have a report here on the manufacture of paper pulp in Burma from which it appears that the Government of India took steps to collect information about the subject as far back as 1873 and the matter has been constantly considered by the

Government from time to time ever since. I think perhaps the best way of complying with the wishes of Honourable Members is for the Chief Conservator and myself to collect together and place before the public in a convenient form references to such information as is available from the published books and include any other information which has not already been published. We shall then be in a position to consider what further steps should be taken in respect of this industry. I hope however that those who establish paper mills will themselves obtain experts to investigate the questions involved; otherwise they would run the risk of incurring losses. I trust that the suggestion which I have made will meet the wishes of the Honourable Mover and seconder."

The Hon'ble Diwan Bahadur Sir P. TYAGARAYA CHETTI :—" Mr. President: I have been taking much interest in the matter of paper-making, and I have made several inquiries. At a public meeting held in Madras in December last, I made a suggestion that the banks of the Gōdāvari near Rajahmundry will be a very good place for a paper mill. No doubt Government experts have been recommending some place in South Kanara and the West Coast. Of late inquiries show that bamboos are flowering and it will not be possible within five or six years to get raw material, and so this company which has been recently formed, the Carnatic Paper Mill Company have thought that they must abandon that portion of their activities. There was a company here in Madras which was making and supplying straw boards to the Madras and Bombay Governments. That company has now arranged to form a new company by the name of the Carnatic Paper Mills Company with Rs. 10 lakhs of shares, and I believe they are now making very good progress in collecting money. They have also arranged to import machinery, which will come in in six or seven months. They have also arranged to have an expert to deal with the mills. So the Government will find that a company is coming forward to work this industry as satisfactorily as possible. Government have made investigations for several years and they have all the information in their fingers ends. All that the Company now require is some help, and not mere information. I do not say that the Government should render help for nothing: all that the Government should do is to supply material required to make pulp at a reasonable price. They must go with the determination to supply the material and I am sure it can be done. There is no use of simply saying 'we will inquire and do this and that.' That time is past. The time has come for decisive action. I hope the Government will make up its mind to support the company by supplying raw material of course for value, so that in a short time, i.e., by the beginning of next year, paper can be supplied by this company. We know what difficulty we have in getting paper and the difficulty is being increased every day, and the reports from Europe and America are that the forests are being denuded and perhaps there will be great shortage of raw material. But India perhaps contains a good deal of raw material. I trust the Government will come forward and support this industry as much as possible and make it a success. They should not merely supply information but must give active support in the matter, and I am sure the Hon'ble Mr. Campbell will help to make this concern a success."

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur T. NAMBERUMAL CHETTI :—" I consider that the possibilities of paper-making have already been established. There are more than six or seven mills working in Northern India with very good results. But they are not able to get pulp for their requirements. It is therefore a question as to how far the Government can help the Industry by reducing the seigniorage rates on forest produce. A scheme was recently prepared by the Cochin Government in which several inducements were given to the paper manufacturers and the Madras Government may well adopt any of the suggestions made in that scheme to encourage this pioneer industry — the Carnatic Paper Factory."

The Hon'ble the VICE-PRESIDENT :—" Does the Honourable Member propose to move an amendment ? "

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur T. NAMBERUMAL CHETTI :—" No. I am simply supporting that the agencies already at work should be given facilities. How far such help may be afforded to the company may be determined from the elaborate scheme which has been prepared by the Cochin Government."

The Hon'ble Mr. B. V. NARASIMHA AYYAR :—" I think the debate will be shortened if, in addition to the sympathetic statement which the Hon'ble Mr. Campbell was pleased to make, he proceeds further or asks the Hon'ble Mr. Cox to state whether any practical proof of the sympathy is going to be given in the direction. We know it is very difficult for the Hon'ble Mr. Cox to say that he will exactly be in a position to supply say 243 tons of pulp on a certain date. But what Honourable Members who are anxious to develop paper industry in this Presidency want to know is whether any practical steps are going to be taken and in what direction and to what extent."

The Hon'ble Mr. M. D. DEVADOSS :—" Mr. President: it is a trite saying that, when you want to shelve a question you appoint a Royal commission, this resolution only asks Government to make inquiries. We find that as a matter of fact some years ago a German started a paper mill. After the war, he was ordered to leave the country and that concern has now been acquired by an Indian firm. Seeing that an Indian Company has been formed and, that some very respectable persons are on the directorate, I think the Government will be well advised in lending support to this company by supplying raw materials. I do not for one moment suggest

16TH JULY 1920.] *(Mr. Devadoss ; Mr. Ahmad Tambi Marakkayar.)*

that the materials should be supplied free, but they should be supplied at such price as would be reasonable in the circumstances. We find that the value of paper has been going up. I was told only this morning that the price of paper had increased by 800 per cent, that is to say we have to pay eight annas now for paper that we used to buy for one anna. Even some of the newspapers are obliged to cut down their length as much as possible. That being so, I think it will be in the interests of the country if the Government will supply bamboo pulp to this company. I may tell the council that I have no interest in this company and I do not mean to have any interest.

"This company is going to send for an expert from Europe and they have also indented for machinery and it is very likely that they will be able to start operations early next year. So I would ask the Government to give at last a guarantee that they will give the required supply of raw materials from the forest close by. Unless they get that assurance, I do not think the company will be a success. We find that excepting in a few zamindari tracts there are no large bamboo forests. All the bamboo is practically the monopoly of the Forest department and, unless the Government is prepared to make a concession in the interests of paper industry, I do not think the company will be a success. There is no use of shelving the question by merely asking the Department of Industries to go into the matter. I do not think any useful purpose will be served by making an inquiry of that nature. An elaborate enquiry was made by a Government of India expert. Of course an inquiry should be made as regards the probable quantity of raw bamboo available from the forests and where it can be cheaply transported."

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur A. T. G. M. AHMAD TAMBI MARAKKAYAR :— "As one of the managing directors of the Carnatic Paper Mills, Limited, I wish to say a few words for the information of this council. While thanking the Government for the sympathetic answer given by Mr. Campbell, I wish to request him that he will be so good as to give due consideration to this important industry, the first industry that was started in the Madras Presidency. I should like to give a brief history of this company. I am very glad that an opportunity had presented itself to me to place before the council a brief review of the world's situation in paper and what the new company has done till now and what it has proposed to do for the development of this new and growing industry in the Presidency.

"You know that paper is next in importance to food and clothing andplays a prominent part in our daily life I cannot tell you about the importance of paper, better than reading out to you a portion from the prospectus which says—

'It is needless to mention how important and necessary an article paper is. It is an article of every day use and is used by everybody. And the spread of education throughout India is creating more and more daily the need for this important commodity, so much so, that we cannot think of progress and advancement of civilisation in the country with paper left out!'

"In fact I may say that world's progress depends very much upon paper.

"Now coming to the question of supply and demand till now, it is known that the world's annual average consumption of paper is more than 12 million tons and this whole quantity has been supplied from Scandinavia and Canada. But these two countries are now unable to cope with the situation for two reasons; firstly their forests have been tapped to the fullest extent and are hence unable to meet the daily growing demand and secondly that they cannot produce the finished article as before, on account of the industrial unrest throughout the entire globe as a consequence of the last European war. Even were it possible to obtain large quantity of pulp annually, it could not be had except at a price which will not allow of the finished article being vended at other than exorbitant prices. This is the exact position in which the European paper manufacturer finds himself to-day and this will also disclose the world's position in the paper trade.

"Now coming nearer home, India has been consuming and is likely to consume a large percentage of the world's production. According to the information available, India consumes annually about 80,000 tons of paper of which she produces only about 30,000 tons per year in all her seven paper mills. For the rest of the quantity she has to depend upon foreign supply. But the foreign supply has now become a matter of uncertainty. There is, therefore, no reason why the entire resources of the country should not be profitably employed in the development of this important industry. It is believed that India can produce nearly 20 million tons of pulp for paper, from her bamboos and grasses annually. These raw materials have been experimented upon, more than half a century ago, both by private individuals and by the Government experts and have been pronounced to be the best and the cheapest raw material for paper-making. Hence I may confidently say that the question of utilising bamboo and other many varieties of raw materials in the paper manufacture has now been solved and the whole thing has now passed the stage of discussion, and is now more a practical commercial problem than a mere trial investigation.

"To utilise the raw materials obtainable in the Madras Presidency for the manufacture of paper and to put paper-making industry on a commercial basis, the present company started its work more than two years ago under the name and style of the 'Carnatic Paper Factory' for the purpose of making pulp and boards and was owned and managed by two well-known personages Rao Bahadur V. Alwar Chetti and Mr. H. Nowroji. These are the promoters of the new limited company. As some of you might know, that Mr. Alwar Chetti was a forest officer, he was actually investigating and experimenting on the various forest raw materials that could be used in the manufacture of paper pulp. And Mr. Nowroji, a great engineer, gave the benefit of his engineering skill. Both these experienced and capable men made that small

(*Mr. Ahmad Tambi Marakkyar ; Mr. Davidson ; the Vice-President ; Mr. Todhunter ; Mr. Venkatapati Raju ; Mr. Siva Rao.*) [16TH JULY 1920.

factory grow in importance so much so that the Governments of Madras and Bombay patronised them for supply of straw boards. As days went on, the factory was unable to meet the growing demand and as things were in that state, they realised that it was high time for completing the original scheme of a big company for the manufacture of paper on a large scale. So they have commenced the work last year and deputed a capable young man on a visit to the various paper mills in Bombay and Calcutta with a view to work out the details and actual data."

The Hon'ble Mr. L. DAVIDSON :—" May I rise to a point of order, Sir, and inquire how the history of this company is relevant to the resolution ? "

The Hon'ble the VICE-PRESIDENT :—" Perhaps the Honourable Member will explain how he makes out that what he is reading is relevant."

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur A. T. G. M. AHMAD TAMBI MARAKKAYAR :—" I thought that by explaining this clearly it would be helpful to the Government and also that the council will know how far the company is taking interest in the development of this paper industry."

The Hon'ble the VICE-PRESIDENT :—" Has the Hon'ble Member got a great deal more to finish ? "

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur A. T. G. M. AHMAD TAMBI MARAKKAYAR :—" I have almost finished."

Continuing :—" He did not work well and after his return in the beginning of this year actual work of this company began and today you see the result of two years unostentatious and useful work, in the shape of the Carnatic Paper Mills, Limited.

" As is seen from the prospectus, the company has got shrewd business men with plenty of experience to their credit in its directors and that public will no doubt have the fullest confidence in them. I may say before this Council that the company has tackled and practically solved all the difficulties that naturally arise in the starting of such industrial concerns.

" As a result of the above fact necessary financial help is more an accomplished fact than a mere say.

" *Machinery.*—Though the machinery manufacturers at Home are handicapped on account of the labour troubles and are overloaded with the works for the world's reconstruction after the last war, I am proud to say that the company, through the exertions of Mr. Alwar Chetti, was fortunate to get most definite offers for the supply of necessary machinery and plant at very reasonable prices, in about five months from date. This is a crowning point in the history of this limited company."

The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. TODHUNTER :—" Mr. President, I rise to a point of order. The motion on the paper relates to an inquiry into the possibility of making paper and not into the prospects of success of a particular company."

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur A. T. G. M. AHMAD TAMBI MARAKKAYAR :—" *Experts*— The company has arranged to get sufficient number of European experts to construct and equip the mills and to run them. Besides this, the company has not forgotten that large industrial concerns like this should play a prominent part in the Industrial and Technical education of the Indian youths and to this end in view the company has proposed to send out a young man to Europe for practical training. This may be a beginning for the factories to be self contained.

" *Raw materials*—As has been stated above, the kind of raw materials suitable for paper pulp obtainable in Madras has been investigated and definite results have been obtained."

The Hon'ble the VICE-PRESIDENT :—" We really have nothing to do with the merits of the company about which the Honourable Member is so eloquent. At present the question is that the possibilities of paper-making in this Presidency may be investigated."

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur A. T. G. M. AHMAD TAMBI MARAKKAYAR :—" Lastly let me say one or two words. It rests with the Government to extend its unqualified support to the company which has put the industry on a commercial scale after careful investigation and experiment."

The Hon'ble Mr. B. VENKATAPATI RAJU :—" The Hon'ble Mr. Ahmad Tambi Marakkayyar has never intended to advertise a private firm as a managing director in the council. What he evidently wants is to mention to the council that the paper industry should be helped by Government whether it is a private company or not. I hope the Honourable Members will take it in that light and not as an advertisement of the Carnatic Mill."

The Hon'ble Mr. P. SIVA RAO :—" After hearing the Hon'ble Mr. Campbell, I see no reason whatever to divide the council on this question. His reply is very sympathetic. It was not my purpose to shelve the question. I quite agree with the Hon'ble Mr. Devadoss and the Hon'ble Mr. Namberumal Chetti that the manufacture of good white paper from bamboo in which this country abounds has been demonstrated to be a commercial proposition. All that need be done for the present is to appeal to the various departments to do as much as they can by way of getting help to this Carnatic Mill. The Hon'ble Mr. Campbell has stated that he would do his best to help in all possible manner. He has also told us that he with consultation with the Hon'ble Mr. Cox will give all available information in the matter. I only advocate the policy that was laid down in the last Industrial Commission's Report, the policy of rendering

active help to these industrial concerns. If that is promised or undertaken, I do not want to raise the question any further. Only I want friendly advice given by the Hon'ble Mr. Campbell to these companies. To entertain a genuine expert in this matter may be borne in mind."

The Hon'ble the VICE-PRESIDENT:—"I take it that the Honourable Member does not press the resolution."

The Hon'ble Mr. P. SIVA RAO:—"No."

The resolution was by leave withdrawn.

RESOLUTION *RE* ADDITION OF MECHANICAL ENGINEERING SECTION TO THE ENGINEERING SCHOOL AT VIZAGAPATAM.

The Hon'ble Mr. B. VENKATAPATI RAJU:—"Mr. President, the resolution which I have the honour to move runs as follows:—

'XXIII. This Council recommends to the Governor in Council that the Government be pleased to add a Mechanical Engineering Section to the Vizagapatam Engineering School at an early date.'

'The aim of the mechanical section of the school would be the provision of a sound technical training in the elements required in the various trades connected with engineering. The training to be given would combine both theory and practice, and would be so arranged that when the pupil left the school the instruction which he had received should not only have made clear to him the principles of the trade he wished to take up, but should have developed his intelligence and initiative and have enabled him to reason out things for himself and solve the problems which continually come up in every day work. The want of technical training prevents many a good mechanic from obtaining such posts as workshop foreman, mechanical overseer, shift engineer, or engineer in charge of a small factory.

'There is already a demand for trained mechanics, etc., in many small factories now existing in the province, and as the industries of the province develop there should be many more openings of this character. It is thought that as there are very few, if any, manual training classes in the ordinary schools, it might be advisable to start, at first, with a junior class of lads from 13 to 16 years of age. The entrance being either through a special examination, or the fourth form being taken as the qualifying standard of general education. This junior section would continue their studies in English and Mathematics, along with their workshop course, gradually adding to the curriculum engineering subjects. As the classes become better known, and with the development of manual training in ordinary schools, it would be possible to raise the entrance qualification, and to introduce purely technical subjects at the beginning of the course.

'The students should be taught not only the theory of the construction, running, and repair of various kinds of engines driven by steam, gas, oil, etc., but should be given thorough practical training in driving, maintenance and repair, in order that they may be qualified to take independent charge of the mechanical side of any small factory. Arrangements would have to be made for those who passed creditably through the school to have a further period of one or two years in large commercial or railway workshops.

'It might, perhaps, be found, advisable to divide up the students, after passing through the junior classes, into mechanics and artisans, the former continuing their theoretical as well as practical training, while the latter would drop the theoretical and continue practical work only.

'It would seem advisable that all students who are sufficiently qualified educationally, whether ultimately intended for civil or mechanical work, should spend at least the first year in the same classes, thus learning together those elements of engineering which are common to all. At the end of one or two years the classes might split up into civil and mechanical, respectively.

'If this proposal be accepted, there will be very little increase of staff required for at least one year after the new class is started. My proposal would cost, say, Rs. 3,000 to Rs. 4,000 the first year, Rs. 10,000 to Rs. 12,000 the second year and Rs. 4,000 annually in all subsequent years.

'It might be borne in mind that at present there are many maistris, and foremen so-called, in Engineering and other shops, in Madras, and elsewhere in the Presidency, who have risen from workshop apprentices. They have no theoretical knowledge, and cannot properly fill their posts. On the other hand, several mechanical engineers have been trained at the Madras College of Engineering who have little or no practical knowledge, and hence are unable to secure employment where practical knowledge is required. The class of men who are now proposed to be turned out are practical men, with enough general education, and theoretical training, to enable them to grasp principles as well as attend to details.

'Mr. President, though this is a local matter, because the Government, at a vast cost, wants to acquire a site close to Waltair and they want to have a school, it is better, instead of preparing persons with theoretical knowledge, if they could add up also a mechanical side as it would not cost much more than what it costs now. I do not know whether there are any other mechanical schools in any other place. At a small additional expenditure of Rs. 3,000 to 4,000 per annum, we can run a mechanical side of this engineering teaching. I therefore commend this resolution to the acceptance of the Council.'

(Mr. Narasimha Raju ; Mr. Campbell ; Mr. Venkatapati Raju.) [16TH JULY 1920.

The Hon'ble Mr. C. V. S. NARASIMHA RAJU :—" I rise to second this resolution. A resolution of similar nature for having a mechanical school in one of the northern districts was accepted by the Government, if I remember rightly, about the year 1914 or 1915 and the question then was whether the school should be located at Cocanada or at Dowlaishweram. Somehow or other, the question was shelved like many other questions for the location of technical institutions in the northern districts. I understand that the students in the school at Vizagapatam are now, according to the syllabus, to undergo mechanical training as well, but their mechanical training simply consists in attending to the drawing on black boards. It is not only necessary that the civil engineering students themselves should receive some practical course, but it is necessary that a separate mechanical class should also be added for the benefit of training more mechanics with necessary knowledge in theory as well. This proposition is brought forward to supply that defect and I hope that the Government will consider the question favourably."

The Hon'ble Mr. A. Y. G. CAMPBELL :—" Mr. President, mechanics are now trained in the St. Aloysius Industrial School at Vizagapatam. That school which is run by a missionary society is well known to the honourable mover and seconder of this resolution and also to other members coming from the northern part of the Presidency. The Government have recently given two valuable sites to the school and have promised financial assistance to it on certain conditions providing for the training of six apprentices a year and a course of four years. We believe that at present this provision is sufficient for Vizagapatam. It will be of little use to train men if they are not going to find employment on sufficient pay as soon as they are trained. But we hope that before long the Vizagapatam port will be improved and Vizagapatam will grow as an industrial centre. With that prospect in view we have already requested that land should be reserved in connection with the acquisition of land for the port. The land will be at the disposal of the Department of Industries for such purposes as the training of mechanics and similar artisans. But it would be premature at the present moment to start a mechanical training school there. With reference to the remarks of the Hon'ble Mr. Narasimha Raju I may mention that we propose to establish a mechanical engineering school at Bezwada for the Northern Circars ; that place is at present the biggest industrial centre in the Northern Circars. The scheme for the establishment of a school there is under preparation and I hope we shall be able to submit it to Government before many weeks have passed. The honourable mover referred to the difficulty which mechanics employed in workshops in Madras now have in obtaining better pay owing to the lack of theoretical knowledge and also to the difficulty which the men trained in the Engineering College have in obtaining employment for want of practical experience. Those difficulties are dealt with by the Indian Industrial Commission in their report and they recommended the establishment of trades schools where mechanics employed in workshops could obtain elementary technical education. We have established such a school in Madras, called the Madras Trades School. It has proved a considerable success and is very much appreciated by the trades, both by the employers and the employed. We hope before very long to improve that school and enlarge its activities. It is proposed to start a similar school at Vizagapatam when conditions justify the establishment of such a school. There will be certain difficulties in opening a branch of the civil engineering school for the training of mechanics. The civil engineering school is being started at Vizagapatam with the object of training men for the subordinate engineering ranks of the Public Works Department, the Revenue Department and local fund staffs. The school is under the Department of Education. The Industrial Commission recommended that mechanical engineering training should be under the control of the Department of Industries and the same view is held by the Madras Government and has been endorsed at a meeting of the Directors of Industries held in Simla. If a mechanical engineering school is started at all, it should be a separate institution and not a part of the civil engineering school as it will be difficult to arrange for parts of the same institution to be controlled by different departments."

The Hon'ble Mr. B. VENKATAPATI RAJU :—" Mr. President, I am thankful to the Government for what was said by the Hon'ble Mr. Campbell, the Director of Industries. I know there is a school which was started by Father Emily, a Roman Catholic missionary, but we have our own grievances against that school ; it is not very popular. It was only last year that Mr. Suryanarayana Rao Pantulu brought forward a resolution about the inadvisability of the Government contributing any amount for this school and I learn that since that time some improvement has been effected. But anyhow being a Roman Catholic Mission, they take more interest in training Roman Catholics, whether they be Indians or not, and they do not care so much for non-Christians. The Government have introduced a clause that at least six non-Christians should be trained, but I find that very few non-Christians have been properly trained in that school. The matter requires some more attention on the part of the Government. Leaving that question aside, I am really thankful to Mr. Campbell for saying that a mechanical engineering school would be opened at an early date as necessity arises. But my point is this. Without much cost and with a small amount of money, a mechanical section can conveniently be added to the civil engineering section. Of course, the difficulty was pointed out by the Hon'ble Mr. Campbell that the mechanical section will have to be under the control of the Director of Public Instruction and the other section under the Director of Industries. But when both are under the Government, the co-ordination of departments can easily be made. Without co-ordination,

there will be waste of money. If we add a mechanical section to the engineering school, it will not cost more than 15 or 20 thousand rupees. Why should you not add that? The people learning theory should also learn some mechanics. In order to minimize the cost and also to utilize the opportunity when we are purchasing several acres of land, I only appeal to the Government that they may reconsider the point whether they cannot utilize the same site for the purpose of opening a mechanical section in the civil engineering school. I do not press the resolution, because it requires some more time for the Government to dive deep into the question, and I only appeal to the Government that they would reconsider the question in the light of my observations whether it is not possible to have a mechanical section added when you are building a new school for engineering purposes. We do not want persons with theoretical knowledge without knowing how to put it to practical application. Both sides should be joined in order to produce real knowledge; for that purpose I moved this rosolution; but I do not press it now."

The resolution was by leave withdrawn.

RESOLUTION *RE* CANCELLATION OF ORDER CLOSING STATE HOSPITALS AGAINST WELL-TO-DO CLASSES.

The following resolution, which stood in the name of the Hon'ble Mr. P. SIVA RAO, was not moved:—

"XXIV. This Council recommends to His Excellency the Governor in Council that the recent Government Order for the closing of the State hospitals against the well-to-do classes may be cancelled."

RESOLUTION *RE* OPENING OF AN AGRICULTURAL MIDDLE SCHOOL AT ANAKAPALLE.

The following resolution, which stood in the name of the Hon'ble Mr. B. VENKATAPATI RAJU, was not moved:—

"XXV. This Council recommends to the Governor in Council that the Government be pleased to open the Agricultural Middle School at Anakapalle without further delay."

RESOLUTION *RE* NON-OFFICIAL PRESIDENTS OF LOCAL BOARDS.

The Hon'ble Mr. P. SIVA RAO:—"The resolution I propose to move stands thus:—

'XXVI. This Council recommends to His Excellency the Governor in Council that the presidents of the local boards should be *generally* non-officials and *ordinarily* elected.'

"This is an old question and it has come up many times before this Council. This resolution relates to local bodies known as local boards. In the case of municipal councils this principle has been accepted in the statute itself. So far as the City Municipal Act is concerned, the President who is the chief executive officer of the Corporation is a non-official and he is also elected. Similarly in the case of the District Municipalities Act, which was passed very recently, this principle is equally well recognized that the chairmen of the municipal councils shall generally be non-officials and shall ordinarily be elected, unless under very grave circumstances the Governor in Council thinks it fit to lay down that there should be a nominated chairman. I want that this principle should be extended to local boards.

"We shall just see how the matter stands in the case of taluk boards. I may say that they are ordinarily non-officials. The policy of appointing non-officials to be presidents of these taluk boards wherever possible is extended day by day. I have not got much grievance with respect to that matter, and as regards the district boards also the policy of appointing non-officials wherever they are available is readily accepted and carried out in practice. But what I feel most is that in all these cases generally they should be elected as well. In the case of the taluk boards the system of election is gradually but slowly extended. I know that the Government tries a president for a term or two and then resolves to extend the system of election to the taluk boards. I want that it should be made a general rule that in all these cases the presidents should be chosen by the members of the boards. I may draw the attention of the members of the Council to the legislative policy which has been laid down in the joint report for the guidance of the Local Government. They suggest (paragraph 194 of the report) in the case of rural boards the Local Government will be urged to appoint non-officials and preferably elected chairmen wherever possible. But where there is a non-official chairman there may be

need also for a special executive officer whose appointment and removal will require the Government sanction. If any board desires to elect an official chairman, his election should be by a majority of non-official votes and should be approved by the Commissioner or some higher authority. So what is laid down in this is that in the case of rural boards, whether they are taluk or district boards, the Local Government will be urged to appoint non-officials and preferably elected chairmen.

"I may also draw the attention of the Honourable Members of this Council to the policy laid down in the same joint report. There should be, as far as possible, complete popular control in these local boards. I would ask how could there be complete popular control when the presiding head of that body is not chosen by the members of that board. The chain of responsibility will be complete only when the members of a particular board are appointed by direct election by the inhabitants or rate-payers in any rural area and also when the president is chosen by the votes of the members of the board. So, Sir, these two principles they have laid down for our guidance. Now, is there any reason why they should not be translated into practice? I remember the day, Sir, when I moved for the first time for the appointment of a non-official district board president. The Honourable Member in charge may remember that he gave me a reply 'not yet' and we then understood that 'not yet' meant coming of boons in the short future. Four or five months hence, five non-officials were nominated by Government and that was looked upon with great satisfaction. Now the time has come on the eve of these reforms that the Government should declare as their open and avowed policy that so far as possible election should be resorted to in filling up these offices and not nomination. I need not dilate upon the merits of nomination *versus* election and I may take it that it is an elementary canon of popular Government that in all possible cases election should be preferred to nomination. It may be said, I do not want to take up that issue, that the presidents so far appointed have been doing satisfactory work. I do not want to consider that view at all, because the discussion may probably descend into personal matters, and I strongly hold that it is not a relevant matter to be considered in a resolution like this. But I may say that a good president will not be a substitute for a popular president. What we require is that non-official presidents of district boards must be those who can command the confidence of the majority of the members of the boards. In carrying out his daily administration unless he commands that confidence he cannot get on with his administration. Now, Sir, election is the rule in almost all the statutes that have come before us. For instance, I have already referred to the District Municipalities Act, the City Municipal Act and the Judicial Panchayat Bill where the original provision was that the president of the judicial panchayat should be chosen, and out of deference to the almost unanimous wish of the Council the Government conceded and introduced this provision.

"Hereafter, the Vice-President of the Legislative Council shall be chosen by the majority of the Council. Even in the case of presidents of the coming Councils they want to retain the power of nomination only for a few years and afterwards they are going to make it an elected office. It may be said that at the outset, before starting this experiment, there was some reason for the Government to have the controlling power in their own hands. It is now time that these offices should be thrown open to election. The only objection that can be urged against this is about the danger of a wrong choice. I believe, Sir, that there is as much risk of a wrong choice when it is made by the Government as when it is made by the members of the local bodies.

"Now, we shall see what is the constitution of the district boards. Suppose the principle of election is extended to district boards. There will be about 36 members coming as representatives of the people from various parts of the district. The present district boards—not to speak of the future district boards which will be far more representative—consist of the Collector (even when the President is a non-official, the Collector continues to be a member of the district board), divisional officers who are ex-officio members according to the present Act, and tahsildars, some elected and some nominated, and many other respectable men of position and standing. Now I ask, could not these 36 individuals be credited with the wisdom of exercising the right choice in the matter? What is the result of nomination? Nomination is supposed to be made by the Governor in Council, but if we try to look into the matter further, it is done by a suggestion from the Collector. I take it that neither the Honourable Member in charge nor the Government is supposed to know who is who in a particular locality. They have to rely on the recommendation of the Collector. I would place before you two alternatives, viz., whether you would prefer to rely on the choice of the Collector, the divisional officers, tahsildars and the respectable men of the locality, or would you prefer to rely on the suggestion of the Collector of a district. The issue is perfectly simple. To my mind the time has come when the Government have to deny themselves the patronage which they have been exclusively using. The time has come when in consonance with the spirit of the times pervading all through elections should be substituted as far as possible in the place of nominations. I do not see any reason why the presidents of the district boards should continue to be nominated by the Government. I do not want to take up any more time in the matter. You are responsible, Sir, for taking the step of appointing five non-official presidents of district boards, and now I appeal to you to take one more step to make the popular control more complete and to bring district and taluk board administrations in consonance with the liberal spirit of the reforms that we are to have now. I decline, as I said, to enter into the controversy about the merits of the present district board presidents. They may be capable men. My reason for this resolution is that popular control will not be established by this power being centred in the Government; it must be made popular. With these words, I commend this resolution."

The Hon'ble Mr. B. V. NARASIMHA AYYAR :—" Mr. President, I rise formally to second it. I say formally because in dealing with the subject my honourable friend did not advert to the fact that this is a matter in which his non-official friends alone are going to give a decision without the necessity of the decision being given by a body composed of officials and non-officials. This is a matter which is connected with the Local Boards Bill which has been submitted to a select committee consisting of 20 gentlemen, of whom 17 are non-officials. I am quite sure that the Hon'ble Mr. Siva Rao, like myself, would like to have a decision from the 17 non-officials rather than from this Council. Of course, at this late hour, it is hardly necessary to argue the advantage of securing elected non-officials. The necessity for it is patent from the resolution itself. The only difficulty is about communal arrangements, which have to be made in one or two matters and which it is not necessary to go into now at length. I think therefore that the Council at this fag end of our sitting would rather prefer to await the decision of the Select Committee, where the discussion need not be subjected to a time-limit and may be much more free. It is very unfortunate that the Hon'ble Mr. Siva Rao is not on the Select Committee. That is just the reason why I did not rise to make the suggestion before he rose up. I think it will on the whole be better that we should postpone the discussion, as I am sure the discussion in the Select Committee will be far more effective and useful than in this Council."

The Hon'ble the VICE-PRESIDENT :—" May I know whether the Hon'ble Mr. Siva Rao has considered the aspect of the matter put forward by his seconder? If so, this resolution need not be discussed."

The Hon'ble Mr. P. SIVA RAO :—" I shall leave it to the Select Committee. I feel very strong in the matter. I do not think I have any voice in the Select Committee."

The Hon'ble the VICE-PRESIDENT :—" The Honourable Member will have a voice in this Council when the report of the Select Committee comes up."

The Hon'ble Mr. P. SIVA RAO :—" I have no objection."

The resolution was by leave withdrawn.

RESOLUTION *RE* WORKING HOURS IN SCHOOLS.

The following resolution stood in the name of the Hon'ble Mr. B. Venkatapati Raju: —

" XXVII. This Council recommends to the Governor in Council that the Government be pleased to take steps to have school hours in the mornings and evenings as far as possible in all schools, elementary, secondary and high schools, instead of, as at present, during the hottest part of the day, unless the boys wish it otherwise."

The Hon'ble the VICE-PRESIDENT :—" I understand that the Hon'ble Mr. Littlehailes will make a statement which will probably satisfy the Honourable Member who has given notice of this resolution."

The Hon'ble Mr. R. LITTLEHAILES :—" I beg to point out that the rules that we have at present allow for the hours of instruction in schools being either in the mornings, noons or evenings. There is nothing to preclude a school opening in the morning. In fact I have myself inspected schools at 7 o'clock in the morning. All that the Honourable Member desires is already included in our rules and all that is required is for the management of the schools to consider the local and climatic conditions of the locality and to adopt the hours suitable to the local conditions."

The Hon'ble Mr. B. VENKATAPATI RAJU :—" I do not press the resolution."

The resolution was by leave withdrawn.

The Council then adjourned for lunch at 1-53 p.m.

The Council reassembled at 3 p.m.

RESOLUTION *RE* EDUCATION OF THE BLIND, THE DEAF AND THE DUMB.

The following resolution, which stood in the name of the Hon'ble Mr. P. Siva Rao, was not moved :—

" XXVIII. This Council recommends to His Excellency the Governor in Council that an institution for the education and advancement of the blind and the deaf and the dumb may be opened in some suitable place in this Presidency."

RESOLUTION *RE* FORMATION OF ANDHRA PROVINCE.

The following resolution stood in the name of the Hon'ble Mr. B. Venkatapati Raju :—

"XXIX. This Council recommends to the Governor in Council that the Government be pleased to keep steadily in view that the Andhradesa comprising contiguous Telugu-speaking area of British territory in the Presidency should be self-contained in the matter of location of institutions, departments, offices and delimitation of jurisdictions as far as practicable, to facilitate the formation of an Andhra Province when the Parliament approves of it."

The Hon'ble Mr. B. VENKATAPATI RAJU :—"I will give notice again. I am not moving it now."

With the permission of the Hon'ble the Vice-President, the resolution was withdrawn.

RESOLUTION *RE* PAY OF SUB-REGISTRARS.

The following resolution stood in the name of the Hon'ble Mr. P. Siva Rao :—

"XXX. This Council recommends to His Excellency the Governor in Council that the salary and emoluments of the sub-registrars may be reorganized and improved."

The Hon'ble Mr. P. SIVA RAO :—"As regards this matter I may say that the reorganization of the Registrars was taken up and completed with effect from April 1919 and this very same matter was moved in this Council by the Hon'ble Mr. V. K. Ramanuja Achariyar, and then the Government almost pledged themselves to reorganize these officers as well. In February 1919, the Hon'ble Mr. V. K. Ramanuja Achariyar brought forward a resolution in this Council to the effect that a sum of Rs. 22,000 out of the reserve provision of 5 lakhs should be added to the provision under 'Registration' for the revision of the pay of sub-registrars, and then the following reply was given by the Honourable Member in charge, which amounts, in my opinion, to a pledge to take up this question as well. This is what the Hon'ble Sir P. Rajagopala Achariyar said: 'I quite admit that we have to reorganize the cadre of sub-registrars. But the reason why I object to committing this Council just now to these details proposed by the Hon'ble Mr. V. K. Ramanuja Achariyar is this: in connexion with the Public Services Commission we had a communication from the Government of India dealing mainly with district registrars. We have answered that reference and we have proposed a substantial improvement in the position, prospects, salaries, etc., of the district registrars. That has gone up to the Government of India, and under the rules we have to wait for a period of three months before we bring it into operation. A scheme about sub-registrars has also come up from the Inspector-General, and it is lying over for the other thing to be disposed of, because it is more convenient; because the maximum pay of the sub-registrars has to be fixed with reference to the minimum pay of the district registrar. The Public Services Commission recommended a minimum pay of Rs. 200, but we have put it at a somewhat higher figure. We have to reorganize our sub-registrars after knowing how the district registrars will stand. I may assure the Honourable Member that no avoidable delay will take place in the matter. As soon as the other thing is ready to be put into operation, we will take this matter into consideration. I hope to effect a revision which will be beneficial to the officers that are concerned, and the money needed for it, if brought into operation in the next official year, cannot be much and will be found by reappropriation; but the full scheme will come into operation only the year after that.'

"Several times I interpellated the Government on the matter and I got the same reply. In the Finance Committee the question was raised and same reply was given. Without taking any more time of the Council I shall just commend this resolution for the acceptance of the Council. The Government have given an undertaking in the matter which should be carried out.

"As regards the recommendations of the Salaries Committee they think that the duties of the sub-registrars are not exacting nor onerous, but the Government are still considering whether to accept their recommendations or not. But anyway hopes have been held out to this class of officers that their pay would be reorganized, and I think the promise ought to be kept up. I need not go into the question of surpluses in the registration department or whether the revenues derived therefrom are earmarked or not for the purposes of the department itself. If I had time I would have entered into all these matters. These are hardworked officers. They are doing more than their legitimate work. They are doing magisterial work also.

"We cannot plead that there is no money available. It is the declared policy of the Government of India to reserve the proceeds of this department for the improvement of the department itself either by multiplying the offices of sub-registrars or reorganizing the pay of the department. It was clearly laid down that this department will be made self-paying and its profits should not be made a source of revenue to Government. I move it for the acceptance of Government."

The Hon'ble Mr. M. D. DEVADOSS :—"I have much pleasure in seconding this resolution. When the Act of 1878 was passed it was distinctly stated by the Government of India that this department should not be made a source of revenue. This department is, I find from the budget, able to show a very large surplus over expenditure but I base my argument not on the fact that there is a surplus but on the fact that these men are underpaid. When this department was originally organized it was intended that graduates should be entertained in very large numbers. Even so recently as 1910—I have got the figures for some years—out of 60 appointments, 55 were to graduates, 4 to under-graduates and one to one without any special qualification. But when we come to later years, in 1917 out of 75, 52 were graduates, 21 under-graduates and 2 others and in 1918, 50 were graduates, 20 under-graduates and 4 others and in 1919, 38 were graduates, 20 under-graduates and 10 others. So you see that this department is losing its popularity so far as the graduate population is concerned because the emoluments are not attractive.

"It has been said that the work of a sub-registrar is not of a high intellectual order. Perhaps the lower ranks may not do very intellectual work but they have to rise in the scale and when they come to be District Registrars, they have really onerous work to do. Apart from that the work of the Registration Officer is a very important one because very valuable documents pass through his hands. Therefore unless we put them, I will not say above temptation but at least, above want, the department cannot be as efficient as it should be. Without taking up more time I would strongly urge on the Madras Government the desirability of increasing the pay of sub-registrars. There is good deal of disparity between the pay of a sub-registrar and a District Registrar. Moreover these sub-registrars are generally posted to villages where it is difficult to secure the necessaries of life.

The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. TODHUNTER :—"With reference to the Hon'ble Mr. Devadoss's remarks, I should like to say that I understand that the reason for the falling off in the number of graduates in this department is not the reason he has given at all. If he wants the real reason, I will tell him. The falling off is due to an endeavour to increase the proportion of non-Brahmans in the department.

"The Honourable Mover has detailed the history of this question and I do not propose to follow him into that matter. It is quite true that we did receive a scheme some time back and we did intend to take the matter up. But new considerations have arisen since that scheme was received. For one thing, Honourable Members will, I am sure, realise that the enormous increase in our salary bill has thrown our whole finances into disorder. At the same time, the report of the Salaries Committee has thrown a new light on the question of the comparative attractions of the different departments. The whole question is now being gone into and Mr. Knapp is making proposals for a general revision of salaries on a basis which will be fair to departments as a whole. On receipt of his report, the matter will be dealt with by Government as soon as possible. In the meanwhile, the sub-registrars have had their share of the temporary increase that has been given."

The Hon'ble Mr. B. V. NARASIMHA AYYAR :—"I do not wish to prolong the discussion after what the Hon'ble Mr. Todhunter has said. However he has not quite definitely given any ground for hope that there will be large increase in the emoluments of the sub-registrars. I think that the fact that we are now getting a large number of non-Brahman non-graduates (which is based on the sound policy of equalising distribution of offices among castes) is not in itself a good reason for cutting down the emoluments of the whole department and I think I may take it that there is no desire on the part of the Government to do any injustice to this very worthy class of Government servants and I hope that favourable consideration will be given to their claims."

The Hon'ble Mr. P. SIVA RAO :—"Sir, I do not see any object in pressing for a division. I must say that the Government have held out hopes. In the answer given to one of my interpellations in 1917 the Government stated that it would be taken up as soon as the Government of India had passed orders on the reorganization of services. I also remember that I mooted this point in the Finance Committee. Some considerations were mentioned to me as to why proposals were sent up with regard to District Registrars first and that this matter would be taken up and we all thought that this would be taken up and there would be a revision. It is the settled policy of the Government of India that funds must be made available for the purpose of the department. There is a large surplus and the whole of it is not a source of revenue to Government and these revenues ought not ordinarily be applied for the purpose of general administration. So in any way they must have some increase, say from Rs. 75 to Rs. 200 or to Rs. 250. The last grade of District Registrars starts on Rs. 250. The Salaries Committee class the sub-registrars with Revenue Inspectors. The sub-registrars have to do important work as I said in the beginning and I hope the Government will give their claims every possible consideration."

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur T. NAMBERUMAL CHETTI :—"Regarding their work, sub-Registrars are classed with tahsildars and deputy tahsildars, but in recommending their pay, the Salaries Committee have not given the same pay to the sub-registrars as they recommended to the tahsildars and deputy tahsildars. Therefore, in this respect, they are at a disadvantage. This anomaly should be rectified, and I hope the Government will view their case favourably."

The Hon'ble the VICE-PRESIDENT :—" I assume that the Honourable Member withdraws his resolution."

The Hon'ble Mr. P. SIVA RAO :—" Yes."

With the permission of the Hon'ble the Vice-President the resolution was withdrawn.

RESOLUTION *RE* INCLUSION IN CENSUS BOOKS OF INFORMATION REGARDING THE ECONOMIC CONDITION OF THE PEOPLE.

The Hon'ble Mr. B. VENKATAPATI RAJU moved the following resolution :—

" XXXI. This Council recommends to the Governor in Council that the Government be pleased to take necessary steps for recording, even in this Presidency, the economic condition of the people, in the course of the census operations, by opening columns in the census books showing income, expenditure, possession of cattle, extent of land, wealth and indebtedness."

In doing so, he said :—" I do not think we need go into the question whether it is necessary for the Government or for the people to know definitely the material condition of the people as a whole. It is recognised on all hands that in order to find out the material progress or prosperity of the people both the Government and the public should know if possible the real condition of the people. I understand though it has escaped my notice, that a circular was issued by Government which was commented in the *Madras Mail* that it is high time that we should give up the ethnological considerations but pay regard to the material condition of the people. As I was not able to get at it now, I did not read it now to the Council ; so I cannot say definitely about it. Possibly that is the view that was entertained by reading that article. Whether the Government of India are of that opinion or not, I think it is high time for us to know whether the people are in a prosperous condition or in penury. In order to find out that condition we have to open several columns. Hitherto the old system was there were about 16 columns in the census report mentioning the name, religion, married or unmarried, age—last birthday, race, principal occupation and subsidiary occupation, dependent or non-dependent, language, literate or illiterate in English, etc. Whether any or all of them serve any useful purpose I do not know. With reference to some we may say they are useful. With reference to others it matters little unless a very far-fetched inference can be drawn. But there are more important points we want to know with reference to the population of any locality, whether they have got sufficient means to live upon, etc. These things, perhaps it may be urged, are very difficult to know. Of course it may be difficult to know. But we will have some knowledge though all information regarding the salient points cannot be got. We must try our best to make it as accurate as possible. In other countries I do not know about the census but we have got statistics with reference to the income and wages, possession of cattle and various other matters and not only do they find these out once in ten years but at intervals with reference to any particular object, they will find out the real wages, wealth, indebtedness and various other points which are necessary to bring in some solution of their difficulties. The question is whether it is necessary for us to know it and if necessary, what means should be adopted ?

" I do not think there would be much difficulty in finding out from the statistics at present available to some extent the extent of land and the possession of the number of cattle, but the difficulty would be about finding out the income and the indebtedness. Perhaps in the rural parts, they might be afraid to give accurate information regarding their income in the fear that they would be charged income-tax and they might not give us proper information regarding their indebtedness. There may be difficulties, but the Government must insist upon their giving correct information in order to know the material condition of the people. I do not think any additional argument is necessary to show, at this time of the period in the 20th century, that the Government should know the material condition of the people. As I know perfectly well, they have not got any other means of finding it out. The Government are always asserting that the country is progressing and prosperous, while on the other hand the people are going down and are not at all in affluent circumstances and their poverty is well-known. In order to avoid all these disputes, and moreover for the Government to know whether the people are progressing from one decade to another decade, this information is absolutely necessary and I, therefore, earnestly appeal to the Government that they should adopt some means or other, I am not particular about the form of the resolution, to find out the true economic condition and the material progress of the people. Therefore, let us have something based on the foundation of facts."

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur N. SUBBA RAO :—" Mr. President, I beg to second this resolution and I do not mean much to say upon this subject, because it is in the interests of the Government as well as of the people to have such information so that the people might know what the real economic condition in this presidency is. The Government will be in a position, when they come to know what the economic condition in a particular district is, to take such

measures as to avoid all recurring expenditure on famine and they will be also in a position to further industries and to further all causes which will ensure to the benefit and advancement of such particular places. With these remarks, I second this resolution."

The Hon'ble Mr C. G. TODHUNTER :—"Mr. President, the Honourable Member proposes that the Government should take the necessary steps for recording 'even in this Presidency' the economic condition of the people. Does the Honourable Member mean to suggest that this is the last place in the world in which desirable reforms are undertaken?

The Hon'ble Mr. VENKATAPATI RAJU :—"Mr President, may I explain? What I mean is, if the other presidencies are backward, let us be forward."

The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. TODHUNTER :—"The Honourable Member has told us that to the many columns, I think he said 16, in the census form, he wishes to be added some more dealing with income, expenditure, possession of cattle, extent of land, wealth and indebtedness. Now, in considering whether we should secure the end he desires in the way he suggests I would ask Honourable Members to consider first the capacity of the staff which is employed to carry out the census, and secondly, what is the likelihood of the house-holders to whom the forms are tendered giving truthful answers to the questions put to them. As Honourable Members are aware, the enumerators at a census are mostly non-officials of the class of village schoolmasters. We have heard a good deal in a recent debate of the contempt in which the village schoolmasters are held. Is it likely that we should be able to secure through an agency of this sort answers from house-holders upon such an inquisition as it is proposed to put them through?"

"Then again how are we to ensure that the answers which we get will be truthful answers? Even in the simple forms which are now issued, I believe it is found sufficiently difficult to secure the truth in all instances. For instance, statisticans have found that there are variations in the numbers of ladies of different ages recorded which can only be explained by a greater economy of the truth among persons of certain ages in stating their years than in those of other ages. If you find a difficulty like this in a simple matter like age, how can you expect people to tell you the truth in the matter of their income, their expenditure, what they spend on their food and on their clothes? How is the Honourable Member going to enforce replies to these questions at all? He proposes to issue a by-law. Does he really think that the mere issue of a by-law would ensure compliance with a demand of this nature?

"In this connexion, I shall like the Council to consider what is the object intended to be served by a census and I will take the opportunity of reading a passage on this subject from Sir Robert Giffen's book on Statistics. He there states his opinion as follows:—"The main object of a census should be to establish the numbers, sex, age, conjugal condition and place of birth of the people. These facts are essential to many other branches of statistics. To go beyond them is to impose great difficulties on the compilers and to add greatly to the expense. If other objects are to be investigated, I should be disposed to recommend that there should be a census for that special purpose. It is not expedient to complicate the main census with them. Apart from the expense involved, I am of opinion that hardly enough has yet been made of the primary object of a census, and each addition of a new subject enhances the difficulties of handling the main facts which ought to be in the censuses."

"Now, I put it to the Honourable Mover that we have already going on just what Sir Robert Giffen recommends, namely, special censuses for most of the things to which he alludes.

"His first head is income, with which I will take a later one, wealth. As regards the first, we publish once in there years the most elaborate statistics of income under the Income-tax Act. If an enquirer wishes to know the number of vakils making incomes of over Rs. 50,000 a year, or the number of piece-goods merchants making an income of over Rs. 5,000, he will find them all set down there, and he will further find that the advance in the number of incomes under the various heads gives him a very fair idea of the increase in the wealth at any rate of large sections of the community. Another indication of wealth will be found in the capital of the companies registered under the Indian Companies Act, statistics for which are published annually by the Registrar of Joint Stock Companies, or again, in the values represented by the documents registered in the year, statistics of which are published by the Inspector-General of Registration. These, I think, are very much more reliable indices of wealth than would be statistics collected by enumerators from persons who would have to give admissions against interest if they were to reply truthfully to the enquiries of the enumerators.

"As to his next two heads, expenditure and indebtedness, I confess I am non-plussed to say how we could secure information regarding the whole population either through enumerators or in any other way. As the Honourable Member has remarked, we have some figures of expenditure in the consumption of goods, as for instance, piece-goods. We have some figures of indebtedness in the records of the transactions of co-operative credit societies. But, I can imagine no way of arriving at figures that would be at all reliable as to the indebtedness of the population as a whole. For one reason, there are so many that are both creditors and debtors at the same time and a long experience of income-tax work teaches me that it is difficult enough to say of any individual whether his debts exceed his loans without attempting to do it in the case of the whole population.

"When we come to the possession of cattle, we are on safer ground. Here we have quinquennial censuses taken for the special purpose, as Sir Robert Giffen recommends. The results are recorded in every village, where the village statistical register shows the increase and the decrease for a series of quinquennial periods. These figures again are compiled for the whole Presidency and are published by the Board of Revenue in the annual season and crop report.

"Similarly, though we have not exact figures as to extent of land, we have figures of amounts of pattas which are, I think, equally valuable. If we had not had these very carefully compiled figures, it would have been practically impossible for us to prepare the electoral rolls for the coming elections.

"I hope I have shown to the satisfaction of the Honourable Member that, except in the case of expenditure and indebtedness, we are already compiling separately, in accordance with Sir Robert Giffen's advice, the information which he desires to have recorded, and that any attempt to record it as part of the general census would be liable to result in the accumulation of a large amount of information which would be quite unreliable. I do not mean to say by this that we do not intend to collect such information as we reasonably can on the economic and industrial condition of the people in connexion with the census. The question how we can do this has recently been examined by the conference of Directors of Industries, whose conclusion so far agrees with Sir Robert Giffen's that they propose a separate census of industrial concerns to be conducted simultaneously with the general census, but by special enumerators. I am afraid we cannot undertake to embody in the already cumbrous general return particulars to show what each man eats and drinks and whether he owns 3 acres and a cow."

The Hon'ble Mr. B. VENKATAPATI RAJU :—"Mr. President, I am glad to learn that the Government propose to have different censuses to ascertain certain material facts. But to clear the minds of the members of this Council about the rosy side presented by the Hon'ble Mr. Todhunter about the figures which the Government already possess on the various points, I may be permitted to mention this. Each one of them will give not at all an accurate version but always a misleading version. I may be permitted to explain. First of all I shall take the cattle censuses which are produced once in five years—though in other Provinces they are produced once in three years and in some others every year—when we take it up, we find some figures included as guess work. Adding up guess figures along with actual figures, we will have a guess total. Apart from that there is practically no actual census of cattle, sheep or goats, with reference to the zamindari villages which occupy nearly one-fifth of the presidency or so, these figures will not help us. Moreover, if you compare these figures with two or three years' quinquennial figures of goats and sheep, we find no appreciable difference. Most of the village karnams write up these figures sitting at home 'last year we have said 20 sheep, let us say 22 or 25 this year'. Nobody takes the trouble of finding out the exact figures. The figures given for any village might if necessary be compared ; if any deputy collector or tahsildar takes the trouble of examining any village, he will find that the figures are absolutely wide of the mark. This is so far as cattle is concerned.

"We have got the wealth of the people described in the triennial reports. I understand that these reports are made from the income-tax returns. But it does not matter whether rich persons who are paying income-tax are poorer, information which we are more particularly anxious to know. We ought to know the wealth and poverty of the masses and not of the wealth of the income-tax payers. In order to know that, hitherto we used to have some information from the Registration department, because formerly, the Registration department was directed to prepare a census with reference to persons who mortgaged their lands or alienated them, etc. Somehow or other my recent information was that they wanted to drop that portion.

"Besides these things, I do not know whether the Government have got accurate information about the real state of things. I do not suppose that they have got any information about the real state of the masses. Of course, the Hon'ble Mr. Todhunter can find out the lawyers' income and the merchants' income but we want to know the income of the masses. So far as the collection of this information goes, there is absolutely no difficulty. The difficulty comes in only when rich persons come in and when you go and ask their incomes. When you go to the poor man you will see one cow, one goat, or one pair of cattle and a promissory note for Rs. 50 to a sowcar. What is the difficulty for the enumerator ? One of the observations of the Hon'ble Mr. Todhunter was that enumerators are generally schoolmasters and that they are not fit to find out the information required. But I do not think that the Hon'ble Mr. Littlehailes would endorse that opinion, for these schoolmasters who prayed for the increase of salaries, if they are so incapable of finding out this simple information, they do not deserve to be teachers of our future generation and it would be far better if such schoolmasters are sent out of the country. So I do not agree with the Hon'ble Mr. Todhunter that they are so worthless as to be incapable of finding out the information. After all it is a matter in which both the Government and the people are equally interested as well as the Government of India. Let us know the actual facts about the masses ; let alone the rich. We want to know the fact because we want to know whether the masses are going down or prospering.

"I do not press the resolution."

The resolution was by leave withdrawn.

16TH JULY 1920.] *(Mr. Siva Rao ; Mr. Madhava Raja ; Mr. Todhunter.)*

RESOLUTION *RE* TRAVELLING ALLOWANCE TO VILLAGE OFFICIALS.

With the permission of the Hon'ble the Vice-President the following resolution which stood in the name of the Hon'ble Mr. P. Siva Rao was not moved :—

'XXXIII. This Council recommends to His Excellency the Governor in Council that travelling allowance and batta may be granted to the village officials whenever they are required to attend taluk headquarters on official business whether during jamabandi or otherwise.'

RESOLUTION *RE* ORDER REGARDING TEMPORARY ALLOWANCE TO OFFICERS ON Rs. 100 AND LESS.

The Hon'ble Mr. P. SIVA RAO :—" The resolution I wish to move runs as follows :—

'XXXIV. This Council recommends to His Excellency the Governor in Council that the addition to salary sanctioned, by way of temporary relief, in the recent Government Order to all officers of Government drawing Rs 100 and less may be increassed.'

"Mr. President, this resolution relates to G.O. No. 499, Financial, dated 1st June 1920, and in paragraph 8 it is directed that all full-timed Government servants whose pay is debited against the general revenue is less than Rs. 20 excluding the war allowance shall receive an allowance of 50 per cent, that those whose pay is between Rs. 20 and Rs. 100 shall receive an allowance of Rs. 10 and that those whose pay is between Rs. 100 and Rs. 110 shall receive such allowance as will bring their emoluments to Rs. 110. This is exactly how it works out. In the case of those who used to get Rs. 20 and less the percentage is 50 per cent and with regard to those drawing a pay of between Rs. 20 and Rs. 100 the percentage varies between 50 and 10 per cent. I need not say, Sir, that this scale, temporary as it is, is totally inadequate when the prices have risen so high and the cost of living is very great. The cost of living, I may say has grown 200 or 300 per cent, and the allowance that is now paid is totally inadequate for the purpose. If there is any means of paying them, I think they must be paid better scale. I have got a number of papers in my hands, which carefully analyse and determine what the living wage of the present day is. The Salaries Committee have come to the conclusion that the minimum living wage is Rs. 35 in Madras and Rs. 30 in the mufassal. But an elaborate investigation of the matter has been made by the Non-gazetted Officers Association and the conclusion is arrived at that Rs. 68 or Rs. 70 at Madras and about Rs. 50 or more in the mufassal is the living wage. The Government are pleased to furnish a table of the scales that had been sanctioned in various other Provinces in answer to the interpellation of the Hon'ble Mr. Madhava Raja. The table is published as Appendix VII in the Agenda. The Bombay scale seems to be a liberal one, and I strongly recommend the adoption of that scale—75 per cent between Rs. 5 and Rs. 40, 70 per cent between Rs. 40 and Rs. 70 and so forth. I think that is the adequate scale, and I strongly recommend that that scale be adopted by the Government. The 10 per cent which has been sanctioned now in the case of officers drawing Rs. 100 and below seems to be totally insufficient. With these words, I commend this resolution for the acceptance of this Council."

The Hon'ble Mr. MADHAVA RAJA :—" I second the resolution moved by the Hon'ble Mr. P. Siva Rao. In other provinces officers drawing Rs. 100 and below get more percentage than is given by the Madras Government. The increase that is now given would hardly suffice to meet the increased expense caused by the rise in prices in all materials in these days. It is not unknown to Government. So I need not say anything more."

The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. TODHUNTER.—" Mr. President, I am very disappointed that I am not able to accept this resolution, as I had hoped to do. The position is that we have sent up a scheme to the Government of India and we have received their orders thereon. I am sorry to say that while they have sanctioned the scheme, they have made the finding of the necessary funds by reappropriation a condition of carrying it into effect. Honourable Members will realise from the statement that has been placed upon the table the extent to which money has been already reappropriated from every head in the budget to salaries. We are endeavouring to find the further money required to meet this further scheme, but I regret to say that I have not yet been able to suggest any items which can be reappropriated for the purpose; that is our existing position.

"In these circumstances, it is unnecessary for me to say much about the arguments which have been advanced in support of the resolution. I should, however, like to say a word on the question of the Bombay scale, compared with which ours appears to be a very ungenerous one. One reason why the Government of Madras are not able to be as generous as that of Bombay is the large number of the subordinate staff in Madras. Though the percentage we give is so much less than that given by the Government of Bombay, the total amount that we have provided is more than double what their scheme has cost them.

" In this connexion, it will be of interest to the Council to compare the budgets of Bombay and Madras for 1913–14 and 1920–21. Whereas the amount set down for expenditure has grown in Bombay between these years from 7·76 crores to 12·68 crores and they open the year 1921–22 with a balance of 389 lakhs, in Madras in the same period the growth has been only from 8·10 crores to 11·33 crores and our opening balance for 1921–22 is only 45 lakhs. These figures illustrate in a way the difficulties of the situation in this province.

" Added to the large number of our staff and the comparatively small amount which we have to spend, is the question already discussed today of the allotment to be made available to village officers and servants and as Honourable Members will have realized the amount paid to them constitutes a very considerable sum. "

The Hon'ble Mr. P. SIVA RAO.—" I do not see any object in pressing this resolution to a division. I merely want to appeal to the Finance Member to scrutinise the figures and see if he cannot possibly help these poor subordinates, as Bombay scale seems to be very equitable. As regards expenditure in Bombay, I am under the impression that the scale of expenditure at Madras is very low when compared to Bombay. I hope the Finance Member will find some way of assisting them. I cannot, for the present, think of cutting out this item or that. The whole budget has to be considered together and the Finance Member is the best person suited to see if we cannot make some provision for these overworked officers."

The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. TODHUNTER :—" Mr. President, I should like to say one word of explanation—with reference to the remark that our scale of expenditure is very low while the scale of expenditure in other provinces is high. That was the case so long as we had a very cheap subordinate establishment. So far as superior officers are concerned, the number in Madras is much smaller than elsewhere. Calculating on the basis of revenue, population and area, if we had the same cadre as the northern provinces, instead of 25 Collectors, we should have 40 Collectors and 8 Commissioners of Division. We have made up for the comparatively small superior staff by a very large and efficient subordinate staff, and our scale of expenditure was low so long as the pay of the subordinate establishment was on the scale that existed before the war. What has entirely upset the comparison as between us and the other provinces is the fact of the large increases necessary to the pay of the subordinate staff, which seems to be more numerous in Madras than anywhere else. If you compare the number of subordinates per superior officer in Madras and Bengal, for instance, you will find that we have six times as many as they have. It is this fact of the very large number of our subordinate establishment that lies at the root of all our present financial difficulties."

With the permission of the Hon'ble the Vice-President, the resolution was withdrawn.

RESOLUTION *RE* MODEL GARDENS FOR INDIGENOUS MEDICINAL PLANTS.

The Hon'ble Mr. P. SIVA RAO :—" Sir, the resolution that I have the honour to move is :—

'XXXV. This Council recommends to His Excellency the Governor in Council that model gardens may be opened for the growth of indigenous medicinal plants in this Presidency.'

" It needs no saying that there are several indigenous plants which have got medicinal virtue. What I seek by this resolution is the opening up of model gardens for indigenous medicinal plants. There is a precedent in the case of Government opening cinchona plantations. I only suggest that the Forest Department may pay more attention to the growth of the indigenous plants, so that we may be self-sufficient for our own purpose with regard to these medicinal vegetable drugs. I do not think the Hon'ble the Surgeon-General will have any objection to it."

The Hon'ble Mr. B. V. NARASIMHA AYYAR :—" I beg to second the resolution."

The Hon'ble the SURGEON-GENERAL :—" Mr. President, I understand the Honourable mover wishes to start gardens for the supply of indigenous medicines. I do not know what he has in mind. I could better explain the situation to him by a private conversation than by a speech in the Council. The facts which I will give you now will show that you could not imagine one garden for plants which are used either by the British Pharmacopœia or by the Ayurvedic and Unani Pharmacopœia. Take some of the common drugs used by everybody. Santonin for instance grows over 8,000 feet on the Himalayas, and quinine over 7,000 feet on The Nilgiris. Government has just taken up 10,000 acres in Burma to grow cinchona. I have got a whole list, similarly, showing that plants come from Burma, Afghanistan, Tibet, West Africa, South America, from the hills and plains in India, from the seashore and from dry land. How will it be possible therefore to grow these plants in one garden ? The fact is the 'garden of the world' is the place where the drugs which are used by the doctors of the world can be found. It would have saved the time of the Council if before bringing this resolution the Hon'ble Mr. Siva Rao had asked me about the matter. The plants which are commonly used by the

Ayurvedic physicians, etc., are available at cheap rates and in large quantities in the bazaars. There is not the slightest need to cultivate them. The various drugs are being cultivated in India. A Committee of the Medical Department, Simla, is dealing with this matter and whether the Government should take steps to cultivate these plants or whether it should be done by private enterprise ; I also have the matter in hand so far as the Madras Presidency is concerned. No private individuals have come forward to produce drugs on a commercial scale in the same way as the great chemists, such as Boroughs Welcome & Co. do. I am afraid therefore that I have to oppose this resolution, not because in any way I oppose the growing of medicinal plants in India. In fact the policy of the Government is, as far as possible, to support such enterprise, and during the war if there had been firms here capable of manufacturing drugs from the raw material in India, we would have been saved a great deal of anxiety and expenditure, because many of the drugs which are grown in India are sent to England or Germany or even to America to be made up into the form in which they can be used. I am afraid therefore I cannot accept to recommend that public money should be spent upon drug gardens."

The Hon'ble Mr. K. VENKATAPPAYYA PANTULU :—" Sir, I cannot understand what the Hon'ble the Surgeon-General means when he says it is not possible to grow a garden of indigenous medicinal plants in this country. The Honourable mover of the resolution only wants that we should have gardens in which plants that grow only in India could be grown, and not plants that do not grow in India, but in South America, North Africa or some other place. He does not refer to plants that cannot grow in the ordinary climate of this Presidency. In hilly places certain plants grow. There are hill tracts in this country, where model gardens may be opened for plants suited to tracts and certain plants grow in the plains and some gardens may be reared in the plains as well with plants that may easily grow there. He wants these plants all to be grown in places where they have a congenial soil. People are put to much trouble and expense in finding these plants. If the Government or municipalities or district or taluk boards undertake to do this, it will not be very difficult. He does not want exceptional plants which cannot grow in the locality to be grown in such gardens. He only wants such plants as are used for medicine particularly in the Unani and Ayurvedic systems and may be easily grown. I do not know whether these plants are recognized by the British Pharmacopœia or not. But plants which are commonly used in the Unani and Ayurvedic systems of medicine may be grown very easily provided the Government sympathetically views the question. It is not intended that the gardens should be worked on a commercial basis. The money which may be realized by the sale of the drugs may be used for the maintenance of the garden. The details cannot be worked out just now, but it is possible that Government may take up certain vacant lands somewhere near the vicinity of a town and there grow the plants. The medical books of the Indian system give certain names of medicinal plants and their description, but they are not easily found as the Ayurvedic and Unani systems are becoming out of date and as the Government also are not particularly favourable towards those systems. The plants that are commonly used by our physicians are becoming rare.'

The Hon'ble the SURGEON-GENERAL :—" We have put Dr. Koman to inquire into the Ayurvedic and Unani systems for the last two years, and he informs me that there is not the slightest difficulty in getting any amount of the ordinary and even extraordinary Ayurvedic and Unani medicines in the bazaar at very cheap rates. So the statement made by the Honourable Member is totally inaccurate."

The Hon'ble Mr. K. VENKATAPPAYYA PANTULU :—" The gardens are required not because the plants are not cheap, but they are required for the purpose of preserving the plants in one particular place, so that they may be easily available when people cannot find them in the vicinity. When diseases suddenly break out, if such gardens exist, people will know where to seek for the plants at once.

" It would be better if some live-plants are sold in the gardens. Some of the medicinal plants are more efficacious when they are green than when they are dry. So it would be really serviceable if such plants are grown in the model gardens and sold. It will not be very difficult for the Government to do this."

The Hon'ble Rai Bahadur T. N. SIVAGNANAM PILLAI :—" I am sorry this proposition cannot be supported on any grounds whatsoever. In the first place it involves an expenditure of money which even on a modest calculation is out of all proportion whatsoever. The mover wants certain medicinal plants to be cultivated and the question is whether these are available in the market or not. As the Surgeon-General pointed out there is not one useful plant which is not available in the market or any of the shops. Those which are not available in the market can be had for the mere walking of half a furlong or so outside the town.

" If this proposition is carried out, where are we to locate the gardens? Is it possible to grow all kinds of plants which human nature wants within the small compass of a garden? If it is to be done all over the Presidency who is to pay for it? These are questions which will appeal to any one. This is a proposition which ought not to have been brought forward before the Council and on which the time of the Council wasted."

The Hon'ble Mr. T. R. RAMACHANDRA AYYAR :—" I support the proposition. It is an absolutely practicable and modest one. The difficulties pointed out by the Hon'ble Mr. Sivagnanam Pillai are purely imaginary. What we require are model gardens. We do not wish

that there should be a garden for every village. The Government knows economy and know how much money would be available. If you have not got sufficient money, have a few gardens. There are some plants which are really rare and cannot be had. I am speaking from personal experience and many physicians complain that valuable medicines are becoming rare. Forests are far away from villages and towns are becoming over-crowded. As for plants we have some in the Senate House or in some bungalows but if you go to Georgetown you cannot find one single plant because men want to occpy all the places and there is no space for plants. When we are in this condition it is absolutely necessary that we should try and preserve the valuable medicinal plants which are becoming rare. Of course there are plants which can be had in plenty. Nobody asks that plants of that description should be grown. But there are others which have to be preserved and saved from extinction. That is the object of the Hon'ble Mr. Siva Rao.

"The Surgeon-General is neither opposed to the resolution nor in favour of it. The result is that he is against it. Dr. Koman has instituted certain inquiries. But his inquiries were of the most perfunctory and unsympathetic character, because I know from inquiries made at the places where he went such as the native dispensaries opened by Mr. Cunnan Chettiyar and others that when the doctors in charge wanted Dr. Koman to look into certain things and study certain medicines which have cured certain diseases, the latter said that it was not his duty and he had not been asked to do that."

The Hon'ble the VICE-PRESIDENT :—"Order, order. A general disquisition on Dr. Koman's methods of inquiry can hardly be considered relevant to the discussion on model gardens."

The Hon'ble Mr. T. R. RAMACHANDRA AYYAR :—"I referred to it simply because it was stated that Dr. Koman had exhaustively gone into the whole matter and said that every plant was available in the market. My submission is that the inquiry being limited in its character cannot be quoted as an authority. Otherwise I am not concerned with Dr. Koman in the least. Dr. Koman's opinion as regards these plants being available in plenty in the market is not entitled to any weight because he has not made any comprehensive inquiry. Physicians say that very many plants are not available in the market when they prescribe medicines. If the Government will just start one or two model gardens others will follow their example. That is all what the mover wants. The Government can very well take lead and show their sympathy. I think it is a very reasonable request and the amount required is very little indeed."

The Hon'ble Mr. P. SIVA RAO :—"It is very unfortunate that the temper of the Council is such that Honourable Members are in no mood to listen to anything however reasonable. One of the Honourable Members has gone to the extent of suggesting that I am wasting the precious time of the Council and he thinks that he was making a splendid use of the Council's time when he brought forward the resolution in a parochial matter as the Surgeon-General called it and tried to impose the unanimous decision of the Tuticorin municipality on the Members of this Council. I hope the Honourable Member will show indulgence to Members like myself.

"I only want model gardens to be started here and there just for the growth of rare indigenous plants. The Surgeon-General mentioned the difficulty, that it was not possible to grow all the plants in one place. I do not want all plants to be brought together in spite of climatic conditions but it should certainly be possible to grow such plants in a place as are congenial to that place just to demonstrate to the people how these plants can be grown on a commercial basis. It is not merely a medical question as an industrial question as well. I have no time to quote the authority of the Indian Industrial Commission's report where they point out that India is importing one crore rupees worth of drugs annually, and suggest that India should be made self-sufficient in these matters. I am sorry this has come at the fag end of the Council : otherwise I would have had a delightful passage at arms with the Surgeon-General. He said that nobody was willing to come forward to work these gardens on a commercial basis but if anybody was willing to come forward the Government would be ready to help him. He is still sticking on to the old policy. The Government should shoulder this question and must actively encourage it and the Forest Department should be asked to take up this matter as a commercial venture."

The Hon'ble the SURGEON-GENERAL :—"What has the question of commercial production got to do with model gardens ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. P. SIVA RAO :—"The Surgeon-General was telling us that nobody was willing to come forward to work these on a commercial basis. It is not so much a medical question, Sir, as it is an industrial question. I have no time to quote authority from the Industrial Commission's report where they considered all these matters. They pointed out that India was importing one crore rupees worth of drugs from elsewhere and that India should be made self-supporting. I am sorry I cannot take much of the Council's time because there are so many other resolutions which I have to move. Otherwise I would have crossed swords and exchanged passage at arms but this is not the time for it. But in the matter of drugs, India should be self-sufficient. He said that nobody is willing to come forward to work it out on a commercial basis but that if anybody is willing to come forward he will give the necessary help. He is

still sticking on to the old policy of indifference in industrial matters. The Government should actually encourage industries hereafter and the Forest Department should take it up themselves and work it out on a commercial basis."

The Hon'ble the SURGEON-GENERAL :—" What has the question of commercial production to do with the resolution ? "

The Hon'ble Mr. P. SIVA RAO :—" My remarks related to what the Hon'ble the Surgeon-General said. He was telling me that nobody comes forward to work this on a commercial basis. The Government have started model demonstration farms. If they start model gardens they should grow these plants in order to teach others how to grow these plants. Then the others will take it up. I should like to press the matter for a division."

The resolution was put to the vote and lost.

RESOLUTION *RE* MODIFICATION OF FOREST POLICY.

The Hon'ble Mr. P. Siva Rao did not move the following resolution of which he had given notice :—

" XXXVI. This Council recommends to His Excellency the Governor in Council that a special officer may be appointed to consider and report as to how far the present forest policy may be modified so as to promote the development of agriculture."

RESOLUTION *RE* CANCELLATION OF RULE 17-A OF THE RULES UNDER INCOME-TAX ACT, 1918.

The Hon'ble Mr. P. SIVA RAO moved the following resolution :—

" XXXVII. This Council recommends to His Excellency the Governor in Council that the rule No. 17-A passed under the Income-tax Act, 1918, requiring the production of a true translation of the accounts in English or in one of the vernaculars of the Presidency may be cancelled."

In doing so, he said :—" This resolution relates to a recent rule that has been passed under the Income-tax Act, 1918, requiring the production of true copies of accounts in one of the vernaculars of the Presidency or in English when the originals are not maintained in English or in any of the vernaculars of the Presidency. This imposes a special hardship on one class of people. It may impose hardship on other classes also. It is a hardship imposed upon the Marwadi and the Guzarati merchants who are doing business in the metropolis and in the mufassal because their accounts are usually maintained in the Marwadi language. If they are required to produce true copies of accounts either in one of the vernaculars of the Presidency, Tamil, Telugu, Kanarese or English, it will be a great hardship because each firm has to maintain a clerk on Rs. 40 or Rs. 50, a clerk who knows the Marwadi or the Guzarati language ; he must also know English or one of the vernaculars of the Presidency. Take the case of a town like Bellary. It is difficult to get men who are well versed in both the languages. The present system is very useful. It amply suffices for the purpose. Under the present system a Marwadi translator, is maintained by the Government in the Collector's office who will scrutinize accounts. The new rule will involve additional and unnecessary expense - there is the difficulty of getting some able man. There is also another point. Their accounts should not be exposed to anybody and everybody. There should be something like privacy in these matters. They will be open for inspection only to a Government nominee It effects saving.

" With these few words I commend the resolution for the acceptance of the Council."

The Hon'ble Mr. C. V. S. NARASIMHA RAJU :—" I second it."

The Hon'ble Mr. E. S. LLOYD :—" I do not think many words are necessary to explain the point. There are a few people, not many people, in the Presidency who keep accounts in languages which nobody knows. It is perfectly obvious that this causes inconvenience. I suppose the Council is aware that the practice in Madras has been to appoint Marwadi accountants for the examination of Marwadi accounts. It is very difficult to get them—we have four or five in the Presidency—but even when they are got to examine the accounts and take notes of them, the assessing officer must entirely be at the mercy of these men as he cannot examine the accounts, and must take the word of the accountants. That is an unsatisfactory state of affairs. The Government have therefore introduced a rule that when such accounts have to be produced for income-tax purposes they must be accompanied by a translation either in English or in any one of the vernaculars in the Presidency—Tamil, Telugu, Oriya, Malayalam or Kanarese. Of course, as the Hon'ble Mr. Siva Rao has said, this may cause some inconvenience to the Marwadis, but surely it is only a small inconvenience. If they choose to trade in what to them is a foreign country they ought to put up with laws and regulations which are imposed. The rule has been carefully examined by the Advocate-General who has advised that it is in order.

The Marwadis must either pay a translator to do the work or themselves employ clerks who know their language and the language of the Presidency. In Bellary, I think some of them do have clerks who know something of the languages of the Presidency. Possibly these are quite capable of producing a true translation but if not, all that the Government can say is that they must get some Marwadi accountants who are also translators. It is not after all a difficult matter to make a translation. I do not think in these circumstances Government are prepared to give way. The total number of Marwadis, I believe, is less than 400 in the whole Presidency of which about half are in Madras and at any rate in Madras there can be really very little trouble in getting some one to translate the accounts."

The Hon'ble the VICE-PRESIDENT:—" Does the Honourable Member press his resolution to a division?"

The Hon'ble Mr. P. SIVA RAO:—" No."

The resolution was by leave withdrawn.

With the permission of the Hon'ble the Vice-President, the Hon'ble Mr. P. SIVA RAO who had given notice of the following resolutions did not move them.

RESOLUTION *RE* ABOLITION OF THE BOARD OF REVENUE.

"XXXVIII. This Council recommends to His Excellency the Governor in Council that the Board of Revenue may be abolished."

RESOLUTION *RE* APPOINTMENT OF A LEGISLATIVE SECRETARY.

"XXXIX. This Council recommends to His Excellency the Governor in Council that a Secretary may be appointed solely for LEGISLATIVE work and that he may be recruited from the Bar."

RESOLUTION *RE* DEVELOPMENT OF PORTS AND COMMUNICATIONS.

"XL. This Council recommends to His Excellency the Governor in Council that a Committee may be appointed to consider and report on the best way of developing ports and communications in this Presidency."

RESOLUTION *RE* COMMISSION TO INQUIRE INTO CONDITIONS OF LABOUR

The Hon'ble Mr. P. SVIA RAO moved the following resolution:—

"XLI. This Council recommends to His Excellency the Governor in Council that a commission may be appointed to inquire into the conditions of labour, including the registration of unions, the true causes of unrest and to suggest, if possible, suitable remedies for the present state of things."

In doing so, he said:—" Mr. President, it appears that Government have already appointed a committee in the matter. I should like to know who the members of the committee are?"

The Hon'ble the VICE-PRESIDENT:—" Does the Honourable Member wish to move the resolution formally?"

The Hon'ble Mr. P. SIVA RAO:—" Yes."

The Hon'ble Mr. B. V. NARASIMHA AYYAR:—" I second it."

The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. TODHUNTER:—" Mr. President, the order of the Government on the subject has been laid on the Editors' table. But if Honourable Members wish me to read it, I will gladly do so."

The Hon'ble Mr. B. V. NARASIMHA AYYAR:—" I think a brief statement will be enough."

The Hon'ble Mr. C. G. TODHUNTER:—" It is rather difficult to give a précis. I will therefore read the Government Order."

The Honourable Member here read the following order—G.O. No. 1688, Revenue, dated 13th July 1920.

" The Government have considered with grave concern the reports which they have of late been constantly receiving of strikes and threatened strikes in the Madras City and other important industrial centres. They are aware that labour troubles are no speciality of the Madras Presidency, but are part of the general unrest which is the aftermath of the world war and is due to the new conditions which have to be everywhere faced, prominent among which is

the largely increased cost of the necessaries of life. They consider, however, that it is incumbent upon them to do what is possible to allay the present discontents. They have therefore decided to appoint a Committee to make a general inquiry into the conditions of labour in the City of Madras and other industrial centres in the Presidency, which will report upon the causes which have lately strained the relations between employers and employed and suggest what measures can be devised to secure more harmonious working between capital and labour in future.

"2. The Government desire the Committee to be representative so far as possible in the first instance of the principal associations of employers and employed, respectively. In both cases there is a difficulty in arranging for definite representation owing to the nature of the associations concerned. The following suggestions therefore are made without prejudice to any decision that may hereafter be taken as regards the recognition of such associations in future. In the case of the employers the Government have, in connexion with the question of the International Labour Conference, requested the Commissioner of Labour to invite the marginally-noted associations to take steps to set up in co-operation with one another some machinery whereby it will be possible to select representatives of employers when required. Such machinery is possibly not yet complete, but the Government hope that the Commissioner of Labour will be able to arrange with the associations in question and the Employers' Federation if formed to select three persons to represent the interests of employers generally on the Committee. He is requested to do so at an early date. In the case of the employees, it appears that there is an existing federation of unions in the Central Labour Board, and the Commissioner will therefore be requested to ask that body to select three persons to represent the employed. In the case of both employers and the employed one of the three members nominated should represent interests outside of the City of Madras.

Chamber of Commerce, Madras.
" Tuticorin.
" Cochin.
Gōdāvari Chamber of Commerce, Cocanada.
European " "
Southern India Chamber of Commerce, Madras.
South Indian Skin and Hide Merchants Association, Madras.
Madras Trades Association.
United Planters Association of South India, Bangalore.

"3. With the consent of the Hon'ble the Chief Justice, the Hon'ble Mr. Justice C. V. Kumaraswami Sastriyar has agreed to undertake the position of Chairman, and the Commissioner of Labour will be added to the committee ex-officio. The Government will consider the desirability of nominating further members to the Committee when it has received the nominations of representatives of employers and employed.

"4. As regards the manner of the inquiry, the Government will leave the Committee full discretion. Among other matters to be examined, they will naturally devote attention to the following:—

"(1) The history of the labour unrest in the Madras Presidency and the causes of the same.

"(2) The standard of living of the Madras labourer in the chief industrial centres in respect of wages, education, medical attendance, housing and other matters affecting the labourer's comfort and capacity for work.

"(3) The general condition of the labour unions in the Madras Presidency and their organization for purposes (*a*) of combined action in labour disputes and (*b*) of action for the welfare of the members.

"(4) The success or otherwise of the action taken hitherto in respect of conciliation in Madras and the prospect of achieving success by applying to Madras legislation which has been practically tested in other countries.

"(5) A definition of the public utility services in relation to which special action is necessary to prevent injury to the interests of the community as a whole, and recommendations as regards the action that is possible and desirable in Madras, whether by legislation or otherwise, regard being had to the action in this respect taken in other countries.

"5. The question of the hours of the labour, work by women and children and cognate matters are already being investigated by the Labour Commissioner with the assistance of the Advisory Board which was appointed in G.O. No. 1071, Revenue, dated the 10th May 1920, with a view to answering an urgent reference from the Government of India. It will be impossible, however, for the Committee now appointed to investigate fully the questions above referred to them without touching on these matters, and in so doing they will doubtless find the report of the Commissioner of material help.

"6. The Government recognize that they are entrusting to the Committee an inquiry of great magnitude and importance. It is at the same time one of considerable urgency. They hope that the Committee will be able to complete it and submit their report before the 1st November 1920."

The Hon'ble Mr. P. SIVA RAO:—"Mr. President, nothing more need be done. I withdraw the resolution."

With the permission of the Hon'ble the Vice-President the resolution was withdrawn.

RESOLUTION *RE* LEGISLATION TO PREVENT LABOUR STRIKES.

The following resolution stood in the name of the Hon'ble Mr. P. Siva Rao :—

" XLII. This Council recommends to His Excellency the Governor in Council that legislation may be undertaken to prevent the labour-strikes of workers in public utility companies, such as the railways, electric light, tramways, kerosene-oil and petrol companies."

The Hon'ble Mr. P. SIVA RAO :—" This resolution has now become unnecessary and I do not wish to move it."

With the permission of the Hon'ble the Vice-President the resolution was withdrawn.

The Council then adjourned *sine die*.

F. J. RICHARDS,
Acting Secretary to Govt., L. & M. (Legislative) Dept.

MADRAS: PRINTED AND PUBLISHED BY THE SUPERINTENDENT, GOVERNMENT PRESS.